|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION**TELECOMMUNICATIONSTANDARDIZATION SECTOR**STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | TSAG-TD015R1 |
| TSAG |
| Original: English |
| **Question(s):** | RG-WM | Geneva, 12-16 December 2022 |
| **TD** |
| **Source:** | Rapporteur, TSAG Rapporteur group on working methods |
| **Title:** | Draft Report of the meeting of RG-WM "Working methods" (Geneva, 12-16 December 2022) |
| **Contact:** | Olivier Dubuisson OrangeFrance | Tel: +33 6 74 95 46 37E-mail: olivier.dubuisson@orange.com |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Abstract:** | This TD provides the draft report for the RG-WM sessions (13, 14 and 15 December 2022 from 09h30-10h45) during the TSAG plenary meeting. |

**Action required**: TSAG/WP1 is invited to consider the following actions and to approve this report from RG-WM.

|  |
| --- |
| **Actions for WP1:*** agree revised Supplement 2 to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines on interoperability experiments" ([TD149](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0149/en)R1)
* agree revised Supplement 4 to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines for remote participation" ([TD155](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0155/en)R1)
* approve LS/o on the new edition of Supplement 4 to ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines for remote participation" [to all ITU-T groups, RAG and TDAG] ([TD157](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0157/en)R1)
* approve LS/o on updated guidelines for remote participation and appointment of representative [to the Inter-Sector Coordination Group (ISCG)] ([TD156](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0156/en)R1)
* change the title of the associate rapporteur on e-meetings to "Associate rapporteur on remote participation"
* appoint Mr Philip Rushton as TSAG representative (on remote participation) to the Inter-Sector Coordination Group (ISCG)
* appoint Ms Ena Dekanic, USA, as Editor of ITU-T A.7 in addition to Mr Olivier Dubuisson (current editor)
* request TSB to discuss further with ITU IS Department to make the Recommendation-series title also available in their set of Recommendation download pages
* authorize RG-WM to hold the following interim rapporteur virtual meetings (with a deadline for contributions 10 days earlier):
	+ 1 Feb 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.1)
	+ 14 Feb 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.7)
	+ 28 Feb 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session on Rec. ITU-T A.8 and draft new Supplement A.supplRA; discussion on the SG17 incubation mechanism)
	+ 30 Mar 2023, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time (governance and management of meetings with remote participation)
	+ 18 Apr 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.7)
	+ 27 Apr 2023, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time (governance and management of meetings with remote participation)
	+ 4 May 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.1)
 |

**TUESDAY, 13 DEC 2022**

**1 Opening and welcome**

The meeting was chaired by Mr Olivier Dubuisson, Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM, with the assistance of Mr Philip Rushton, Associate Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM on e-meetings, and Mr Stefano Polidori, TSB Counsellor.

The meeting opened on 13 December at 09h30. The Chair welcomed the participants and mentioned that, with regard to the agenda found in TD14R1, the documents between parentheses were not meant to be presented but the meeting would do so if requested. The Chair also clarified that the Associate Rapporteur, Mr Rushton, will handle issues related to electronic meetings.

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

| **#** | **Agenda item** | **Docs** | **Summary and proposal** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1.1 | TSB: TSAG interactive remote participation guidelines – Zoom | [TD54](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0054/en) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |
| 1.2 | Supplement 4 to the ITU-T A-series "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" | [A Suppl.4](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=12580) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |
| 1.3 | Chairman, TSAG: Proposed TSAG structure, organization and leadership for the 2022-2024 study period | [TD64](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0064/en) | To be **noted** by RG-WM. |

**2 Agenda**

The agenda of the RG-WM meeting was adopted as found in TD14R1with no changes.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Draft agenda | [TD14](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0014/en)R1 | RG-WM is invited to **adopt** this agenda. |

The following document was noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.2 | Chairman, TSAG: Document allocation and work plan | ([TD2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0002/en)) | To be **noted**. Documents relevant to RG‑WM are listed in this agenda. |

**3 WTSA-20 and PP-22 results**

The Chair mentioned that TD117R2 was prepared to help guide the meeting on many issues and his plan was to request the meeting to adopt it as a living list for future meetings and for future reference. This issue will be revisited during the last meeting of the RG-WM on Thursday.

The Chair also clarified that the agenda for this first TSAG meeting includes all issues that pertain to RG-WM but these won’t be mentioned in the future unless contributions to address them are submitted.

