|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION  **TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**  STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | | | | TSAG-TD317R2 |
| TSAG |
| Original: English |
| **Question(s):** | | | RG-WM | | Geneva, 22-26 January 2024 |
| **TD** | | | | | |
| **Source:** | | | Rapporteur, TSAG Rapporteur group on working methods | | |
| **Title:** | | | Draft Report of the meeting of RG-WM "Working methods" (Geneva, 23, 24 and 25 January 2024) | | |
| **Contact:** | | Olivier Dubuisson Orange France | | E-mail: [olivier.dubuisson@orange.com](mailto:olivier.dubuisson@orange.com) | |
| **Contact:** | | Mr Stefano Polidori TSB; Secretary RG-WM | | E-mail: [stefano.polidori@itu.int](mailto:stefano.polidori@itu.int) | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Abstract:** | This TD provides the draft report for the RG-WM sessions (23, 24 and 25 January 2024) during the TSAG plenary meeting. |

**Action required**: TSAG/WP1 is invited to consider the following actions and to approve this report from RG-WM.

|  |
| --- |
| **Actions for WP1:**   * **Action 1: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to:** * **advise the TSB Director to seek clarification from the next session of the ITU Council on the use of the term "chair", instead of "chairman", in new or revised Recommendations.** * **approve ITU-T A.8 ([TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)).** * **request TSB to pre-publish ITU-T A.8 (as contained in**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) but to wait for the clarification of the Council before proceeding with the final publication.** *Note –* [*TD450*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) *uses the term "chairman".* * **Action 2: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to determine (for TAP consultation) draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.7 "Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures" (**[**TD453R1**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0453)**).** * **Action 3: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to:**   + **initiate the process for the deletion of ITU-T A.4 and A.6;** *Note 1 – The circular announcing the deletion will include the justifications found in* [*TD394R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0394) *and will be issued 3 months prior to TSAG so that the deletion would come into force at the same time (see 9.8.2.1 of WTSA Resolution 1) when TSAG considers the approval of ITU-T A.24. TSB is requested to consider cross-referencing the related circulars.*   + **determine (for TAP consultation) new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" (**[**TD470R1**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470)**).** *Note 2 – Consequently, TSAG will delete A Suppl.5 at its next meeting in July if new Rec. ITU‑T A.24 is approved.* * **Action 4: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to:** * **determine ITU-T A.1-rev (**[**TD456R3**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456)**);** * **determine A.JCA at this TSAG meeting (**[**TD467R1**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0467)**);** * **continue refining new Appendices II and III (**[**TD478**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0478)**) until the next TSAG meeting in July 2024 where these Appendices would be agreed and integrated in the final publication of ITU-T A.1‑rev.** *NOTE – The principles of ITU-T A.13 shall be applied to "appendices to Recommendations agreed separately from the base text of the Recommendation" (clause 6).* * **Action 5: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to send the liaison statement to all SGs on guidelines for the preparation of contributions and the role of SG Mentors (**[**TD477**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0477)**).** * **Action 6: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to change the status of draft Supplement A.SupplRA to draft ITU-T Recommendation A.RA "Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities".** * **Action 7: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to establish the following new work items:** * **draft Recommendation ITU-T A.JCA "Joint coordination activities: Establishment and working procedures" (**[**TD468**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0468)**);** * **draft Supplement A.SupplSGA to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines for the development of a standards gap analysis" (**[**TD454R3**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0454/en)**).** * **Action 8: RG-WM suggests to also assign WTSA Resolutions 40 and 80 to RG-WM in addition to those listed in** [**TD463**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0463)**, and to update the** [**RG-WM ToR**](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/tsag/2022-2024/Pages/Rapporteur-Groups.aspx) **accordingly;** * **Action 9: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to approve the interim meetings plan found in clause 22.1 of this report;** * **Action 10: RG-WM agreed to invite TSAG to approve the updates to the RG-WM work programme found in** [TSAG-TD397-R1](http://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0397). |

**TUESDAY, 23 January 2024**

**1 Opening and welcome**

The meeting was chaired by Mr Olivier Dubuisson, Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM, with the assistance of Mr Philip Rushton, Associate Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM on e-meetings, and Mr Stefano Polidori, TSB Counsellor.

The meeting opened on 23 January at 14:30. The Rapporteur welcomed the participants and mentioned that, with regard to the agenda found in TD316R3, the documents between parentheses (…) were not meant to be presented but the meeting would do so if requested. Also, the Rapporteur mentioned that in some cases, detailed discussion will occur during ad hoc group sessions or future interim rapporteur group meetings. The Rapporteur also encouraged all delegates to give short intervention and respect a maximum time of two minutes when taking the floor.

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1.1 | TSB: TSAG interactive remote participation guidelines – Zoom Multilingual | ([[TD](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0054/en)387](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0387)) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |
| 1.2 | Supplement 4 to the ITU-T A-series "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" | ([A Suppl.4](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=15253)) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |

**2 Agenda**

The agenda of the RG-WM meeting was adopted as found in TD316R3 with no changes other than to discuss first the A.4 and A.6 deletion and then Supplement 5. This issue will be considered as we proceed.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Draft agenda | [TD316](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0316)R1 (this document) | RG-WM is invited to **adopt** this agenda. |

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.2 | Chairman, TSAG: Document allocation and work plan | ([TD304](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0304))  ([TD303](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0303)) | To be **noted**. Documents relevant to RG‑WM are listed in this agenda. |

**3 Progress report of interim rapporteur group meetings**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Progress report from interim TSAG RG-WM meetings | ([TD326](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0326)) | RG-WM is invited to **note** this report (including the RGM reports that it references) which has been approved by the WP1 opening plenary.  *Each result will be addressed under the corresponding item of this agenda.* |

The Rapporteur reminded that TD326 is the progress report of RG-WM to TSAG and details the advancement of the work pertaining to RG-WM since the latest plenary meeting of TSAG (30 May - 2 June 2023).

