INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION

TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR

STUDY PERIOD 2017-2020

TSAG – R 7 – E

DECEMBER 2018

English only

Question(s):

TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION ADVISORY GROUP

REPORT 7

Source: Telecommunication Standardization Advisory Group

Title: Draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.25, Generic procedures for incorporating text between ITU-T and other organizations

Purpose: Admin

Contact TSB Tel: +41 22 730 5860
Fax: +41 22 730 5853
E-mail: tsbtsag@itu.int

Keywords: ITU-T A.25; incorporation of texts;

Abstract: Draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.25, Generic procedures for incorporating text between ITU-T and other organizations.

TSAG at its meeting 10-14 December 2018 DETERMINED draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.25 “Generic procedures for incorporating text between ITU-T and other organizations”. The DETERMINED text of this draft revised Recommendation is reproduced hereafter. The versions in other languages will be posted on the TSAG website as soon as they are available.

Draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.25

Generic procedures for incorporating text between ITU-T and other organizations

Summary

Recommendation ITU-T A.25 addresses the process of incorporating text (in whole or in part, ~~with or~~ [c1]without modification) of documents from another organization into an ITU-T Recommendation (or another ITU-T document). Similarly, guidance is provided for other organizations incorporating text (in whole or in part, ~~with or~~ without modification) from ITU-T Recommendations (or other ITU-T documents) in their documents.

History

Edition	Recommendation	Approval	Study Group	Unique ID*
1.0	ITU-T A.25	2016-02-05	TSAG	11.1002/1000/12573

Keywords

Copying text, incorporating text, qualification, references.

* To access the Recommendation, type the URL http://handle.itu.int/ in the address field of your web browser, followed by the Recommendation's unique ID. For example, http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/11830-en.

Table of Contents

Page

1 Scope 4

2 References 4

3 Definitions 4

3.1 Terms defined elsewhere 4

3.2 Terms defined in this Recommendation 4

4 Abbreviations and acronyms ..... 5~~4~~

5 Conventions 5

6 Generic procedures for incorporating text of other organizations in ITU-T documents 5

6.1 Process for incorporation 5

6.2 Permission arrangements ..... 7~~6~~

6.3 Copyright arrangements 7

7 Generic procedures for incorporating text of ITU-T documents in the documents of other organizations ..... 8~~7~~

7.1 Documents sent to other organizations ..... 8~~7~~

7.2 Permission arrangements ..... 8~~7~~

7.3 Copyright arrangements ..... 8~~7~~

Appendix I Format for documenting a study group or working party decision ..... 9~~8~~

Appendix II Workflow for incorporating text of another organization ..... 11~~10~~

Bibliography ..... 12~~11~~

Draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.25

Generic procedures for incorporating text between ITU-T and other organizations

1 Scope

This Recommendation provides generic procedures for incorporating (in whole or in part, ~~with or~~ without modification) the documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations (or other ITU-T documents), and provides guidance for other organizations on how to incorporate ITU-T Recommendations (or other ITU-T documents), in whole or in part, in their documents. ~~These procedures are applied each time a proposal for incorporation is made.~~[c2]

The case of normatively referencing the documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations is addressed in [ITU-T A.5].

2 References

The following ITU-T Recommendations and other references contain provisions which, through reference in this text, constitute provisions of this Recommendation. At the time of publication, the editions indicated were valid. All Recommendations and other references are subject to revision; users of this Recommendation are therefore encouraged to investigate the possibility of applying the most recent edition of the Recommendations and other references listed below. A list of the currently valid ITU-T Recommendations is regularly published. The reference to a document within this Recommendation does not give it, as a stand-alone document, the status of a Recommendation.

[ITU-T A.5] Recommendation ITU-T A.5 (2016), *Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations*.

3 Definitions

3.1 Terms defined elsewhere

This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:

3.1.1 approved document [ITU-T A.5]: An official output (such as a standard, a specification, an implementation agreement, etc.) which has been formally approved by an organization.

3.1.2 non-normative reference [ITU-T A.5]: The whole or parts of a document where the referenced document has been used as supplementary information in the preparation of the Recommendation or to assist the understanding or use of the Recommendation and to which conformance is not necessary.

3.1.3 normative reference [b-ITU-T A.1]: The whole or parts of a document where the referenced document~~Another document that~~ contains provisions which, through reference to it, constitute provisions to the referring document.[c3]

3.2 Terms defined in this Recommendation

This Recommendation defines the following term:

3.2.1 draft document: An output from an organization, which is still in draft form.

4 Abbreviations and acronyms

This Recommendation uses the following abbreviations and acronyms:

IPR Intellectual Property Rights[c4]

TSB Telecommunication Standardization Bureau

5 Conventions

None.

