|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Council Working Group on International Internet-related Public Policy IssuesFourteenth meeting - Geneva, 5-6 February 2020** |  |
|  |  |
|  | **Document CWG-Internet-14/10-E** |
| **5 February 2020** |
| **English only** |
| REPORT OF THE FOURTEENTH meeting of the COuncil working group on international Internet-relatedpublic policy issues (cwg-internet) |

1. **Introduction**

**1.1.** The fourteenth meeting of the CWG-Internet was held on 5 February 2020 under the Chairmanship of Mr. Majed Al-Mazyed.

**1.2** ITU Secretary-General Mr. Houlin Zhao welcomed participants to the meeting. He commended the successful outcome of the seventh open consultation on “*International Internet-Related Public Policy Issues on Harnessing New and Emerging Telecommunications/ICTs for Sustainable Development*” and the substantive inputs received, noting that the policy issues highlighted in the consultation, such as connectivity and access, are critical to advance sustainable development.

**1.3** The Chairman thanked the ITU Secretary-General for his presence and support for the meeting, and the Vice-Chair, Mr. Cesar Martinez, for chairing a productive physical open consultation meeting on 3 February 2020.

**2.** [**CWG-Internet-14/1**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0001/en)**: Agenda of the meeting**

The Chairman presented the Agenda (CWG-Internet-14/1(Rev.2)) and proposed a modification under Agenda Item 4 (Discussion of responses from the Open Consultation) to include Contributions 3 (CWG-Internet-14/3) and 7 (CWG-Internet-14/7) in order to structure the discussion more systematically. The revised version of the Agenda was adopted.

**3.** [**CWG-Internet 14/2(Rev.1)**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0002/en)**: Secretariat report on ITU Internet Activities: Resolutions 101, 102, 133, 180 and 206**

3.1 This report summarizes ITU’s activities related to Plenipotentiary Conference (PP) Resolution 101 (Rev. Dubai, 2018), “Internet Protocol-based networks”; Resolution 102 (Rev. Dubai, 2018), “ITU’s role with regard to international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet and the management of Internet resources, including domain names and addresses”; Resolution 133 (Rev. Dubai, 2018), “Roles of administrations of Member States in the management of Internationalized (multilingual) domain names”; Resolution 180 (Rev. Dubai, 2018), “Facilitating the transition from IPv4 to IPv6” and Resolution 206 (Dubai, 2018), “OTTs”.

**3.2 Discussions**

3.2.1 Several members appreciated that the ITU is carrying out many of its activities in collaboration with other relevant organizations. It was suggested that, where appropriate, all instances of collaboration by ITU groups should be highlighted in the Secretariat report. All ITU groups were encouraged to pursue opportunities for collaboration, as appropriate, if they are not already doing so.

3.2.2 One member noted the activities being carried out by ITU-T SG17 on fintech security and looked forward to the outcome of the work.

3.2.3 One member raised a question related to Section 2.16 and sought more information regarding the use of Digital Object architecture and the reference to UN agencies. This information will be reflected in the next report of the Secretariat.

3.2.4 Some members highlighted the importance of having best practices from developing countries be brought to CWG-Internet for the benefit of Member States.

3.2.5 The Chairman asked Secretariat to take the comments into consideration in preparation of future versions of the Report. The Group noted the Internet Activities Report.

**4. Discussion of responses from the Open Consultation**

4.1 **Summary of the online open consultation and physical open consultation meeting
(**[**CWG-Internet-14/8**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0008/en)**)**

4.1.1 The CWG examined the summary of the online open consultation and physical open consultation meeting held on 3 February 2020.

4.2 **Discussions**

4.2.1 The Group thanked all stakeholders for their active participation in the online and physical open consultation on “*International Internet-Related Public Policy Issues on Harnessing New and Emerging Telecommunications/ICTs for Sustainable Development*”, and Mr. Cesar Martinez for his able chairmanship of the open consultation.

4.2.2 Noting the substantive output from the open consultation, several members highlighted the importance of the policy issues discussed in the physical consultation meeting (set out in Section 4 of the Summary), and urged the members of the Group to consider these issues in future deliberations of the CWG-Internet.

4.2.3 The Chairman invited the Group to consider the output from the consultation while identifying future topics for open consultations and also to take advantage of the rich repository of inputs received from all stakeholders on this and previous consultations.

4.3 **Contributions from Member States related to the Open Consultation (**[**CWG-Internet-14/3**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0003/en) **and** [**CWG-Internet-14/7**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0007/en)**)**

The CWG also examined the various related contributions (in the order listed in the Agenda), which were noted by the Group. The summaries of the contributions (as submitted by the authors of the documents) and the corresponding discussions are provided below:

4.3.1[**CWG-Internet-14/3**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0003/en)**: Contribution by the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland: International Internet-related public policy issues on harnessing new and emerging telecommunications/ICTs for sustainable development**

**Summary**

The United Kingdom explained that their contribution had been sent to both the open consultation meeting and the Council Working Group in order to address the problem that stakeholders were not allowed to participate in the Council Working Group. The contribution said that new and emerging telecommunications/ICTs offer great opportunities to promote global development. However, there are significant barriers to realising the full potential of new and emerging telecommunications/ICTs for sustainable development. The contribution said that to overcome these barriers we need to 1) address the fundamental importance of affordable connectivity, 2) tackle sustainable development issues holistically and 3) harness local demand-driven applications of new and emerging telecommunications/ICTs.