RG-WM was very proactive and held six interim rapporteur group meetings (RGM) as reported below. The report of each meeting is also linked in the progress report.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **RG-WM e-meeting** | **Terms of reference** | **Meeting report** |
| 27 June 2023 | Progress on draft Rec. ITU-T A.1-rev | [DOC4 (230627)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230627/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230627-DOC-0004.docx) |
| 4 July 2023 | Progress on draft Rec. ITU-T A.7-rev ([TD217R2](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0217)) | [DOC3-R1 (230704)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230704/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230704-DOC-0003-R01.docx) |
| 12 Sep 2023 | - Progress on draft new Supplement A.supplRA ([TD251R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0251/en))  - Possible way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6 ([TD275R3](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0275/en)) | [DOC6 (230912)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230912/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230912-DOC-0006.docx) |
| 24 Oct 2023 | Progress on draft Rec. ITU-T A.1-rev | [DOC3-R1 (231024)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-231024/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-231024-DOC-0003-R01.docx) |
| 21 Nov 2023 | - Discuss pending issues in draft revised Rec. ITU-T A.7  - Discuss pending issues in draft revised Rec. ITU-T A.1 | [DOC4 (231121)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-231121/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-231121-DOC-0004.docx) |
| 5 Dec 2023 | - Progress on draft new Supplement A.supRA  - Revision of Supplement 5 (as a possible way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6)  - Discuss pending issues in draft revised Rec. ITU-T A.1 | [DOC6 (231205)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-231205/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-231205-DOC-0006.docx) |

The RG-WM noted the progress report (including the RGM reports that it references) which has been approved by the WP1 opening plenary. Each result will be addressed under the corresponding item of this agenda.

**4** [**Rec. ITU-T A.8**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.8) **"Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendations"**

The following document reproduces the determined text of revised ITU-T A.8 and was noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.1 | Report of the second meeting of TSAG (Geneva, 30 May - 2 June 2023) - Determined revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.8 "Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendations" | ([TSAG-R3](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-R-0003)) ([TSB Circular 111](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSB-CIR-0111/en)) | TSAG at its plenary on 2 June 2023 DETERMINED draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.8.  For **approval** at the TSAG plenary. |

The Rapporteur presented [TD444R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0444/en) which states that eleven Member States (Canada, China, France, Korea (Rep. of), Myanmar, Netherlands (Kingdom of the), Norway, Portugal, Russian Federation, United Kingdom and United States) responded to TSB Circular 111, agreeing to authorize TSAG to proceed with the approval of this ITU-T text; one Member State (Russian Federation) among the 11 Member States provided comments, which are given in the attachment to TD444R1.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.2 | TSB: Results of consultation with Member States - TSB Circular 111 | [TD444R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0444/en) | This TD provides the results of the TAP consultation with Member States concerning TSB Circular 111.  Pursuant to 9.4.5 of WTSA Resolution 1, TSAG may proceed with consideration of **approval** of the text in question. |

TD450 provides an attempt from the Rapporteur to address the Russian comments on revised ITU-T A.8.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.3 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: (for approval) Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.8 "Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendation" | [TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) | Taking the determined text of Rec. ITU‑T A.8 ([TSAG-R3](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-R-0003/en)) as a base document, this TD is an attempt to address the comments received from the Russian Federation during the TAP consultation ([TD444](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0444/en)).  For **approval** by the closing plenary. |

The comments from Russia are straightforward but the opening plenary of TSAG considered that more discussion is needed on Russia’s comments on clause 6.3. The Rapporteur informed that implementing the comments in clause 6.3 would not allow TSB to correct editorial mistakes (including overall consistency) on the part of a (revised) Recommendation which was not modified.

It was considered that the quality of the document could be at stake if we add this comment.

The Russian Federation stressed that the change of the word chairman vs chair is not acceptable for them, and this provides a rationale for them to insert this text so TSB can’t modify texts accordingly.

The Russian Federation proposed to take the decision not to change the term chairman in ITU‑T A.8. According to the Russian Federation, this proposal was not opposed. Before considering TD450 forward, it was agreed to entertain an informal consultation during the coffee break following this meeting to try resolving the issue in clause 6.3.

The informal consultation concluded that: There was disagreement on whether the term "chair" may be used (instead of "chairman") in (new or revised) Recommendations. It was agreed that TSAG will refer this issue to the next Council meeting. It was further agreed that TSB will pre-publish ITU-T A.8 as contained in [TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) but that the final publication is pending this clarification.

NOTE – [TD450](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en) uses the term "chairman".

* **Action:**
* **RG-WM agreed to request TSAG to advise the TSB Director to seek clarification from next session of the ITU Council on the use of the term "chair", instead of "chairman", in new or revised Recommendations.**
* **RG-WM agreed to propose ITU-T A.8 (**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) for approval by the closing plenary.**
* **RG-WM agreed to request TSB to pre-publish ITU-T A.8 (as contained in**[**TD450**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0450/en)**) but to wait for the clarification of the Council before proceeding with the final publication.**

The Russian Federation disagreed with this action.

**5** [**Supplement 5 to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations**](https://www.itu.int/itu-t/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=13023) **"Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 5.1 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Proposed revision to Supplement 5 to the ITU‑T A-series on "Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | ([TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en)) | In support to the proposed deletion of Recommendations ITU-T A.5 and A.6, the rapporteur group meeting on 5 Dec 2023 agreed that these small changes to Supplement 5 (2016) would help to clarify the communication process that may be established between an ITU-T study group and another organization. |
| 5.2 | Korea: Proposed revision for A Supplement 5 | ([C67](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0067/en)) | These contributions suggest updating the definitions in clause 3 to align with the current version of referenced documents.  *Note: The suggested (editorial) modifications have been included in* [[*TD448*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0448/en)](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393)*.* |
| 5.3 | China Telecom, MIIT (China): Proposal for updated definitions in clause 3.1 of A Suppl.5 for consistency with published Recommendations and WTSA Resolutions | ([C72](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0072/en)) |
| 5.4 | Canada: Support to recommendations made in the RG-WM progress report regarding Recommendations ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 | ([C74](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0074/en)) | Canada supports the recommendations in item 2 of the progress report ([TD326](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0326/en)) and actions put forward to TSAG, namely: the revision of Supplement 5 to the ITU-T A‑series Recommendations ([TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en)).  *Note: This contribution will be introduced under agenda item 6.2.* |
| 5.5 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: (For agreement) Proposed revision to Supplement 5 to the ITU-T A-series on "Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | [[TD448](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0448/en)](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393) | This text updates [TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en) with the editorial modifications suggested in [C67](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0067/en) and [C72](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0072/en).  For agreement. |

TD448 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on this issue. This text updates [TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en) with the editorial modifications suggested in [C67](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0067/en) and [C72](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0072/en). TD448 was taken as base for discussion, and it was agreed to discuss the deletion of ITU-T A.4 and A.6 first, and then to come back on the revised Supplement 5.

