|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION  **TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**  STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | | | | TSAG-TD317 |
| TSAG |
| Original: English |
| **Question(s):** | | | RG-WM | | Geneva, 22-26 January 2024 |
| **TD** | | | | | |
| **Source:** | | | Rapporteur, TSAG Rapporteur group on working methods | | |
| **Title:** | | | Draft Report of the meeting of RG-WM "Working methods" (Geneva, 23, 24 and 25 January 2024) | | |
| **Contact:** | | Olivier Dubuisson  Orange France | | E-mail: [olivier.dubuisson@orange.com](mailto:olivier.dubuisson@orange.com) | |
| **Contact:** | | Mr Stefano Polidori TSB; Secretary RG-WM | | E-mail: [stefano.polidori@itu.int](mailto:stefano.polidori@itu.int) | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Abstract:** | This TD provides the draft report for the RG-WM sessions (23, 24 and 25 January 2024) during the TSAG plenary meeting. |

**Action required**: TSAG/WP1 is invited to consider the following actions and to approve this report from RG-WM.

|  |
| --- |
| **Actions for WP1:**   * **Action 1: RG-WM agreed to request TSAG to refer the issue on the possible use of the term "chair" in new or revised Recommendations to the next session of the ITU Council.** * **Action 2: RG-WM agreed to propose ITU-T A.8 (**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) for approval by the closing plenary.** * **Action 3: RG-WM agreed to request TSB to pre-publish ITU-T A.8 (as contained in**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) but to wait for the clarification of the Council before proceeding with the final publication.** * **Action 4: RG-WM agreed to request the deletion of ITU-T A.4 and A.6, and to determine new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" (for TAP consultation). *Note – The circular announcing the deletion will be issued 3 months prior to TSAG so that the deletion would come into force at the same time (see 9.8.2.1 of WTSA Resolution 1) when TSAG considers the approval of ITU-T A.24. TSB is requested to consider cross-referencing the related circulars.*** * **…**   **Information for WP1**  RG-WM agreed on the following ad hoc groups and editing sessions during this TSAG meeting:   * RG-WM agreed to organize an ad hoc group on ITU-T A.1-rev on Monday 22 Jan, 17:45-19:30, on Thursday 25 Jan, 08:00-09:15 and on Thursday 25 Jan at 13:15-14:20 (the result of this last session will be reported to the WP1 closing plenary); * RG-WM agreed to organize an ad hoc group on ITU-T A.7-rev and standards gap analysis on Wednesday 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30. |

**TUESDAY, 22 January 2024**

**1 Opening and welcome**

The meeting was chaired by Mr Olivier Dubuisson, Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM, with the assistance of Mr Philip Rushton, Associate Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM on e-meetings, and Mr Stefano Polidori, TSB Counsellor.

The meeting opened on 23 January at 14:30. The chair welcomed the participants and mentioned that, with regard to the agenda found in TD316R3, the documents between parentheses (…) were not meant to be presented but the meeting would do so if requested. Also, the chair mentioned that in some cases, detailed discussion will occur during ad hoc group sessions or future interim rapporteur group meetings. The chair also encouraged all delegates to give short intervention and respect a maximum time of two minutes when taking the floor.

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1.1 | TSB: TSAG interactive remote participation guidelines – Zoom Multilingual | ([[TD](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0054/en)387](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0387)) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |
| 1.2 | Supplement 4 to the ITU-T A-series "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" | ([A Suppl.4](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=15253)) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |

**2 Agenda**

The agenda of the RG-WM meeting was adopted as found in TD316R3 with no changes other than to discuss first the A.4 and A.6 deletion and then Supplement 5. This issue will be considered as we proceed.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Draft agenda | [TD316](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0316)R1 (this document) | RG-WM is invited to **adopt** this agenda. |

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.2 | Chairman, TSAG: Document allocation and work plan | ([TD304](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0304))  ([TD303](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0303)) | To be **noted**. Documents relevant to RG‑WM are listed in this agenda. |

**3 Progress report of interim rapporteur group meetings**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Progress report from interim TSAG RG-WM meetings | ([TD326](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0326)) | RG-WM is invited to **note** this report (including the RGM reports that it references) which has been approved by the WP1 opening plenary.  *Each result will be addressed under the corresponding item of this agenda.* |

The Chair reminded that TD326 is the progress report of RG-WM to TSAG and details the advancement of the work pertaining to RG-WM since the latest plenary meeting of TSAG (30 May - 2 June 2023).