Regarding TSAG results related to SG17 incubation mechanism, which is one of the issues in TD117R2, it was mentioned that it may need to be discussed at this meeting based on TD903. The Chair proposed to discuss TD903 under agenda item 15.

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3.1 | Director, TSB: Action plan related to the Resolutions and Opinion of WTSA | ([TD24](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0024/en)) | The WTSA-20 Action Plan is a monitoring and reporting tool to keep track of the implementation of WTSA Resolutions and Opinion. This TD contains the new, initial WTSA-20 Action Plan, which was developed and that has been updated since March 2022.RG-WM is invited to take **note** of the WTSA-20 action plan. Action items assigned to RG-WM are listed in [TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en). |
| 3.2 | Chairman, TSAG: TSAG action plan for the 2022-2024 study period | ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en)) | RG-WM is invited to **utilize** this action plan. Action items assigned to RG-WM are listed in [TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en). |
| 3.3 | Director, TSB: Highlights of ITU Plenipotentiary Conference 2022 of interest to ITU-T | ([TD23](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0023/en)) | This TD summarizes the main highlights of PP-22 with an interest or an impact on ITU‑T.RG-WM is invited to **note** the document. Items relevant to RG-WM are listed in [TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en). |
| 3.4 | TSB: New actions for TSAG from PP-22 | ([TD68](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0068/en)) | RG-WM is invited to **take action** as appropriate. Actions assigned to RG-WM are listed in [TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en). |
| 3.5 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en)) | RG-WM is asked to **note** this TD. RG‑WM participants are invited to use this TD for possible contributions to future TSAG meetings. |

**4 Results of ad hoc group on governance and management of e-meetings (AHG-GME**)

Mr Rushton chaired this portion of the meeting that relates to electronic meetings.

The following documents, which are listed between parentheses were briefly presented orally by the Associate Rapporteur and were noted:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.1 | TSB Director: WTSA-20: Use of in-person and virtual options on an equal footing in the activities of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector | ([TD133](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0133/en)) | This document **informs** TSAG about proposed (but not adopted) draft new WTSA-20 Resolution [IAP- 3] on Use of in-person and virtual options on an equal footing in the activities of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector. |
| 4.2 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 2) | For **information**. |
| 4.3 | ITU-T SG15: LS/i on guidelines on e-meetings | ([TD104](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0104/en)) | SG15 has several guidelines that supplement the working methods of Rec. ITU-T A.1. These are attached for the consideration of TSAG. This TD has **already been handled** by AHG-GME. |
| 4.4 | Chairman, AHG-GME: Overall activity chair's report (Dec 2021 - Dec 2022) | [TD42](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0042/en) (Annex B) | This report describes the work of AHG-GME, identifies the output that was submitted to TSAG, and proposes that the output of the AHG-GME be **considered** by TSAG in the deliberations of its next steps for governance and management of e-meetings. Annex B has been assigned to RG-WM. |
| 4.5 | Chairman, AHG-GME: AHG-GME discussion output on "Conduct of meetings with remote participation" (Jan-Dec 2022) | [TD110](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0110/en) | This TD contains two versions of the output of AHG-GME: one marked-up version and one (slightly edited) clean version for consideration in future activity related to establishing the rules and governance of e-meetings within the ITU-T Sector.Proposal: That the text in Annex B be used as the **basis for further discussions** under the auspices of TSAG. |
| 4.6 | United States: Comments on AHG-GME output on conduct of meetings with remote participation | [C1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0001/en) | This contribution proposes a few clarifications to the output of AHG‑GME in [TD110](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0110/en). |
| 4.7 | Korea (Rep. of): Proposal for a way forward for future work with the result of AHG-GME | [C2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0002/en) | This contribution proposes to **revise A Suppl. 4** with the proposed text in [TD110](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0110/en), under the purview of existing rules such as Rec. ITU-T A.1 , WTSA Resolution 1 and PP Resolution 167. |
| 4.8 | Ericsson Canada, Ciena Canada, Canada: Comments on [TD110](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0110/en): Output Report on AHG-GME; TSAG input to Annex 1 of PP Resolution 167 | [C11](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0011/en) | In order to assist the Council in the determination of guidelines, it is proposed as a practical matter that the work of AHG-GME be continued to address the points in [C11](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0011/en) and perhaps other points in a **new Rapporteur Group** under Working Party 1 under the same leadership as the AHG. It is also proposed that the responses from the advisory groups be reviewed on an ongoing basis by the **Inter-Sector Coordination Group** to ensure that all matters identified for Council input are taken into account. |
| 4.9 | Editor, A Suppl. 4: Working document to support the discussion on a possible revision of Supplement 4 to ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" | [TD123R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0123/en) | RG-WM to **discuss** this attempt to retrofit [TD110](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0110/en) (taking account of [C2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0002/en) and [C11](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0011/en)) in [A Suppl.4](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=12580).(Associated entry in [ITU-T Work programme](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/workprog/wp_item.aspx?isn=10554)) |
| 4.10 | Inter-Sectoral Coordination Task Force (ISC-TF): Report of the ISC-TF | ([TD49](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0049/en)) | "*Remote participation*: the Zoom platform has been integrated with the ITU’s registration, authentication, and access control system (CRM), ensuring global access by means of the ITU User Account. […] Although TSB will continue to use two different platforms (Zoom and MyMeetings) due to the number of events in parallel for which the MyMeetings platform does not require multiple licenses. All ITU events can be accessed through the [Events Overview](https://www.itu.int/en/events/Pages/default.aspx) portal." For **information.** |