The result of the discussion on ITU-T A.4 and A.6 deletion (see next agenda item 6) is to upgrade revised Supplement 5 into an ITU-T Recommendation. A new TD was issued with the required formatting of the text ([TD470](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470/en)). It will be reviewed at future sessions of RG-WM.

Consequently, TSAG will delete A Suppl.5 at its next meeting in July if new Rec. ITU-T A.24 is approved.

Saudi Arabia, UK, Cameroon and Canada supported the creation of a new work item to upgrade revised Supplement 5 to A-series Recommendation. An A.1 justification was provided as found in [TD471](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0471/en) and will also be reviewed at future sessions of RG-WM.

**6 Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6.1 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Justification to propose the deletion of Recommendations ITU-T A.4 and A.6 | [TD394R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0394) | This TD provides the explanatory summary about the reasons for the deletion of Recs ITU-T A.4 and ITU-T A.6.  For **agreement**. |
| 6.2 | Canada: Support to recommendations made in the RG-WM progress report regarding ITU‑T Recommendations ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 | [C74](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0074/en) | Canada supports the recommendations in item 2 of the progress report ([TD326](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0326/en)) and actions put forward to TSAG, namely:   * The deletion of Recommendations ITU‑T A.4 and ITU-T A.6; * The revision of A Suppl.5 as found in [TD393](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0393/en). |
| 6.3 | Cameroon: Contribution to maintain Recommendations ITU-T A.4 and A.6 | [C82](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0082) | This contribution addresses the limitations of TD394, including the consequence of deleting Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6 which will be made non-binding by means of a Supplement. The contribution proposes to maintain the above recommendations and to abandon the idea of amending A Suppl.5 which is a non-normative document. |

The Rapporteur presented TD394R1, which clarifies the reasons why ITU-T A.4 and A.6 are proposed for deletion at this meeting. The Rapporteur focused on the table within TD394R1, which clarifies the mapping of each item covered by the relevant involved A-series Recommendations and Supplements.

Contribution C82 from Cameroon suggests retaining ITU-T A.4 and A.6 because in their opinion the concept of formal communication process should not be in a Supplement but rather in a normative ITU-T Recommendation. In order to address this concern, it was proposed to upgrade Supplement 5 to an A-series Recommendation.

C74 supports the deletion of Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6. Canada noted that upgrading Supplement 5 to an A-series Recommendation was acceptable.

After discussion, it was agreed to upgrade Supplement 5 to an A-series Recommendation (e.g. A.24) to address the concerns of Cameroon with the deletion of Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6.

With the above agreement, TD394R1 is approved, and ITU-T A.4 and A.6 are put forward for deletion at the closing Plenary.

* **Action: RG-WM agreed to request TSAG to initiate the process for the deletion of ITU-T A.4 and A.6, and to determine new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" (for TAP consultation).***Note 1 – The circular announcing the deletion will include the justifications found in TD394R1 and will be issued 3 months prior to TSAG so that the deletion would come into force at the same time (see 9.8.2.1 of WTSA Resolution 1) when TSAG considers the approval of ITU-T A.24. TSB is requested to consider cross-referencing the related circulars.  
  Note 2 – Consequently, TSAG will delete A Suppl.5 at its next meeting in July if new Rec. ITU-T A.24 is approved.*

**7 Review of suggested ad hoc groups, editing sessions and interim meetings**

The Rapporteur reminded that three ad hoc groups were planned for this TSAG meeting as follows:

* RG-WM ad hoc group on ITU-T A.1-rev on Monday 22 Jan, 17:45-19:30;
* RG-WM ad hoc group on ITU-T A.7-rev on Wednesday 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30;
* RG-WM ad hoc group on draft A.SupplRA/A.RA on Thursday 25 Jan at 13:15-14:20;

It was agreed to modify the third ad hoc group on 25 Jan to discuss ITU-T A.1.

The meeting was adjourned at 15:50.

**WEDNESDAY, 24 January 2024**

**8 Agenda (Session 1, 09:30-10:45 and Session 2, 11:15-12:30)**

The second session of RG-WM opened on 24 January at 09:30 (followed by a third session at 11:15). The Rapporteur welcomed the participants and mentioned that a revised agenda was posted in TD316R4. The agenda was adopted with no changes.

**9** [**Rec. ITU-T A.1**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.1) **"Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 9.1 | Korea (Rep. of): SG management’s submission of TDs at its regional group meeting and procedure for appointing the regional group’s management | [C64](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0064/en) | Korea suggests:  a. that TSAG provide advice on whether the SG management appointed by WTSA could submit TDs to facilitate discussion at its regional group meeting and TSAG consider, for example, updating clause 3.3.5 in Rec. ITU-T A.1 to explicitly state that study group chairman and vice-chairman are able to submit inputs as TDs;  b. that TSAG gives clear criteria or procedure for endorsing or approving regional group chairman and vice-chairman by their parent study group. |
| 9.2 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Information to support the discussion on contribution C64 | [TD455](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0455/en) | This document provides an overview of the current legal framework with regard to the proposals in contribution [C64](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0064/en).  For **discussion**. |

[C64](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0064/en) was presented by Korea. Korea proposes that the chair and vice-chairs of a study group, which is the parent of a regional group, should be entitled to submit TDs to advance the work of the regional group. This issue is not covered by ITU-T A.1 or WTSA Resolution 54. Also, C64 suggests TSAG to give clear criteria or procedure for endorsing or approving the regional group chair and vice-chair by their parent study group.

[TD455](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0455/en) provides an overview of the current legal framework with regard to the proposals in contribution [C64](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0064/en).