RG-WM was very proactive and held six interim rapporteur group meetings (RGM) as reported below. The report of each meeting is also linked in the progress report.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **RG-WM e-meeting** | **Terms of reference** | **Meeting report** |
| 27 June 2023 | Progress on draft Rec. ITU-T A.1-rev | [DOC4 (230627)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230627/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230627-DOC-0004.docx) |
| 4 July 2023 | Progress on draft Rec. ITU-T A.7-rev ([TD217R2](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0217)) | [DOC3-R1 (230704)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230704/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230704-DOC-0003-R01.docx) |
| 12 Sep 2023 | - Progress on draft new Supplement A.supplRA ([TD251R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0251/en))  - Possible way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6 ([TD275R3](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0275/en)) | [DOC6 (230912)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230912/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230912-DOC-0006.docx) |
| 24 Oct 2023 | Progress on draft Rec. ITU-T A.1-rev | [DOC3-R1 (231024)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-231024/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-231024-DOC-0003-R01.docx) |
| 21 Nov 2023 | - Discuss pending issues in draft revised Rec. ITU-T A.7  - Discuss pending issues in draft revised Rec. ITU-T A.1 | [DOC4 (231121)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-231121/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-231121-DOC-0004.docx) |
| 5 Dec 2023 | - Progress on draft new Supplement A.supRA  - Revision of Supplement 5 (as a possible way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6)  - Discuss pending issues in draft revised Rec. ITU-T A.1 | [DOC6 (231205)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-231205/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-231205-DOC-0006.docx) |

The RG-WM noted the progress report (including the RGM reports that it references) which has been approved by the WP1 opening plenary. Each result will be addressed under the corresponding item of this agenda.

**4** [**Rec. ITU-T A.8**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.8) **"Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendations"**

The following document reproduces the determined text of revised ITU-T A.8 and was noted by the meeting.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.1 | Report of the second meeting of TSAG (Geneva, 30 May - 2 June 2023) - Determined revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.8 "Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendations" | ([TSAG-R3](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-R-0003)) ([TSB Circular 111](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSB-CIR-0111/en)) | TSAG at its plenary on 2 June 2023 DETERMINED draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.8.  For **approval** at the TSAG plenary. |

The Rapporteur presented [TD444R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0444/en) which states that eleven Member States (Canada, China, France, Korea (Rep. of), Myanmar, Netherlands (Kingdom of the), Norway, Portugal, Russian Federation, United Kingdom and United States) responded to TSB Circular 111, agreeing to authorize TSAG to proceed with the approval of this ITU-T text; one Member State (Russian Federation) among the 11 Member States provided comments, which are given in the attachment to TD444R1.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.2 | TSB: Results of consultation with Member States - TSB Circular 111 | [TD444R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0444/en) | This TD provides the results of the TAP consultation with Member States concerning TSB Circular 111.  Pursuant to 9.4.5 of WTSA Resolution 1, TSAG may proceed with consideration of **approval** of the text in question. |

TD450 provides an attempt from the Rapporteur to address the Russian comments on revised ITU-T A.8.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.3 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: (for approval) Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.8 "Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendation" | [TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) | Taking the determined text of Rec. ITU‑T A.8 ([TSAG-R3](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-R-0003/en)) as a base document, this TD is an attempt to address the comments received from the Russian Federation during the TAP consultation ([TD444](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0444/en)).  For **approval** by the closing plenary. |

The comments from Russia are straightforward but the opening plenary of TSAG considered that more discussion is needed on Russia’s comments on clause 6.3. The Rapporteur informed that implementing the comments in clause 6.3 would not allow TSB to correct editorial mistakes (including overall consistency) on the part of a (revised) Recommendation which was not modified.

It was considered that the quality of the document could be at stake if we add this comment.

Russia stressed that the change of the word chairman vs chair is not acceptable for them and this provides a rationale for them to insert this text so TSB can’t modify texts accordingly.

Before considering TD450 forward, it was agreed to entertain an informal consultation during the coffee break following this meeting to try resolving the issue in clause 6.3.

The informal consultation concluded that: There was disagreement on whether the term "chair" can be used (instead of "chairman") in (new or revised) Recommendations. It was agreed that TSAG will refer this issue to the next Council meeting. It was further agreed that TSB will pre-publish ITU-T A.8 as contained in [TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) but that the final publication is pending this clarification.

NOTE – [TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) uses the term "chairman".

* **Action 1: RG-WM agreed to request TSAG to refer the issue on the possible use of the term "chair" in new or revised Recommendations to the next session of the ITU Council.**
* **Action 2: RG-WM agreed to propose ITU-T A.8 (**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) for approval by the closing plenary.**
* **Action 3: RG-WM agreed to request TSB to pre-publish ITU-T A.8 (as contained in**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) but to wait for the clarification of the Council before proceeding with the final publication.**