6 Generic procedures for incorporating text of other organizations in ITU-T documents

This clause addresses the process of incorporating text (in whole or in part) from another organization into an ITU-T document (see the diagram in Appendix II[c5]). This process is expected to be rarely used because ITU-T study groups are encouraged to rather make normative references ~~as~~process explained in [ITU-T A.5].

6.1 ~~Documents received from other organizations~~Process for incorporation

6.1.1 ~~6.2.1~~ An ITU-T study group or a member of the study group may identify the need to specifically incorporate text (in whole or in part, ~~with or~~ without modification) from a draft or approved document from another organization within a ~~specific~~ draft ITU-T Recommendation (or another draft ITU-T document). The need to incorporate text may also be identified by the organization itself.~~An ITU-T study group may incorporate text (in whole or in part, with or without modification) from a draft or approved document from another organization in a draft ITU-T Recommendation (or in another ITU-T document) as explained in clauses 6.1.3 and 6.3.1.~~ ITU-T study groups are strongly encouraged to incorporate approved text rather than draft text from other organizations~~, and, whenever possible, to incorporate text without modification~~[c6].

~~6.2 Process for incorporation~~

~~6.2.1 An ITU-T study group or a member of the study group may identify the need to specifically incorporate text (in whole or in part, with or without modification) from another organization within a specific draft ITU-T Recommendation (or another draft ITU-T document).~~

~~6.2.2 Documents submitted to the ITU-T study group by other organizations should conform to the following criteria:~~

~~a) should contain no confidential information (i.e., no distribution restriction);~~

~~b) should indicate the source within the organization (e.g., committee, subcommittee, etc.);~~

~~c) should differentiate between normative references and non-normative references.~~

~~6.2.3~~6.1.2 Information ~~to explain why incorporation would be beneficial~~[c7] ~~is~~ should be provided in a TD (or a contribution), as outlined in clauses 6.~~2~~1.~~3~~2.1 to 6.~~2~~1.~~3~~2.10 (see also Appendix I).

~~6.2.3.1~~6.1.2.1 Description of the referenced document (incl. full copy[c8]): A clear description of the document considered for incorporation (type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).

~~6.2.3.2~~6.1.2.2 Status of approval:~~.~~ Incorporating text that has not yet been approved by the organization can lead to confusion; thus, incorporating is usually limited to approved documents. If absolutely necessary, incorporation of text from a draft document can be made where cooperative work requiring cross-incorporation is being approved by ITU-T and another organization in approximately the same time-frame.

~~6.2.3.3~~6.1.2.3 Justification for the specific incorporation, including why it is inappropriate to reference the text in the draft ITU-T Recommendation (or other draft ITU-T document).

~~6.2.3.4~~6.1.2.4 ~~Current information, if any, about~~ If applicable, I~~i~~intellectual property rights (IPR) issues (patents, copyrights, trademarks):~~.~~ see clauses 6.2 and 6.3.

~~6.2.3.5~~6.1.2.5 Other information that might be useful in describing the "quality" of the document (e.g., whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).

~~6.2.3.6~~6.1.2.6 ~~The d~~Degree of stability or maturity of the document (e.g., length of time it has existed).

~~6.2.3.7~~6.1.2.7 Relationship with other existing or emerging documents.

~~6.2.3.8~~6.1.2.8 ~~When text from a document is to be incorporated in an ITU-T Recommendation (or other ITU-T document), an explicit reference to the document shall be provided; a~~List of normative references within the incorporated document: All ~~explicit~~ normative references within the incorporated document should ~~also~~ be listed (see also clause 6.2.2 c).

~~6.2.3.10~~6.1.2.9 Qualification of the organization (per Annex B of [ITU-T A.5]):~~.~~ This needs to be done only the first time a document from the organization is being considered for incorporation, and only if such qualification information has not been already documented. Qualification of an organization is reviewed on a regular basis (any study group willing to incorporate a document from the organization may perform the review). In particular, if the patent policy of that organization has changed, it is important to check that the new patent policy is consistent with the Common Patent Policy for ITU-T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC and the Guidelines for the Implementation of the Common Patent Policy for ITU-T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC.

NOTE – In case of a joint collaboration arrangement (of multiple organizations) that is not a legal entity (e.g., a partnership project), qualification (per Annex B of [ITU T A.5]) is required for each organization in the joint collaboration arrangement.[c9]

6.1.2.10 Document maintenance process: Approved Recommendations need to be reviewed and maintained over time. This may require collaborative effort with the other organization. Depending on new agreements reached[c10], new versions of the incorporated text can be produced by the ITU-T study group or by the other organization. Therefore, it is important to clarify if maintenance of the text is a shared responsibility between the ITU-T study group and the organization (see [b-ITU-T A.Supp5], in particular clause 10), or if the organization is responsible of producing new versions of the incorporated text.