TD455 clarifies that ITU-T A.1, clause 3.3.5, is based on GR84, which does not give rights of to the parent study group chair to submit TDs to another group (including regional groups). Also, it is noted that, according to WTSA Resolution 54, only experts from the region can participate to the relevant regional group, which means that not all experts of the parent study group management team can attend a regional group. Experts from other regions could only attend a regional group upon invitation.

Upon request of the Russian Federation, the Rapporteur clarified that the use of the term chair vs chairman in TD455 is based on the English style guide and that he does not intend to deviate from this guide. Only text copied from existing Recommendations or the basic instruments are copied "as is" without making any modification, in agreement with the ITU Council's decision. This is the case for the last paragraph that is inspired from ITU-T A.1 but is not a blanket copy of it.

Korea thanked the Rapporteur RG-WM for providing TD455. The logic within the TD is clear for Korea. In the opinion of Korea, the SG chair has the responsibility to promote the work of the SG and of its Regional Groups.

Conclusions: The meeting confirmed that:

1. a study group can send liaison statements to its regional groups;
2. the only other possibility for an SG chair to submit material to its regional groups is through the RG chair, i.e. the RG chair submits a TD taking into account material from the SG chair, if considered appropriate;
3. WTSA Resolution 54 does not allow SG chairs to automatically participate, by virtue of their position, in meetings of regional groups; they can only participate as invited experts or because they are a member of the region;
4. when considering the establishment of a regional group, a study group could include, in its terms of reference, a text such as: "A chair and vice-chair are initially appointed by the parent study group. If needed, after the initial establishment of the regional group, subsequent management appointments will be made by the regional group, and the parent study group informed accordingly for endorsement."

The meeting also invited members to submit contributions directly to WTSA if they believe changes to WTSA Resolution 54 are needed.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 9.3 | Japan: Proposals on the draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.1, clause 1.4.7.1 | [C75](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0075/en) | Japan proposes that at least three different countries should support the creation of a new work item at a WP/SG plenary meeting.  Japan suggests discussing the case of the same company having an ITU membership in more than one country.  *Note: This proposal has been included in* [*TD456R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) *for further discussion.* |
| 9.4 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.1-rev “Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector” | [TD456R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) | Based on [TD395](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0395), this draft reflects the results of the discussion at interim meetings of RG-WM as well as contributions to this TSAG meeting. It further reflects the discussion at the ad hoc session, Monday 22 Jan 2024, 1745-1930.  For **discussion** about clause 1.4.7.1.  *Note: Other changes in* [*TD456R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) *will be discussed in ad hoc sessions (see* [*agenda item 9.10*](#Item9_10)*).* |

[C75](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0075/en) was presented by Japan. It proposes that members from at least three different countries should support the creation of a new work item at a WP/SG plenary meeting. Using [TD456R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456), the Rapporteur summarized the discussion on this issue since the various interim rapporteur meetings. Russia noted that based on Japan statistics provided in their contribution, if we adopt the three members support for new work items, ITU-T SG11 would lose 65% of their new work items, which are supported by one or two members only.

Various views were expressed and most of them are already included in TD456R1. Some members believe that adding a minimum number of members support would create barriers to start new work items in ITU-T, while other members believe that a minimum of 2 countries should support the start of a new work items to make sure of its international relevance, given the status of ITU-T Recommendations.

The Rapporteur suggested that a compromise would be to adopt "members from at least two different countries" and this emerged from the interim meetings as well as today’s discussion. However, it was agreed to entertain informal consultation led by Japan to try one more attempt to find a compromise solution on this issue. Japan will report tomorrow at the last RG-WM session.

The following documents were noted:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 9.5 | China Telecommunications Corporation, Ministry of Industry and Information Technology (MIIT) (China): Proposal for the revised text of Rec. ITU-T A.1 | ([C71](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0071/en)) | Recognizing that some outstanding issues remain unresolved, this contribution provides proposals for the revision of Rec. ITU-T A.1.  *Note: These proposals have been included in* [*TD456R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) *for further discussion.* |
| 9.6 | Russian Federation: A.1 proposals | ([C77](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0077/en)) | This contribution suggests further amendments to ITU-T A.1-rev. The Russian Federation supports RCC/40A19/1 from WTSA-20.  *Note: These proposals have been included in* [*TD456R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) *for further discussion.* |
| 9.7 | Cameroon: Contribution to modify A.1 | ([C81](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0081/en)) | This contribution proposes changes to Rec. ITU-T A.1.  *Note: These proposals have been included in* [*TD456R16*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) *for further discussion.* |
| 9.8 | United Kingdom: Amendments to Clause 2.4 of Recommendation ITU-T A.1 | ([C86](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0086/en)) | This contribution proposes editorial comments to the sub-clauses of clause 2.4.  *Note: These proposals have been included in* [*TD456R16*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) *for further discussion.* |
| 9.9 | ITU-T SG15 : EWM liaison report | ([TD430](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0430/en), section 5) | This liaison statement contains the SG15 perspective on three specific aspects of the proposed new Appendix III on EWM:  • Banning document distribution on email,  • Forcing use of FTP for SG meetings,  • Forcing use of Sharepoint for rapporteur meetings.  For **information**. *It is suggested to use this information while discussing Appendix III in* [*TD456R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456)*. This TD will be considered under* [*agenda item 14.1*](#Item14_1)*.* |
| 9.10 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.1-rev “Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector” | ([TD456R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456)) | This draft reflects the results of the discussion at interim meetings of RG-WM as well as contributions to this TSAG meeting.  *For* ***discussion*** *in ad hoc sessions (see* [*Annex A*](#Annex_A)*).* *The following remaining clauses (addressed in earlier contributions) will be handled as a priority: (new) 3.1.8bis, 3.1.6, 3.3.3. The review will then continue with remaining clauses that are NOT green-highlighted.*  For possible **determination** for TAP consultation (together with A.JCA) if the text is considered stable (see [agenda item 19](#Item19)). |
| 9.11 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: A.1 justification for a new ITU-T A‑series Recommendation A.JCA “Joint coordination activities: Establishment and working procedures” | [TD468](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0468) | At the ad hoc session, Monday 22 Jan 2024, 1745-1930, it was agreed that Rec. ITU-T A.1, clause 5 on JCAs will be moved to a new Recommendation A.JCA. It was further agreed that both A.1-rev and A.JCA will be processed as a bundle (i.e. determination, TAP consultation and approval together).  For **agreement**.  *Note: It is suggested to use A.18 as the Recommendation number.* |