Regarding TD104, it was mentioned that SG15 submitted three guidelines, not just one on meetings with remote participation. For instance, one of these guidelines covers how to switch meetings planned as face to face (f2f) into fully virtual and vice versa. SG15 Chair believes that these three guidelines are very valuable for the work of RG‑WM. The meeting stressed again that PP Resolution 167, (Bucharest, 2022) should be kept in mind while discussing this matter.

One major issue related to electronic meetings is the meaning of “decision-making”. This is a key issue and deserves high attention. Just for example, it is not clear for some members if remote participants can provide interventions during the SG Plenaries as the remote participants should not participate in the decision-making process. This is an important matter to consider when discussing e-meetings. Moreover, this is also a matter that should be addressed holistically by ITU as a whole.

TD42 Annex B was briefly presented by the Associate Rapporteur. It provides some definitions discussed by the AHG-GME. With the understanding that definitions should be addressed holistically by the ITU as a whole, it was mentioned that issues specific to the T-Sector should be discussed by TSAG, but general matters (as terminology definitions) should be discussed holistically by the ITU as a whole and TSAG may contribute to the discussion that will probably take place during Council. It was also mentioned that examples from other UN organizations could be considered as their experience may provide valuable for the ITU.

TD110 was also noted by the meeting. It presents the current status on discussion in AHG-GME on the conduct of meetings with remote participation. It contains as Annexes two versions of the output: one marked-up version and one (slightly edited) clean version for consideration in future activity related to establishing the rules and governance of e-meetings within the ITU-T Sector. It is agreed that further discussion on this matter requires more time, therefore two interim meetings of RG-WM are planned.

C1 was presented by USA. It proposes to update TD110 with some enhanced text. The contribution was agreed and TD110 will be revised accordingly.

C2 was presented by Rep. of Korea. It proposes to update Supplement 4 with information coming from TD110. This matter will be considered under agenda item 4.9, there is a plan to establish an editing group at 08h15 on Wednesday to discuss revision of Supplement 4.

C11 was presented by Ericsson, Canada. Many of the points from this contribution were already discussed earlier. The AHG-GME (Governance and Management of E-meetings) has made excellent progress in fulfilling its terms of reference to identify an initial set of issues that will form the basis for future studies on detailing the governance and management of e-meetings in ITU-T. Some comments on TD110 are offered. TSAG should contribute to the Council as stipulated in Resolution 167 Annex 1 from PP-22. The contribution was agreed. It was mentioned that it would be useful to investigate how a better collaboration could be entertained with the ad hoc group on meetings with remote participation established by the Inter Sector Coordination group. The Associate Rapporteur, who is proposed to act as TSAG representative to the Inter Sector Coordination group (ISCG) for remote participation, agreed to discuss offline with the chair of that group for clarifications and report back to RG-WM at its last session on Thursday. It is important to note that the Inter Sector Coordination group is open for participation to all the ITU membership, not just to the various representatives, therefore TSAG participants are encouraged to attend the related meetings that take place virtually.