**Discussion**

Some members suggested that if CWG-Internet were open to all stakeholders, it would not be necessary to submit the contribution to both meetings. Some other members noted that all stakeholders are already contributing to the work of the CWG-Internet through the open consultations, which constitute an integral component of the Group’s activities.

The Chair invited all the members of the Group to reflect on the output of the consultation and consider further how the CWG-Internet can contribute to advancing the issues highlighted during the course of the discussions.

4.3.2[**CWG-Internet-14/7**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0007/en)**): Contribution by the Czech Republic: Comments International internet-related public policy issues on harnessing new and emerging telecommunications/ICTs for sustainable development**

**Summary**

We believe that it is necessary to share good practice examples of these technologies, solutions and respective activities, and to create a favourable environment through non-regulatory tools. It is important to work with the challenges including privacy and data protection while balancing them with preventing (cyber)crime of various kinds. This is how the humans can benefit from new technologies, how the divides can be bridged. Mainly we should bear in mind necessary activities in education heading to safe use of new technologies and roll-out of modern companies, including SMEs/start-ups, in the up-to-date digital economy environment. It is why we emphasize also good practice sharing among countries, which may lead to harnessing the best in the whole ecosystem of modern ICTs.

**Discussion**

Some members stated that delegates could not attend the open consultation due to other ITU meetings taking place at the same time. The Secretariat was urged to make every effort to avoid such overlaps while scheduling ITU meetings. They also asked that the possibility of allocating more time to the open consultation be explored.

The Chairman suggest that a session could be organized during the WSIS Forum and/or IGF to further promote the open consultation topics so that more stakeholders can participate in the online and physical consultation process (which will continue to be held just prior to the CWG-Internet meeting).

Some members suggested that the physical open consultation should be held immediately prior to the meeting of the CWG-Internet to facilitate better interaction between Member States and other stakeholders.

The Secretariat was asked to take note of the suggestions while organizing future consultations.

**5. Introduction and Discussion of other Contributions from Member States**

The CWG examined the various contributions (in the order listed in the Agenda), which were noted by the Group. The summaries of the contributions (as submitted by the authors of the documents) and the corresponding discussions are provided below:

**5.1** [**CWG-Internet-14/5(Rev.1)**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0005/en)**: Contribution by the Russian Federation: International internet-related public policy issues on harnessing new and emerging telecommunications/ICTs for sustainable development**

**Summary**

Thanks to new and emerging technologies telecommunications/ICTs, progress has been made in the development of scientific knowledge, education, medicine, economics and other areas. At the same time, new and emerging technologies should not be considered only as a “technical invention”, since its use affects the social and economic development of human society and states.  Humanity faces significant new challenges. Modern technologies can be used to erode security and violate privacy. Given the scope of ITU's responsibility and the competence of specialists, it makes sense to consider sectoral legal challenges in this international organization both in the current regulation and recommendation for future governance.

We propose to organize a discussion of issues related to aspects of regulation at the international level in the field of development and use of new and emerging technologies telecommunications/ICTs driven by CWG-Internet:

1. to organize a wide discussion in the CWG-Internet with the participation of Member States and identify innovative key new and emerging technologies and potential challenges that they may arise, in order to develop international regulation of the fundamental aspects and features of such technologies, avoiding excessive detailing;
2. to develop proposals/recommendations to the ITU Council on the role of states in ensuring the regulation of such technologies at the international level;
3. to invite states to share legislative practices in the field of new and emerging technologies telecommunications/ICTs;
4. to discuss the need and feasibility studies on legal issues: liability, privacy, information security, etc. in relation to new and emerging technologies telecommunications/ICTs and develop proposals to the ITU Council;
5. to define the necessary and sufficient measures for the regulation of new and emerging technologies telecommunications/ICTs and develop by CWG-Internet roadmap of international cooperation for development such regulations and prepare proposals for the ITU Council.

**Discussion**

Some members stated that there was no consensus on the issues highlighted in the contribution, and that many of the proposals were far-reaching and beyond the scope of the CWG-Internet. Some other members highlighted the importance of sharing regulatory best practices, and saw some merit in the related proposal made in the contribution. The work of some other UN organizations was highlighted and it was suggested that these other organizations could also be invited to participate in future meetings of the CWG-Internet.

Some members stated that, just as other UN agencies are playing a role in emerging technologies, ITU also has a role as the specialized agency of the UN on telecommunications/ICTs. Some members stated that regulations can address challenges related to emerging technologies, and that discussions on related matters should continue to be closely followed in CWG-Internet. They stated that it is important to have international collaboration to ensure that any potential regulations are well coordinated at the international level.