[TD468](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0468) is the follow up on the agreement that Rec. ITU-T A.1, clause 5 on JCAs will be moved to a new Recommendation A.JCA. It provides the related A.1 justification, which was discussed briefly, No comments were expressed, so the work item will be added to the work programme.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to agree on the establishment of a new work item for draft Recommendation ITU-T A.JCA "Joint coordination activities: Establishment and working procedures", to be simultaneous determined (and approved) with ITU-T A.1‑rev.**

**10 Draft new Supplement A.SupplRA to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations “Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities”**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 10.1 | United Kingdom: Change of status of A.SupplRA to an ITU‑T Recommendation | [C85](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0085/en) | This contribution proposes changing the status of the supplement on Registration Authorities to a Recommendation.  For **discussion**.  *Note:* [*TD396R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en) *shows which changes would be necessary in the text to adapt to the Recommendation format.* |
| 10.2 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: A.1 justification for a proposed new ITU-T A-series Recommendation “Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities” | [TD442](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0442/en) | This is the A.1 justification for changing the status of A.SupplRA to a new draft ITU-T A-series Recommendation.  For **agreement**.  *Note: The work programme (*[*TD397*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0397)*) will be updated accordingly.* |
| 10.3 | SG11: LS/r on “Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities” (reply to [TSAG-LS23](https://www.itu.int/net/itu-t/ls/ls.aspx?isn=29553)) | ([TD364](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0364/en)) | A.SupplRA is very relevant to SG11’s work items, especially ITU-T Q.TSCA.  In particular, SG11 suggests **adding** 22 definitions from CA/Browser Forum (2007), “Guidelines for the issuance and management of extended validation public-key certificates”.  *Note: This TD has been considered at the RG-WM rapporteur group meeting on 5 Dec 2023.* |
| 10.4 | SG11: LS/r on the new work item ITU-T Q.TSCA which defines procedure for issuing digital certificates for signalling security (reply to SG2-LS64) | ([TD367](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0367)) | For **information**: SG11 started the work item ITU-T Q.TSCA taking into consideration the statement of several member states that ITU should not have any operational or administrative role in the digital certificate scheme.  Taking into account clause 6.2 of A.SupplRA stating that “Where an RA is required, the study group responsible for the technical Recommendation also develops the associated procedural Recommendation.”, Q.TSCA will be developed in SG11 based on SG11 full package of standards on signalling security aspects (ITU-T Q.3057, Q.3062 and Q.3063).  Q.TSCA intends to reference some of the definitions in A.SupplRA once published. |
| 10.5 | Ad hoc convenor: Chair’s report of SG2/SG11 informal ad-hoc meeting on Q.TSCA (virtual, 9 January 2024) | ([TD461](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0461/en)) | This TD contains a report of an informal ad-hoc e-meeting between experts of ITU T SG2 and SG11 on Q.TSCA.  For **information**. |
| 10.6 | SG2: LS/r on Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities (reply to TSAG-LS23) | ([TD392](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0392/en)) | Although the concept of registration authority as discussed in this draft Supplement does not apply to the TSB, there are operational implications that are within the remit of ITU-T SG2 and for which normative text is required. For **discussion**.  *Note:SG2 comments and suggested changes have been included in* [*TD396R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en) *for further discussion.* |
| 10.7 | China Telecom: Proposal for clear definition of the selection and appointment process for Registration Authorities in A.SupplRA | ([C73](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0073/en)) | China Telecom proposes a clear definition of the process for the selection and appointment of a registration authority in A.SupplRA.  *Note: This suggestion has been included in* [*TD396R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en) *for further discussion.* |
| 10.8 | ITU-T A.supplRA editor: Proposed new Supplement to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations “Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities” | ([TD396R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en)) | This draft reflects the results of the discussion at interim meetings of RG-WM as well as contributions to this TSAG meeting.  *For* ***discussion*** *in a dedicated ad hoc session (Thursday, 25 Jan, 13:15-14:20). The result will be reported to the WP1 plenary.* |

[C85](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0085/en) proposes to change the status of the Supplement on registration authorities to an ITU-T Recommendation.

[TD442](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0442/en) provides the related A.1 justification for changing the status of A.SupplRA to a new draft ITU-T A-series Recommendation. There is no plan to finalize this document in this study period as time is needed for discussion.

All other documents on this topic were noted by the meeting, the relevant proposals are included in [TD396R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en) and will be discussed at related future interim meetings.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to agree on changing the status of draft Supplement A.SupplRA to draft ITU-T Recommendation A.RA "Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities".**

**11 Coffee break**

A coffee break took place from 10:55 to 11:15

**12** [**Rec. ITU-T A.2**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.2) **"Presentation of contributions to the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 12.1 | ITU-T Study Group 3: LS/I on proposals for submitting and handling contributions from new ITU-T entrants | [TD373](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0373/en) | For **discussion**: Many members want to submit contributions to SG3 meetings, but they are not familiar with the skills to write and handle contributions successfully. This TD proposes a new approach for discussion as it may have broader applicability across ITU-T study groups.  1) A rapporteur (or a desired representative expert) that [is competent in] the content of the contribution can help in writing and discussing it in cooperation with the original author.  2) By appointing a new relevant rapporteur, [the member] can collaborate with the original author to prepare and discuss the contribution.  3) An author who wants to write and discuss a new contribution can request a mentor from the SG3 chair […]. |
| 12.2 | Rec. ITU-T A.2 “Presentation of contributions to the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector” | ([ITU-T A.2](https://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-A.2-201211-I), Appendix I) | For **information**: This Recommendation gives directives on how to draft, present and submit contributions to ITU-T study groups.  *NOTE (on Appendix I) – These guidelines will be updated by TSB as necessary. The updated version will be maintained on the ITU-T website and issued in a TSB circular.*  *See also the* [*contribution template*](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/oth/0A/0F/T0A0F00002B0003MSWE.docx)*.* |
| 12.3 | TSB: ITU-T A.2: Proposed updates to Recommendation ITU-T A.2, Appendix I, “Detailed guidelines for the preparation of contributions relative to the study of ITU T Questions” | ([TD432](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0432/en)) | TSAG is invited to consider revised ITU‑T A.2, Appendix I, which has been prepared by TSB and is provided to TSAG for **information**.  *Note: Comments (if any) can be shared with the TSB Counsellor for RG-WM.* |

[TD373](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0373/en) was presented by the SG3 vice-chair. It mainly includes a contribution from Korea to SG3, which highlighted the need to help newcomers to prepare contributions to SG3 meetings and this issue is advised to TSAG as it may be of general relevance.