* **TSAG to approve Mr Philip Rushton as ISCG representative for remote participation**

TD123R1 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on the revision of Supplement 4. It is proposed to consider this document during a dedicated editing session.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an editing session on A-series Supplement 4 on Wednesday 14 December at 08h15-09h15.**

**5 Supplement 2 to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines on interoperability experiments"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 5.1 | Telecom Italia S.p.A., A1 Telekom Austria AG, Mandat International, Vodafone GmbH: Proposal to revise A.Suppl.2 | [C4](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0004/en) | This contribution proposes to **revise** the existing text of Supplement 2 to the A-series extending it to Proof-of-Concept events. |
| 5.2 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Working document to discuss a possible update of Supplement 2 to ITU‑T A-series Recommendations | [TD137](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0137/en) | This TD is a working document to support the **discussion** about Supplement 2 based on contribution C4. |

C4 was remotely presented by Giulio Maggiore from Telecom Italia, who is also the Chair of the FG on Test Bed Federation, established by SG11. Due to rapid development of new technologies which pop-up on the market, Proof-of-Concept (PoC) become a very useful and popular instrument for SDOs to determine the feasibility of the concept/technology/solution or to verify that it will function as intended and according to the features defined, in particular standards that are under development. In this regard, it is proposed to revise the A-series Supplement 2 to include PoC in addition to interoperability events. The contribution was supported by the meeting and various administrations expressed interest in contributing to an editing session to enhance the text of Supplement 2.

TD137 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on revision of Supplement 2. It is proposed to consider this document during an editing session on Supplement 2.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an editing session on A-series Supplement 2 on Tuesday 13 December at 13h30-14h30.**

The meeting was adjourned at 10h55.

**WEDNESDAY, 14 DEC 2022**

The meeting was opened by the Chairman at 9h30. A revised agenda was provided as [TD14](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0014/en)R2. Revision 2 of the agenda includes a few updates in agenda items from 10 to 19.

**6 Rec. ITU-T A.7 "Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 1) | WTSA20 WG3A invited TSAG to **continue study** A.7 related issues. |
| 6.2 | United States: Continuing study of revisions to Rec. ITU-T A.7 | [C7](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0007/en) | The United States propose:(1) To carry forward the two proposals from WTSA-20 to modify Rec. ITU-T A.7, namely [EUR/38A19/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0038!A19-L1!MSW-E) and [IAP/39A20/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0039!A20-L1!MSW-E) [*note: WTSA-20 also received two proposals for NOC from Arab States (*[*ARB/36A12-1/1*](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0036%21A12-R1%21MSW-E.docx)*) and RCC (*[*RCC/40A27/7*](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0040%21A27%21MSW-E.docx)*)*];(2) That RG-WM **appoints an Editor** to compile the two proposals into a single consolidated baseline text, which will serve as the starting point for further discussion;(3) That RG-WM continues consideration of Rec. ITU-T A.7 on the basis of this new TD, with the goal of developing agreed revisions for TSAG to submit to WTSA-24. |
| 6.3 | Editor, Rec. ITU-T A.7: Compilation to support the discussion on Recommendation ITU-T A.7 | [TD122](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0122/en)R1 | This TD attempts to address contribution C7 by providing a proposal for the consolidated revised text that compiles the two WTSA-20 proposals to modify Rec. ITU-T A.7. For **discussion** at interim rapporteur group meetings. |

C7 was presented by the USA. C7 follows up on WTSA-20 and proposes to appoint an editor to compile the various WTSA-20 proposals into one TD for further discussion.

* **Ms Ena Dekanic, USA, is appointed as Editor of ITU-T A.7 and Mr Dubuisson will act as co-Editor.**

The Editor compilation of the various proposals, found in TD122R1, was agreed to be the baseline for discussion at the two planned interim meetings of RG‑WM, dedicated to Rec. ITU-T A.7.

The Chair of WTSA-20 confirmed that the TSAG report to WTSA-20 did not contain any proposals on ITU-T A.7. Contributions are invited to the planned interim meetings of RG-WM dedicated to ITU-T A.7.