~~6.1.2~~6.1.3 ~~These documents are not issued as contributions.~~ As soon as the~~y arrive~~ documents to be incorporated are received (see clause 6.2.2), they are made available, with the agreement of the study group chairman, and subject to the permission arrangements set out in clause 6.3 and to the copyright arrangements set out in clause 6.4, for advance consideration by the relevant group. Moreover, they are issued as a ~~document~~TD at a study group or working party meeting~~ to the relevant group~~, with a reference to the originating organization, normally at least one month before the start of the meeting at which the ITU-T Recommendation (or other ITU-T document) is planned for determination for TAP consultation, or consent for AAP last call (or agreement)~~i.e., as a TD at a study group or working party meeting, or as a document at a rapporteur meeting. In the latter case, the receipt and disposition of the document received should be recorded in the report of the rapporteur meeting~~.

~~6.2.4~~6.1.4 The study group (or working party) evaluates this information (see 6.1.2) and decides whether to make the incorporation. The format for documenting the study group or working party decision is given in ~~Annex A~~Appendix I~~ of [ITU-T A.5]~~.~~This decision occurs, at the latest, at the time the Recommendation is determined for consultation in case of the traditional approval process (TAP) or consented for last call in case of the alternative approval process (AAP). The~~

~~study group or working party report may simply note that the procedures of this Recommendation have been satisfied and provide a pointer to the document where the full details reside.~~

~~6.1.3~~6.1.5 When an ITU-T study group decides to incorporate text (in whole or in part, ~~with or~~ without modification) from another organization in its own document, it notifies the organization about the actions taken concerning this text. The use, acceptance or reproduction of such text by the ITU-T study group is subject to the permission arrangements set out in clause 6.~~3~~2 and to the copyright arrangements set out in clause 6.3~~4~~.

~~6.1.4~~6.1.6 The resulting ITU-T Recommendation (or ITU-T document) shall identify the incorporated text, and shall provide an explicit reference to the document of the organization and to its particular version~~, as described in clause 6.4 of [ITU-T A.5]~~. In case the text of another organization is incorporated in whole and without modification, the ITU-T Recommendation provides a bibliographic reference to the document followed by a note indicating that the referenced text is technically equivalent to the ITU-T Recommendation and that any IPR issue is a matter to be agreed upon between TSB and the particular organization ~~applicable to the text from the other organization~~ (see clause 6.~~1.2.4~~3)~~ also applies to the ITU-T Recommendation~~. In all other cases, a normative reference is provided as described in clause 6.4 of [ITU-T A.5].

~~6.3~~6.2 Permission arrangements

~~6.3.1~~6.2.1 At the earliest possible moment, upon the request of the study group or working party, the Telecommunication Standardization Bureau (TSB) will ensure that the organization (or designated contact point for a joint collaboration arrangement – see [ITU-T A.5], clause 7.3) has provided a written statement in which it agrees to:

- the distribution of the material for discussions within the appropriate groups, and
- its possible use (in whole or in part, with or without modification) in any resulting ITU-T Recommendations (or other ITU-T documents) that are published.

~~6.2.3.9~~6.2.2 TSB will also get from the organization ~~A~~a full copy of the existing document, preferably in electronic format (see clause 6.1.3). No reformatting is necessary. The objective is to have referenced documents available via the web at no cost, so that the study group (or working party) may proceed with its evaluation. Accordingly, if a document to be incorporated in whole or in part is available in this manner, it is sufficient to provide its exact location on the web. ~~On the other hand, if the document is not available in this manner, a full copy must be provided (preferably in electronic format).~~The document should conform to the following criteria:

a) should contain no confidential information~~ (i.e., no distribution restriction)~~;

b) should indicate the source within the organization (e.g., committee, subcommittee, etc.);

c) should differentiate between normative references and non-normative references.

~~6.3.2~~6.2.3 Should the organization decline to provide such statement or fail to do so, the incorporation shall not be made. In this case, the decision to incorporate the reference (according to [ITU-T A.5]) instead of the text shall be made by consensus.

~~6.4~~6.3 Copyright arrangements

The subject of modifications to texts and arrangements for royalty-free copyright licenses, including the right to sub-license, for texts accepted by ITU-T, is a matter to be agreed upon between TSB and the particular organization. However, the originating organization retains the copyright and change control for its texts, unless explicitly relinquished.

7 Generic procedures for incorporating text of ITU-T documents in the documents of other organizations

Organizations are strongly encouraged to reference approved ITU-T documents as appropriate to progress their work. This clause addresses the process of incorporating text (in whole or in part, with or without modification) from an ITU-T document in a document of another organization. This process is expected to be rarely used.