TD432 was quickly presented, it provides a revision of [ITU-T A.2](https://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-A.2-201211-I), Appendix I, which is under TSB's responsibility.

It was agreed to send a liaison statement with revised Appendix I to ITU-TA.2 to all study groups requesting any additional updates that may be needed. Comments should be conveyed to TSB via the SG Counsellors. The liaison would also remind that every SG should appoint a Mentor (if not already done) which would help newcomers to prepare contributions to the SG concerned.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to agree to send the liaison statement to all SGs on guidelines for the preparation of contributions and the role of SG Mentors (TD477).**

**13** [**Rec. ITU-T A.7**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.7) **"Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 13.1 | Editors, Rec. ITU-T A.7: Analysis of the concept of “standards gap analysis” and suggested way forward for Recommendation ITU-T A.7-rev | [TD385](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0385/en) | The RG-WM rapporteur group meeting on 21 Nov 2023 tasked the ITU-T A.7-rev editors to further study the concept of “standards gap analysis” and provide an analysis to TSAG.  For **discussion**. |
| 13.2 | RG-WM Rapporteur: A.13 justification for a proposed new Supplement A.SupplSGA to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations “Guidelines for the development of a standards gap analysis” | [TD454](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0454/en) | For **agreement**.  *For* ***discussion*** *in the* [*ad hoc group*](#Annex_A) *(Wednesday, 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30).* |
| 13.3 | Editors, Rec. ITU-T A.7: Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.7-rev “Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures” | [TD379](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0379/en)R1 | This revision of ITU-T A.7 is proposed for **determination** (for TAP consultation), pending resolution of the only remaining issue related to “standards gap analysis”.  *For* ***discussion*** *in the* [*ad hoc group*](#Annex_A) *(Wednesday, 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30).* |

ITU-T A.7-rev has been revised and finalized during interim RG-WM meetings. The only pending issue is related to the standards gap analysis.

Intel proposed to add draft standards in the template of the standards gap analysis. This and other comments will be considered during the planned ad hoc session.

[TD454](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0454/en) proposes the A.13 justification for a proposed new Supplement A.SupplSGA to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines for the development of a standards gap analysis".

China Telecom reserved their position on adding a new Supplement on standards gap analysis in the work programme as the standards gap analysis is not mandatory.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to agree on the establishment of a new work item for draft Supplement A.SupplSGA to the ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines for the development of a standards gap analysis".**

**14 Electronic working methods,** co-led by the Associate Rapporteur on remote participation and electronic working methods

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 14.1 | ITU-T SG15: EWM liaison report | ([TD430](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0430/en)) | For **information**.  *Note: Section 5 "Proposed Annex in Rec. ITU-T A.1 on EWM" has been considered under* [*agenda item 9.9*](#Item9_9)*.* |
| 14.2 | Director, TSB: Electronic working methods services and database applications report | [TD414](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0414) | This TD describes actions taken since the last May-June 2023 TSAG meeting to improve electronic working methods and tools for the membership. Addendum 1 is a presentation about TSB digital transformation.  For **information**. |
| 14.3 | ITU-T SG5: LS/r on request of the appointment of an electronic working methods (EWM) liaison (reply to TSAG-LS19) | ([TD344](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0344/en)) | ITU-T SG5 has nominated Mr [Leandro Navarro](mailto:leandro.navarro@upc.edu) (Co-rapporteur Q7/5).  *Note: This contact has been added to* [*TD378*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0378/en)*.* |
| 14.4 | ITU-T SG2: LS/r on request of the appointment of an electronic working methods (EWM) liaison (reply to TSAG-LS19) | ([TD375](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0375/en)) | ITU-T SG2 has nominated Mr Inseop Lee.  *Note: This contact has been added to* [*TD378*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0378/en)*.* |
| 14.5 | Electronic working methods (EWM) liaisons appointed by ITU-T study groups | ([TD378](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0378/en)) | WTSA Resolution 32, *resolves* 2, instructs TSAG to request study group chairmen to identify EWM liaisons.  RG-WM is invited to **note** the latest version of this list.  *Note: TSB will ensure that each contact is subscribed to the RG-WM mailing-list.* |
| 14.6 | TDAG: LS/i on new edition of Supplement 4 to ITU-T A-series Recommendations "Guidelines for remote participation" (reply to TSAG-LS4) | ([TD348](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0348/en)) | For **information**: TDAG acknowledges the revisions to A Suppl.4 and would like to be kept abreast of any further developments. |

[TD414](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0414) describes actions taken by TSB since the last May-June 2023 TSAG meeting to improve electronic working methods and tools for the membership. Addendum 1 is a presentation about TSB digital transformation. TSB provided an oral presentation focusing on slide 4.

TSB was requested to clarify which types of documents is used to maps to SDGs in <https://www.itu.int/myworkspace/#/sdg> and in the meantime it identified that the SDG mapping tool uses in-force Recommendations, publications (everything under publication category until Dec 2023), meeting documents (only circulars, collective letters and contributions until 2021), and liaison statements (until 2021).

[TD378](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0378/en) provides the list of EWM liaison officers as requested by WTSA Resolution 32, *resolves* 2. TSB added those that were not in the RG-WM email list. RG-WM noted the latest version of the list of SG EWM liaison officers to TSAG.

It was noted that the ISCG meeting in the afternoon will discuss holistically the approach to electronic working methods in ITU and Mr Rushton will keep RG-WM informed on any progress.