**7 Rec. ITU-T A.8 "Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendations"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 7.1 | ITU-T SG15: LS/i on concerns with deadline changes in Rec. ITU-T A.8 | [TD103](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0103/en) | SG15 requests TSAG to **clarify** the WTSA changes to Rec. ITU-T A.8. |
| 7.2 | TSB: Some issues identified concerning the AAP process after WTSA-20 changes | [TD111](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0111/en) | This document brings two issues identified in the Alternative Approval Process (AAP) after the modifications introduced by WTSA-20 in ITU-T A.5 and A.8. Possible ways forward are suggested to assist TSAG in determining possible **actions** on this topic, if any. |
| 7.3 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Working document to discuss possible changes to Rec. ITU-T A.8 | [TD138](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0138/en) | This TD is a working document to support the **discussion** about Rec. ITU-T A.8 based on the feedback found in TD103 and TD111. |

TD103 was presented by the SG15 Chairman. The document clarifies that the WTSA-20 modification to ITU-T A.8 may have introduced changes that were not intended, especially in regard to the requirement to provide the final documentation for approval at Study Groups meetings twelve days prior to the Director's Circular. Considering that the TSB Director's Circular is to be issued 3 weeks before the meeting, then this would imply that the final text for approval and related comments resolution information should be available 21+12=33 days prior to the SG meeting.

TD111, presented by Mr Campos (TSB) brings to TSAG's attention two issues identified in the Alternative Approval Process (AAP) after the modifications introduced by WTSA‑20 in ITU-T A.5 and ITU-T A.8. Possible ways forward to address the issues are suggested to assist TSAG in determining possible actions on this topic, if any.

TD138 is an attempt to address the comments found in TD103 and TD111 from the Rapporteur. The meeting agreed to take TD138 as a working document, which will be considered at future meetings. Additional contributions are also welcome.

**8 Electronic working methods**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 8.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 2) | For **information**. |
| 8.2 | ITU-T SG15: LS/i on ITU-T SG15 EWM Liaison Report | [TD105](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0105/en) | This is an **informational** liaison on the report of the SG15 EWM coordination team. |
| 8.3 | TSB: Feedback to ITU-T SG15 EWM Liaison Report ([TD105](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0105/en)) | [TD115](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0115/en) | Answers the feedback from SG15 in [TD105](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0105/en). |
| 8.4 | Director, TSB: Electronic working methods services and database applications report | [TD28](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0028/en) | This TD describes actions taken since the last TSAG Jan 2022 meeting to improve electronic working methods and tools for the membership. (In particular, clause 2.3.5 is related to the 3 following TDs.) TSAG is invited to **note** this document. |
| 8.5 | ITU-T SG16: LS/r on smart TV Operating System (reply to SG9-LS158) | [TD70](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0070/en) | ITU-T Q13/16 is still concerned about the titles adopted for the TVOS Recommendation series, where no information about its scope on cable set-top boxes and cable TV sets are included. […] SG16 draws the attention of RG-WM on assistance for **improving visibility in general of metadata** related to ITU-T Recs and to include it as a follow up item in its **action list**. For **action**. |
| 8.6 | ITU-T SG9: LS/r on smart TV Operating System (SG16-LS282) | [TD96](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0096/en) | In this reply liaison SG9 considers that no change is needed in the ITU-T Recommendation web pages layout. But if a change is done to follow up to SG16 comments, SG9 has no problems either. For **action**. |
| 8.7 | ITU-T SG16: LS/r on smart TV Operating System (SG9-LS8) | [TD107](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0107/en) | This reply LS aims to clarify the issues previously discussed on TVOS-related work items and the agreed compromise proposed by TSB, reiterating the need to either change the metadata presentation of Recommendations on the website, or amend the title of the TVOS Recommendations in the J-Series. For **action**. |
| 8.8 | RG-WM Rapporteur: Working document to support the discussion on the SG9 and SG16 issue with smart TV Operating System | [TD142](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0142/en) | This TD is a working document to support the discussion on the SG9 and SG16 issue with smart TV Operating System based on TD70, TD96 and TD107. For **discussion**. |
| 8.9 | Liaison officer to IEC/SMB/SG 12: Progress report for IEC/SMB/SG 12 "Digital Transformation and Systems Approach" | [TD119](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0119/en)R1 | This TD is an introduction to the work in IEC/SMB Strategic Group 12 "Digital Transformation and Systems Approach". For **information**. |

TD105 was presented by the SG15 Chairman. This is a report on electronic working methods from SG15 that covers the various electronic tools used in ITU-T and addresses a number of points that may be enhanced.