**5** [**Supplement 5 to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations**](https://www.itu.int/itu-t/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=13023) **"Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 5.1 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Proposed revision to Supplement 5 to the ITU‑T A-series on "Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | ([TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en)) | In support to the proposed deletion of Recommendations ITU-T A.5 and A.6, the rapporteur group meeting on 5 Dec 2023 agreed that these small changes to Supplement 5 (2016) would help to clarify the communication process that may be established between an ITU-T study group and another organization. |
| 5.2 | Korea: Proposed revision for A Supplement 5 | ([C67](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0067/en)) | These contributions suggest updating the definitions in clause 3 to align with the current version of referenced documents.  *Note: The suggested (editorial) modifications have been included in* [[*TD448*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0448/en)](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393)*.* |
| 5.3 | China Telecom, MIIT (China): Proposal for updated definitions in clause 3.1 of A Suppl.5 for consistency with published Recommendations and WTSA Resolutions | ([C72](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0072/en)) |
| 5.4 | Canada: Support to recommendations made in the RG-WM progress report regarding Recommendations ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 | ([C74](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0074/en)) | Canada supports the recommendations in item 2 of the progress report ([TD326](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0326/en)) and actions put forward to TSAG, namely: the revision of Supplement 5 to the ITU-T A‑series Recommendations ([TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en)).  *Note: This contribution will be introduced under agenda item 6.2.* |
| 5.5 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: (For agreement) Proposed revision to Supplement 5 to the ITU-T A-series on "Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | [[TD448](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0448/en)](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393) | This text updates [TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en) with the editorial modifications suggested in [C67](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0067/en) and [C72](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0072/en).  For agreement. |

TD448 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on this issue. This text updates [TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en) with the editorial modifications suggested in [C67](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0067/en) and [C72](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0072/en). TD448 was taken as base for discussion, and it was agreed to discuss the deletion of ITU-T A.4 and A.6 first, and then to come back on the revised Supplement 5.

The result of the discussion on ITU-T A.4 and A.6 deletion (see next agenda item 6) is to upgrade revised Supplement 5 into an ITU-T Recommendation. A new TD was issued with the required formatting of the text ([TD470](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470/en)). It will be reviewed at future sessions of RG-WM.

Saudi Arabia, UK, Cameroon and Canada supported the creation of a new work item to upgrade revised Supplement 5 to A-series Recommendation. An A.1 justification was provided as found in ([TD471](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0471/en)) and will also be reviewed at future sessions of RG-WM.

**6 Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6.1 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Justification to propose the deletion of Recommendations ITU-T A.4 and A.6 | [TD394R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0394) | This TD provides the explanatory summary about the reasons for the deletion of Recs ITU-T A.4 and ITU-T A.6.  For **agreement**. |
| 6.2 | Canada: Support to recommendations made in the RG-WM progress report regarding ITU‑T Recommendations ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 | [C74](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0074/en) | Canada supports the recommendations in item 2 of the progress report ([TD326](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0326/en)) and actions put forward to TSAG, namely:   * The deletion of Recommendations ITU‑T A.4 and ITU-T A.6; * The revision of A Suppl.5 as found in [TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en). |
| 6.3 | Cameroon: Contribution to maintain Recommendations ITU-T A.4 and A.6 | [C82](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0082) | This contribution addresses the limitations of TD394, including the consequence of deleting Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6 which will be made non-binding by means of a Supplement. The contribution proposes to maintain the above recommendations and to abandon the idea of amending A Suppl.5 which is a non-normative document. |

The Rapporteur presented TD394R1, which clarifies the reasons why ITU-T A.4 and A.6 are proposed for deletion at this meeting. The Rapporteur focused on the table within TD394R1, which clarifies the mapping of each item covered by the relevant involved A-series Recommendations and Supplements.

Contribution C82 from Cameroon suggests retaining ITU-T A.4 and A.6 because in their opinion the concept of formal communication process should not be in a Supplement but rather in a normative ITU-T Recommendation. In order to address this concern, it was proposed to upgrade Supplement 5 to an A-series Recommendation.

C74 supports the deletion of Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6. Canada noted that upgrading Supplement 5 to an A-series Recommendation was acceptable.

After discussion, it was agreed to upgrade Supplement 5 to an A-series Recommendation (e.g. A.24) to address the concerns of Cameroon with the deletion of Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6.

With the above agreement, ITU-T A.4 and A.6 are put forward for deletion at the closing Plenary.

* **Action 4: RG-WM agreed to request the deletion of ITU-T A.4 and A.6, and to determine new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" (for TAP consultation).  
  *Note – The circular announcing the deletion will be issued 3 months prior to TSAG so that the deletion would come into force at the same time (see 9.8.2.1 of WTSA Resolution 1) when TSAG considers the approval of ITU-T A.24. TSB is requested to consider cross-referencing the related circulars.***

**7 Review of suggested ad hoc groups, editing sessions and interim meetings**

The Rapporteur reminded that three ad hoc groups were planned for this TSAG meeting as follows:

* RG-WM ad hoc group on ITU-T A.1-rev on Monday 22 Jan, 17:45-19:30;
* RG-WM ad hoc group on ITU-T A.7-rev on Wednesday 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30;
* RG-WM ad hoc group on draft A.SupplRA/A.RA on Thursday 25 Jan at 13:15-14:20;

It was agreed to modify the third ad hoc group on 25 Jan to discuss ITU-T A.1.

The meeting was adjourned at 15:50.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_