**15** [**Rec. ITU-T A.23**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.23) **"Collaboration with the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) and the International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC) on information technology"**

The following document was noted:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 15.1 | Liaison officer to ISO/IEC JTC 1: Report of the ISO/IEC JTC 1 Plenary (Paestum, Italy, May 2023) | ([TD443](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0443/en)) | For **information** (see Resolution 6: Revision of Standing Document 15 "Cross-domain Cooperation and Collaboration (including Liaisons)"). |

**16 Review of suggested ad hoc groups, editing sessions and interim meetings**

The Rapporteur reminded on the upcoming ad hoc meetings:

* on ITU-T A.7-rev and standards gap analysis on Wednesday 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30.
* on ITU-T A.1-rev on Thursday 25 Jan, 08:00-09:15 and on Thursday 25 Jan at 13:15-14:20 (the result of this last session will be reported to the WP1 closing plenary);

As the meeting was ahead of its schedule, items 17.4 and 17.5 were considered.

**17 Proposal for a new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations"**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 17.4 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: A.1 justification for new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | [TD471](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0471/en) | The first RG-WM session on Tuesday 23 Jan 2024 agreed to change the status of A Suppl.5 to a new A-series Recommendation.  For **agreement**. |
| 17.5 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: (For determination) Proposed new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | [TD470](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470/en) | Taking [TD448](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0448/en) as a basis, this TD shows the necessary modifications to change Supplement 5 to the A-series Recommendations into a new Recommendation ITU-T A.24.  Confirm that it can be proposed for **determination** (for TAP consultation) in association with the agreement to delete Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6. |

TD471 proposes the A.1 justification for the new draft Recommendation (planned A.24). No objection was expressed on the establishment of this new work item. A few (editorial) comments were made. The A.1 justification will be revised and is approved.

For what concerns [TD470](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470/en), it is an attempt to put Supplement 5 into a normative formatting and language using the Recommendation template.

It was agreed to delete clause 11.2 as it is better to rely on ITU-T A.5 and A.25. Each annex title should be renamed by removing the term "guidelines". With these changes TD470 should be revised.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to determine (for TAP consultation) draft new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" (TD470R1).**

The meeting adjourned at 12:30.

**THURSDAY, 25 January 2024**

The fourth and last session of RG-WM opened on 25 January at 09:30. The Rapporteur welcomed the participants and mentioned that a revised agenda was posted in TD316R5. The agenda was adopted with no changes.

**18** [**Rec. ITU-T A.7**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.7) **"Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures"**

The following document was considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 18.1 | Editors, Rec. ITU-T A.7: (for determination) Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.7-rev "Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures" | [TD453](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0453) | The latest version of this TD contains the result of the ad hoc session (Wednesday, 24 Jan, 17:45-19:30).  It is proposed for **determination** (for TAP consultation). |

The revised ITU-T A.7 will be put forward for determination at the closing Plenary.

TSB will do a sanity check on TD453 before it is sent for TAP consultation.

Russia, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, UAE, China Telecom oppose determination if the word "chair" replaces the word "chairman" in the whole text; otherwise they would agree for the determination of ITU-T A.7.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to determine (for TAP consultation) draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.7 "Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures" (**[**TD453R1**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0453)**).**

**18bis Draft Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "****Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations"**

The following document was considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 18bis.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: (For determination) Proposed draft new Recommendation ITU-T A.24 "Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations" | [TD470](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470)R1 | This TD shows the necessary modifications to change Supplement 5 to the A-series Recommendations into a new Recommendation ITU-T A.24.  It is proposed for **determination** (for TAP consultation). |

The new ITU-T A.24, which is derived from the A series Supplement 5 plus Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6, will be put forward for determination at the closing Plenary.

Russia, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, UAE, China Telecom oppose determination if the word "chair" replaces the word "chairman" in the whole text, otherwise they would agree for the determination of ITU-T A.7.

* **Action: WP1 is invited to determine (for TAP consultation) draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.24 " Collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations " (**[**TD470R1**](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0470)**).**

**19** [**Rec. ITU-T A.1**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.1) **"Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector"**

**New Recommendation ITU-T A.JCA "Joint coordination activities: Establishment and working procedures"**

Japan reported the results of the informal consultation on the number of members necessary for a study group to establish a new work item. They did not succeed to find a compromise but it was useful to get a better understanding of the various views. Most members agreed to have members from at least two different countries. Few members didn't want any such requirement but others argued that a Recommendation developed by a unique member cannot be considered as an international standard.

The Rapporteur proposes as compromise to keep the minimum number of two members from two different countries to support a new work item, given the history of discussion on this topic.

The following views were expressed:

* The contribution from Japan includes statistics for SG11 as an example: It could be interesting to have statistics from other SGs as well.
* The reason why a new work item is developed by only one member (or a limited number of members) should be investigated and addressed otherwise than by limiting the minimum number of supporters of new work items.
* There may be political reasons why it is important not to limit the number of supporting members to a minimum of two countries.
* ITU is an intergovernmental organization and it is a sovereignty right of a Member State to propose a new work item, without seeking support from other members.

After discussion, it was concluded that the TSB could not easily provided information about the number of members listed in the bottom row of each A.1 justification as this is free text that is not stored in a database.

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 19.1 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.1-rev "Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector" | [TD456R2](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456) | The latest version of this TD reflects the results of ad hoc sessions held during this TSAG meeting.  For **discussion** if there is any pending issue.  For possible **determination** for TAP consultation (together with A.JCA) if the text is considered stable. |
| 19.2 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Current discussion on new Appendices II and III to ITU-T A.1 | [TD478](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0478/en) | This document provides the current status of discussion on new Appendices II and III to ITU-T A.1.  For discussion at rapporteur group meetings (see [agenda item 22](#Suggested_RGMs)). |
| 19.2 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: New draft Recommendation ITU-T A.JCA "Joint coordination activities: Establishment and working procedures" | [TD467](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0467/en) | At the ad hoc session, Monday 22 Jan 2024, 1745-1930, it was agreed that Rec. ITU-T A.1, clause 5 on JCAs will be moved to a new Recommendation A.JCA. It was further agreed that both A.1-rev and A.JCA will be processed as a bundle (i.e. determination, TAP consultation and approval together).  For **discussion** if there is any pending issue.  For possible **determination** for TAP consultation (together with A.1-rev) if the text is considered stable.  *Note: It is suggested to use A.18 as the Recommendation number.* |

With regard to the following clause, it was agreed to add the word "normally" to cover the joint development of draft Recommendations and other texts with ISO/IEC JTC 1, IETF and other organizations, in which case contribution may not submitted to the other standards development organization:

**1.4.9** A work item (normative or non-normative) shall normally be marked as discontinued in the work programme if it has not given rise to any contribution for 18 months. Any subsequent proposal to progress the work item shall include a revision of the template in Annex A of this Recommendation (or in Annex A of [ITU-T A.13] for a non-normative work item).