TSB has provided feedback to each of these points in TD115 which was presented by Jerome Belleman (TSB). The SG15 Chair will discuss offline with TSB on some of the points mentioned in the TSB report. The UK also expressed interest in discussing with SG15 Chair and the TSB especially on the sync tool issue that currently addresses documentation in DMS, while there are other repositories used by TSB that may need that facility.

TD28 was also presented by TSB. Two points were raised for further discussion with TSB:

1. In the development of web pages, it would be nice to learn what usability criteria is considered by TSB, as well as what testing is done by TSB to make sure the webpages fit ITU-T purposes.
2. The fact that Google helps more than the ITU search tool is still an issue to be addressed.

TD142 was prepared by the Rapporteur. It tries to address the issue identified by incoming liaison statements found in TD70, TD96 and TD107 from ITU-T SG9 and ITU-T SG16. The SG9 Chairman, remotely connected, expressed support to the resolution proposed in TD142 and thanked TSB for updating the webpage related to ITU-T Recommendations.

* **RG WM agreed to request TSB to discuss further with IS Department to make the Recommendation-series title also available in their set of Recommendation download pages.**

An example of rendering could be:

|  |
| --- |
| **J series: Cable networks and transmission of television, sound programme and other multimedia signals  J.1200-J.1209: Smart TV operating system****J.1204 : Smart television operating system - Security framework** |
|

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|

|  |
| --- |
| **Recommendation J.1204** |

 |

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  |

 |

|  |
| --- |
| **In force components** |
| **Number** | **Title** | **Status** |
| [**J.1204 (01/22)**](https://www.itu.int/rec/recommendation.asp?lang=en&parent=T-REC-J.1204-202201-I)  | Smart television operating system - Security framework   | In force |

 |

TD119R1 is an introduction to the work of IEC/SMB Strategic Group 12 "Digital Transformation and Systems Approach". The report was noted for information.

**9 Draft new Supplement A.SupplRA to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 9.1 | ITU-T A.supplRA editor: Proposed new Supplement to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities" | [TD154](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0154/en) | This is the first draft of A.SupplRA (as developed in 2012, with a few editorial updates from TD393 [2009-2012]). It is based on ISO/IEC JTC 1 Standing Document 16 which has been withdrawn in the meantime, but Annex H of the ISO/IEC Directives contains similar material. |
| 9.2 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 6) | "RGWM meeting on 12 Jan 2022 agreed to establish a new work item […] and aimed [**agreement**] in next TSAG meeting after WTSA" |

Contributions to take this work forward at the next TSAG meeting are invited.

**10 Review of suggested interim meetings**

This agenda item was postponed to Thursday 15 December.

The meeting was adjourned at 10h55.

**THURSDAY, 15 DEC 2022**

The meeting was opened by the Chairman at 9h30. A revised agenda was provided as [TD14](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0014/en)R2. Revision 2 of the agenda includes a few updates in agenda items from 10 to 19.

**11 Rec. ITU-T A.1 "Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector"**

TD150 provides a collection of inputs on ITU-T A.1 provided by the Rapporteur. The meeting did not discuss the documents related to ITU-T A.1 as they will be discussed at planned interim meetings.

The following documents were noted:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 11.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 1) | WTSA20 WG3A requested TSAG to **continue reviewing** this Recommendation. |
| 11.2 | Report of TSAG to WTSA-20, Part III: Draft revised recommendations of the ITU-T A-series | (WTSA20: [25](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-WTSA.20-C-0025)) (Appendix I) | **This document captures the status of discussion of the TSAG meeting, 10-17 Jan 2022, and contains the material that was agreed by TSAG to be sent to WTSA-20: Appendix I contains draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.1. The document does not include items where different views were expressed. Some material within square brackets [] indicate need for further deliberations. For further consideration.** |
| 11.3 | **African Common Proposals for the work of WTSA-20** | (WTSA20: [AFCP/35A30/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0035!A30-L1!MSW-E)) | **Proposed modification to Recommendation ITU-T A.1. For further consideration.** |
| 11.4 | Arab States Common Proposals for the work of WTSA-20 | (WTSA20:[ARB/36A10/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0036!A10-L1!MSW-E)) | Proposed retention of Recommendation ITU‑T A.1**. For further consideration.** |
| 11.5 | European Common Proposals for the work of WTSA-20 | (WTSA20:[EUR/38A17/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0038!A17-L1!MSW-E)) | Proposed modification of Recommendation ITU-T A.1**. For further consideration.** |
| 11.6 | RCC Common Proposals for the work of WTSA-20 | WTSA20:[RCC/40A19/1](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0040%21A19) | Proposed modification of Recommendation ITU-T A.1**. For further consideration.** |
| 11.7 | TSB: Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations | ([Author's](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en) guide) | To be **noted**.*Rapporteur’s note: TSAG might consider referencing Annex D of the Author's guide in ITU‑T A.1, clause 2.3.38.* |
| 11.8 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Compilation to support the discussion on Rec. ITU-T A.1 "Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector" | ([TD150](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0150)) | This TD is a consolidated revised text that compiles all WTSA-20 proposals to modify Rec. ITU-T A.1. For **discussion** at interim meetings. |