The Chairman noted that all UN organizations are already invited to participate in the open consultation and 8 international organizations have submitted inputs to the recently-concluded consultation on “*International Internet-Related Public Policy Issues on Harnessing New and Emerging Telecommunications/ICTs for Sustainable Development”*. The Chairman also noted that there was general agreement on the importance of the proposal relating to sharing of regulatory practices by Member States. He noted the need for further discussions and urged Member States to continue discussions on the issues raised in the contribution, and bring contributions on related matters to the next meeting of the Group.

 **5.2** [**CWG-Internet-14/6**](https://www.itu.int/md/S20-RCLINTPOL14-C-0006/en)**: Contribution by the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia - Developing international public policy on access to the Internet for persons with disabilities and specific needs**

**Summary**

Following the open consultation on access to the Internet for Persons with Disabilities and specific needs, which was conducted by the CWG-internet in the past, the discussions and comments received from the previous CWG-internet meeting; Saudi Arabia to resubmit the modified draft Council resolution on international Internet related public policy on the issue of access to the Internet for persons with disabilities and specific needs, to be sent from the CWG-Internet to the ITU Council 2020 session for adoption as an outcome result of the successful and important open consultation.

“International Public Policy
Access to the Internet for Persons with Disabilities and specific needs

Recognizing the critical significance of the Internet for cultural, social and economic development of peoples, nations and regions, the following policy serves as a key element to ensure Internet access for people with disabilities and special needs and allowing them to improve their social and economic integration in communities:

1 All stakeholders should support and advocate for accessibility, compatibility and usability of Internet services for people with disabilities and special needs;

2 People with disabilities and special needs should be involved in the construction of mechanisms and policies that promote Internet accessibility, taking into account their needs, experience, opinions and perspective;

3 Content and online services must be accessible by people with disabilities and special needs, using the existing international guidelines and standards and accessibility features as captioning video sources to use and easy colours in the printed material;

4 The development of programs and applications that enable people with disabilities and special needs to use the Internet on an equal basis with others should be promoted;

5 Creating learning opportunities to teach people with disabilities to utilize ICT towards socio-economic development should be encouraged;

6 Mechanisms to protect and promote the rights of persons with disabilities have access to telecommunications services and ICT including Internet must be implemented;

7 All stakeholders are encouraged to develop Internet access aiding applications and products to increase the accessibility and usability for persons with disabilities and specific needs;

8 The private sector is encouraged to make plans for Internet data accessible and free skills training for people with disabilities and special needs, in order to increase their access and use of Internet;

9 All interested parties are encouraged to develop Internet access, help applications and products to increase access and use for people with disabilities and special needs;

10 All interested parties are encouraged to share best implemented practices in favor of accessibility of telecommunications/ICT for people with disabilities and special needs, in order to serve as references practices.”

**Discussion**

Some members appreciated that the contributor has consulted other Member States and incorporated feedback received in the proposed draft resolution set out in this contribution. Taking into account the importance of the topic, they suggested that the draft resolution set out in the Contribution be endorsed by the Group.

Some other members expressed concern with the title and some of the text of the aforementioned draft resolution, stating that the draft resolution should address only members of the Union. They also noted duplication with PP-18 Res. 175 and related activities, and encouraged streamlining of ITU resolutions. They did not believe it was appropriate for the Group to endorse the draft resolution.

**6 Actions**

ITU Secretariat will launch the next round of Open Consultations (February 2020 – September 2020), on the following topic agreed at the thirteenth meeting of the CWG-Internet:

***Expanding Internet Connectivity***

1. *What are the challenges and opportunities for expanding Internet connectivity, particularly to remote and under-served areas? What are the roles of governments and non-government actors in overcoming these challenges?*
2. *Are there particular challenges facing land-locked countries in securing affordable Internet access? What can be done to overcome these challenges?*
3. *How can small/community/non-profit operators help in promoting the increase of Internet connectivity?*

The summary of the seventh online consultation and the physical consultation on “*International Internet-Related Public Policy Issues on Harnessing New and Emerging Telecommunications/ICTs for Sustainable Development*” will be submitted as part of the Chairman’s report to Council.

**7 Closing of the Meeting**

7.1 The report of the fourteenth meeting of the CWG-Internet was approved by the CWG-Internet and was posted on the CWG-Internet website (<http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet>).

7.2 In closing, the Chairman thanked all the ITU Member States who made contributions and participated in the work of the Group (including those who participated remotely), the Vice-Chairmen, the ITU Elected Officials and the Secretariat, especially Ms. Sadhvi Saran, for their efficient assistance during the meeting.

7.3 The Group thanked the Chairman and Secretariat for their effective organization and management of the Group. The Group also thanked the remote moderator.

Mr. Majed Al-Mazyed **(Saudi Arabia), Chairman, CWG-Internet**