7.1 Documents sent to other organizations

7.1.1 An organization may incorporate text (in whole or in part, with or without modification) from a draft or approved ITU-T Recommendation (or of other documents produced by ITU-T), as all or part of the text of its draft document. Organizations are strongly encouraged to incorporate approved text rather than draft text from ITU-T and, whenever possible, to incorporate text without modification.

7.1.2 When an organization decides to accept ITU-T text, it notifies TSB about the actions taken concerning this text. The use, acceptance or reproduction of such text by the qualified organization is subject to the permission arrangements set out in clause 7.2 and to the copyright arrangements set out in clause 7.3.

7.2 Permission arrangements

7.2.1 At the earliest possible moment, the organization will ensure that the TSB has provided a written statement that it agrees to the distribution of the material for discussions within the appropriate groups and possible use (in whole or in part, with or without modification) in any documents of the organization.

7.2.2 Should the ITU decline to provide such statement or fail to do so, the incorporation shall not be made.

7.3 Copyright arrangements

The subject of modifications to texts and arrangements for royalty-free copyright licenses, including the right to sub-license, for texts accepted by qualified organizations and their publishers and others, is a matter to be agreed upon between TSB and the particular organization. However, the ITU retains the copyright and change control for its texts, unless explicitly relinquished.

Appendix I

Format for documenting a study group or working party decision

(This appendix does not form an integral part of this Recommendation.)

1 Description of the referenced document (incl. full copy[c11])

[Insert clear description of the document considered for incorporation, e.g., type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.]

NOTE – No reformatting is necessary. The objective is to have referenced documents available via the web at no cost, so that the study group (or working party) may proceed with its evaluation. Accordingly, if a document to be incorporated in whole or in part is available in this manner, it is sufficient to provide its exact location on the web. On the other hand, if the document is not available in this manner, a full copy must be provided (preferably in electronic format).

[Insert number of the TD containing the document or URL to the document on the website of the other organization]

2 Status of approval

NOTE – Incorporating text that has not yet been approved by the organization can lead to confusion; thus, incorporating is usually limited to approved documents. If absolutely necessary, incorporation of text from a draft document can be made where cooperative work requiring cross-incorporation is being approved by ITU-T and another organization in approximately the same time-frame.

[Choose status of approval from the drop-down list]

3 Justification for the specific incorporation

[Insert justification, including why it is inappropriate to reference the text in the draft ITU-T Recommendation or other draft ITU-T document]

4 Intellectual property rights (IPR) issues (patents, copyrights, trademarks)

[Insert current information, if any, about patents, copyrights, trademarks, etc.]

5 Other information

[Insert other information that might be useful in describing the "quality" of the document, e.g. whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available]

6 Stability or maturity of the document

[Insert degree of stability or maturity, e.g. length of time it has existed]

7 Relationship with other existing or emerging documents

[Insert relationship]

8 List of normative references within the incorporated document

NOTE - When text from a document is to be incorporated in an ITU T Recommendation, all normative references within the incorporated document should be listed. The document should differentiate between normative references and non-normative references.

[List all normative references]

9 Qualification of the organization (per Annex B of Rec. ITU-T A.5)

NOTE – This needs to be done only the first time a document from the organization is being considered for incorporation, and only if such qualification information has not been already documented. Qualification of an organization is reviewed on a regular basis (any study group willing to incorporate a document from the organization may perform the review). In particular, if the patent policy of that organization has changed, it is important to check that the new patent policy is consistent with the Common Patent Policy for ITU T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC and the Guidelines for the Implementation of the Common Patent Policy for ITU-T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC. In case of a joint collaboration arrangement (of multiple organizations) that is not a legal entity (e.g., a partnership project), qualification (per Annex B of [ITU T A.5]) is required for each organization in the joint collaboration arrangement.

[Insert number of the TD containing the A.5 qualification of the organization if it is not yet qualified]

10 Document maintenance process

NOTE – Approved Recommendations need to be reviewed and maintained over time. This may require collaborative effort with the other organization. Depending on new agreements reached, new versions of the incorporated text can be produced by the ITU-T study group or by the other organization. Therefore, it is important to clarify if maintenance of the text is a shared responsibility between the ITU-T study group and the organization (see [b-ITU-T A.Supp5], in particular clause 10), or if the organization is responsible of producing new versions of the incorporated text.

[Describe the maintenance process]

Appendix II

Workflow for incorporating text of another organization

(This appendix does not form an integral part of this Recommendation.)

Bibliography

[b-ITU-T A.1] Recommendation ITU-T A.1 (2012), *Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector (ITU-T).*

[b-ITU-T A.Supp5] ITU-T A-series Recommendations – Supplement 5 (2016), *Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations.*