**12 Rec. ITU-T A.2 "Presentation of contributions to the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector"**

ITU-T A.2 discussion will be postponed to future TSAG meetings given the high workload of RG-WM. Contributions are welcome to progress ITU-T A.2.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 12.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 1) | WTSA20 WG3A requested TSAG to **continue reviewing** Recommendation ITU‑T A.2. |

**13 Rec. ITU-T A.23 "Collaboration with the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) and the International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC) on information technology"**

ITU-T A.23 discussion depends on TSAG Contributions.

The following documents were noted:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 13.1 | ITU-T liaison officer to ISO/IEC JTC 1: Report of the ISO/IEC JTC 1 Plenary (Virtual, 1 May 2022) | ([TD44](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0044)) | In particular, see Resolutions 3, 9. For **information**. |
| 13.2 | ITU-T liaison officer to ISO/IEC JTC 1: Report of the ISO/IEC JTC 1 Plenary (Tokyo, November 2022) | ([TD130](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0130)) | In particular, see Resolution 13. For **information**. |
| 13.3 | Director TSB: Modification to the Guidelines on application of the common patent policy | ([TD139](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0139)) | This document informs TSAG of changes incorporated in the Guidelines for the Implementation of the Common Patent policy for ITU-T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC. The changes have no impact on ITU (see clause 10 of Rec. ITU-T A.23, Annex A). For **information**. |

**14 Drafting ITU-T Recommendations**

The meeting noted the following documents. It was clarified that the updated ITU English style guide is not under the responsibility of TSAG RG-WM but that comments may be forwarded to the ITU Conference and Publication Department through TSB, if needed.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 14.1 | TSB: Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations | ([Author's](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en) guide) | To be **noted**. |
| 14.2 | ITU English style guide (Sep 2022) | ([Guide](https://www.itu.int/en/language-tools/Documents/styleguide.docx)) | The latest version of the ITU English Style Guide now includes sections on gender-inclusive language and language for persons with disabilities. These guidelines are for general language (i.e., do not cover technical language). To be **noted**. |

**15 Incubation mechanism**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 15.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | ([TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en), item 7) | "It was recommended for 1st TSAG meeting after WTSA-20 to consider this innovation of ITU-T working method and possibly to **establish a new work item** for A-series Recommendation."RG-WM to discuss the potential link with RG-IEM. |
| 15.2 | ITU-T SG17: LS on incubation mechanism in SG17 | [TD903](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-200921-TD-GEN-0903) [2017-2020] = [TD158](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0158/en) | SG17 is inviting TSAG to consider TP.inno as a normative procedure in the A series of Recommendations and is asking for **comments** from TSAG. |

TD158 is an old liaison statement from SG17 on incubation mechanism, which was republished from the previous TD903 (2017-2021). The SG17 Chairman mentioned that Q15/17 implemented the incubation process in the area of cybersecurity. So far it works well in SG17 and seems a good practice to adopt. The incubation mechanism discussion will be added to the terms of reference of the RG-WM Rapporteur Meeting to be held on 28 Feb 2023. Contributions are invited to progress this discussion. If a new Supplement or a normative text (e.g., a section in ITU-T A.1) is needed, then it would be appropriate to submit contributions to start the related work item(s) in TSAG RG‑WM, by providing the related A.1 or A.13 justification(s).