The Rapporteur proposed to proceed with the following "package":

* determine ITU-T A.1-rev ([TD456R3](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0456));
* determine A.JCA at this TSAG meeting ([TD467](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0467/en));
* continue refining new Appendices II and III ([TD478](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0478/en)) until the next TSAG meeting in July 2024 where they would be agreed and integrated into ITU-T A.1-rev at final publication.  
  NOTE – The principles of ITU-T A.13 shall be applied to "appendices to Recommendations agreed separately from the base text of the Recommendation" (clause 6).

The Legal advisor confirmed that the proposal of the Rapporteur was not against the current policy of ITU-T.

Russia, China Telecom and China opposed this way forward.

However, there was no opposition to determine A.JCA ([TD467](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0467/en)) at this TSAG meeting. It was agreed that, if A.JCA is approved in advance of A.1, the text of A.JCA would prevail (over ITU-T A.1, clause 5) with regard to JCAs.

Russia, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, UAE, China Telecom oppose determination of A.1 and A.JCA if the word "chair" replaces the word "chairman" in the whole text

It was noted that this concern only affects the English version of these texts. It was further noted that this issue is outside the purview of RG-WM as well as TSAG. The editor uses the word "chair" in these text because it is in accordance with the ITU English style guide.

The editor prepared the text for determination (TD456R3) for further consideration by WP1. Apart from the appendices, A.1-rev is considered stable for determination.

**20 Outgoing liaison statements**

The following document was considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 20.1 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: LS/o on guidelines for the preparation of contributions and the role of SG Mentors | [TD477](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0477/en) | This liaison statement informs ITU-T Study Groups on a revision of Appendix I to ITU-T A.2 and reminds about the role of SG Mentors. |

The draft liaison statement is approved ad RG-WM level.

* **Action: WP1 is requested to agree on the outgoing liaison statement "LS/o on guidelines for the preparation of contributions and the role of SG Mentors" to be sent to ITU-T Study Groups (**[**TD477**](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0477/en)**)**

**21 RG-WM work programme**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 21.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Updates to the RG-WM work programme | [TD397](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0397)R1 | RG-WM is asked to **confirm** the updates to the RG-WM work programme. |
| 21.2 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Living list | ([TD386R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0386/en)) | For **information**. Members are invited to use this TD for possible contributions to future TSAG meetings. |
| 21.3 | Director, TSB: Action plan related to the Resolutions and Opinion of WTSA | ([TD410](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0410)) | The WTSA-20 Action Plan is a monitoring and reporting tool to keep track of the implementation of WTSA Resolutions and Opinion. This document contains the updated WTSA-20 Action Plan from its last revision in May 2023 for last TSAG meeting.  For **information**.  *Note: There is no ‘needs attention’ action items marked in red for RG-WM.* |
| 21.4 | Vice-chair, WP1: WTSA action plan: Review of action lines under WP1/TSAG | ([TD452](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0452)) | This TD contains the WTSA action plan related to WP1, with updated status and notes regarding fulfilment of WTSA resolutions.  For **information**.  *Note: This TD takes account of RG-WM's living list (*[*TD386R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0386/en)*).* |
| 21.5 | TSB: Proposed mapping of WTSA Resolutions to TSAG Rapporteur groups | [TD463](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0463) | This TD proposes a mapping of WTSA Resolutions to current RGs. This TD could be used by TSAG as a guiding reference for allocation of contributions to RGs and WTSA-24 working groups if deemed appropriate.  For **review**. |

The revised work programme, as found in [TD397R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0397), provides the current status. It will be updated after discussion of the relevant work items by WP1 and the closing Plenary.

Because of lack of time, the Rapporteur suggested to review [TD463](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0463) during the WP1 plenary and to also add Resolutions 40 and 80 to the following list:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **RG** | **Resolutions** |
| RG-WM | Res 1, 7, 18, 22, 31, 32, 54  (Note: ITU-T A-series of Recommendations (and Supplements) are also in RG-WM) |

**22 Future meetings**

The following interim meetings were agreed in principle, pending final alignment by the Rapporteur:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 22.1 | Suggested interim rapporteur group meetings |  | * 21 Feb 2024, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time: draft ITU-T A.RA ([TD396R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en)) Contribution deadline: 11 Feb 2024 * 13 Mar 2024, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time: draft A.SupplSGA ([TD385R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0385/en)) Contribution deadline: 3 Mar 2024 * 3 Apr 2024, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time: draft Appendices II and III ([TD478](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0478/en)) Contribution deadline: 24 Mar 2024 * 26 Apr 2024, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time: draft ITU-T A.RA ([TD396R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-240122-TD-GEN-0396/en)) Contribution deadline: 16 Apr 2024 * 14 May 2024, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time (pending issues from previous rapporteur group meetings) Contribution deadline: 5 May 2024 * 2 July 2024, 12:00-15:00 Geneva time (A Suppl.4; pending issues from previous rapporteur group meetings) Contribution deadline: 23 June 2024 |

**23 AOB**

A report from Mr Rushton on the ISCG discussion on remote participation was orally provided. The remote participation varies across the sector, so no progress at ISCG may be achieved until the Council will progress on this issue.

**24 Closure of the meeting**

The Rapporteur thanked all TSB staff who worked very hard to support the meeting.

USA and Russia thanked the Rapporteur for the tremendous work achieved.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_