**16 Result of informal discussions and editing sessions, including documents proposed for agreement by TSAG**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 16.1 | Associate Rapporteur RG-WM, Updated AHG-GME discussion output on "Conduct of meetings with remote participation" (Jan-Dec 2022) | [TD159](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0159/en) | TD159 includes the changes to TD110 as suggested in C1 and C11. To be **noted** by TSAG. |
| 16.2 | Editor, A Suppl. 4: Output of editing session on revised Supplement 4 to ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" (14 Dec 2022, 08h15-09h15) | [TD155](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0155/en) | For **agreement** by WP1, and then by TSAG. |
| 16.3 | Changing the title of the TSAG RG-WM associate rapporteur on e-meetings to " TSAG RG-WM Associate rapporteur on remote participation". |  | For **approval** by WP1, and then by TSAG. |
| 16.4 | Nominating Mr. Phil Rushton as TSAG representative (on remote participation) to the Inter-Sector Coordination Group (ISCG) |  | For **approval** by WP1, and then by TSAG. |
| 16.5 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Output of editing session on revised Supplement 2 to ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines on interoperability experiments" (13 Dec 2022, 13h30-14h30) | [TD149](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0149/en) | For **agreement** by WP1, and then by TSAG. |

TD159 updates the output from the AHG-GME, earlier posted as TD110, based on contributions received at this TSAG meeting. No comments were provided by the RG-WM meeting that accepted the updated text as a basis of discussion at the dedicated interim meetings.

TD155 provides the output from the editing session on Supplement 4 " Guidelines for remote participation". The Rapporteur presented the document and his additional editing inserted after the editing session to align the terminology of remote meetings, as highlighted by some administrations. The meeting accepted the proposal from USA to move up the NOTE in the scope about rights for participation. The revised version of Supplement 4, which is put forward for agreement at WP1 and TSAG Plenary, is found in TD155R1.

RG-WM agreed to changing the title of the TSAG RG-WM associate rapporteur on e-meetings to "TSAG RG-WM Associate rapporteur on remote participation". It is brought forward for WP1 and TSAG Plenary approval.

RG-WM agreed to nominating Mr. Phil Rushton as TSAG representative (on remote participation) to the Inter-Sector Coordination Group (ISCG). It is brought forward for WP1 and TSAG Plenary approval.

TD149 was presented. USA proposed two changes in clauses 8.4/8.5 and 6.3 which were agreed by the meeting. The revised version of Supplement 2 is available in TD149R1, which is put forward for agreement at WP1 and TSAG Plenary.

**17 Outgoing liaison statements**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 17.1 | RG-WM Associate Rapporteur on e-meetings: oLS to all ITU-T groups, RAG and TDAG informing about the new edition of Supplement 4 to ITU‑T A-series Recommendations "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" | [TD157](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0157/en)R1 | For **approval** by WP1, and then by TSAG. |
| 17.2 | RG-WM Associate Rapporteur: oLS on remote participation to the Inter-Sector Coordination Group (ISCG) | [TD156](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0156/en)R1 | For **approval** by WP1, and then by TSAG. |

These two oLS were reviewed and agreed, and are brought forward to WP1 and TSAG plenary for approval.

**18 RG-WM living list**

TD117R2 is agreed as a living list and will be referred as such in future RG-WM meetings:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 18.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: TSAG, WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to working methods | [TD117R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0117/en) | RG-WM to discuss whether to **develop a living list** based on this TD. |

**19 Future meetings**

The list of interim meetings for RG-WM was agreed as follows:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Interim RG-WM meetings |  | * 1 Feb 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.1)
* 14 Feb 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.7)
* 28 Feb 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session on Rec. ITU-T A.8 and draft new Supplement A.supplRA; discussion on the SG17 incubation mechanism)
* 30 Mar 2023, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time (governance and management of meetings with remote participation)
* 18 Apr 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.7)
* 27 Apr 2023, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time (governance and management of meetings with remote participation)
* 4 May 2023, 13:00-15:00 Geneva time (editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.1)

*Contribution deadline: 10 days before.* |

The TSB Counsellor clarified that announcements will be done using the TSAG RG-WM email list which will be migrated after TSAG meeting into the new Study Period infrastructure. All existing subscriptions will be imported, so no action is needed if delegates are already subscribed to TSAG email lists.

**20 Closure of the meeting**

The meeting closed at 1035. The Rapporteur thanked the cooperation of all TSAG delegates, the Associate Rapporteur on remote meetings and the TSB Counsellor.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_