|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| A black and white logo  Description automatically generated with low confidence | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION**TELECOMMUNICATIONSTANDARDIZATION SECTOR**STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | TSAG-TD449 |
| **TSAG** |
| **Original: English** |
| **Question(s):** | N/A | Geneva, 22 - 26 January 2024 |
| **TD** |
| **Source:** | Chair, JCA-AHF |
| **Title:** | Progress report of Joint Coordination Activity on Accessibility and Human Factors (JCA-AHF) |
| **Contact:** | Andrea SaksJCA-AHF Chair, G3ictUSA | Tel: +44 1242 820 800Fax: +44 1242 821 171E-mail: andrea@andreasaks.onmicrosoft.com |
| **Contact:** | Christopher JonesCo-Vice Chair of JCA-AHF, G3ict UK | E-mail: acceque@btinternet.com  |
| **Contact:** | Lidia BestCo-Vice Chair of JCA-AHF EFHOH; G3ict, UK | E-mail: best.lidia@gmail.com  |
| **Contact:**  | Ms Kaoru Mizuno TSB; Secretary JCA AHF  | Tel:      +41 22 730 6226 E-mail: kaoru.mizuno@itu.int    |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Abstract:** | This document contains the report of the JCA-AHF meeting held on 19 July 2023 in Geneva.  |

# Action required:

TSAG is invited to note the report.

**Related links:**

* [JCA-AHF webpage](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Pages/default.aspx)
* [Meeting documents page](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Pages/202210-docs.aspx)

**Report of the JCA-AHF meeting** ([JCA-AHF Doc 493](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc493.docx))

**Geneva, 19 July 2023, 9:30-12:30 and 14:30-17:30 (CEST)**

1. Opening of the meeting

The JCA-AHF e-meeting was held on 19 July 2023 (9:30-12:30 and 14:30-17:30, CEST) chaired by Ms Andrea Saks (USA), JCA-AHF Chair. Real-time captioning and Interpretation of British Sign Language (BSL) were provided. The list of participants is available on JCA-AHF [Document 492](https://staging.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2022/Oct/JCA-AHF-Doc492.docx).

1. Minute of silence for Gerry Ellis

The JCA-AHF paid a tribute to the memory of Mr Gerry Ellis, former co-vice chair of JCA-AHF. The JCA-AHF acknowledged the tremendous input of Mr Gerry Ellis into the activities of JCA-AHF and observed a minute of silence.

1. Approval of the agenda

The JCA-AHF Chair introduced the draft JCA-AHF meeting agenda and document allocation as contained in JCA-AHF [Document 481](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2021/April/JCA-AHF-Doc481.docx). It was approved by the JCA-AHF (with a change of presentation order).

1. Approval of the last JCA-AHF meeting report

The Chair introduced the draft report of the last JCA-AHF meeting (26 October 2022) contained in JCA-AHF [Document 480](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2022/Oct/JCA-AHF-Doc480.docx) and the report was approved.

# Report of ITU-T Q28/16 meeting on Safe Listening and Accessible health topics

Mr Masahito Kawamori, ITU-T Q28/16 Rapporteur reported the updates from the recent Q28/16 meeting. Q28/16 has been working with WHO to develop ITU-T and WHO Standards on Safe Listening ([ITU-T H.870](https://www.itu.int/itu-t/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=14953) (V2)(2022)) . The recent meeting decided to start a Work Item on technical paper on Safe Listening for e-Games and video gamnes. The Q28/16 meeting also decided to create a technical paper on Safe Listening for news and entertainment based on WHO’s publication.

1. Report of ITU-T Q26/16 meeting

Mr Kawamori, ITU-T Q26/16 rapporteur, reported the updates from the Q26/16 meeting that has taken place on 17-18 July 2023, prior to this JCA-AHF meeting. A new Work Item was created as a draft Recommendation H.ACC-AA-VIU "Technical requirements for authentication accessibility of visually impaired users". Another important outcome is the approval of ITU-T FSTP-ACC-Rural "Technical Paper "Use cases of accessibility to multimedia systems in rural and out-of-home environments", which has been contributed by Mozambique. Q26/16 also continues collaboration with ISO/IEC JTC1 SC35.

1. Updates from ITU-T SG20

Mr Daniel Hark Sohn presented JCA-AHF [Doc 483](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc483.zip) on Liaison Statement on accessibility matters. This LS informs that Recommendation [ITU-T Y.4219](https://www.itu.int/itu-t/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=15482) (draft ITU-T Y.ACC-UI-req) “Accessibility requirements for user interface of smart applications supporting IoT” has been approved.

Then Mr Sohn also presented JCA-AHF [Doc 484](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc484.zip) on LS to update progress of work related to accessible smart cities. This LS informs the progress of the new [draft Technical Report ITU-T YSTR.ACC-SCC](http://www.itu.int/itu-t/workprog/wp_item.aspx?isn=18454) “Guidelines on developing ICT services for accessible smart cities”. Using a two-layer structure of accessibility consideration principles, this Technical Report provides development guidelines to be considered at each layer to implement accessible smart city services. Also, exemplar accessible smart city services are illustrated in the appendix.

Mr Kawamori raised an issue of possible duplication of work done by Q26/16 and SG20. It was suggested that JCA-AHF coordinate the discussion, and it was agreed to consider having a joint meeting with Q26/16, Q1/20 and Q2/20. A possible way forward would be to have a JCA-AHF meeting dedicated to this collaboration. The JCA-AHF Chair will invite rapporteurs of Q1/20 and Q2/20 and discuss options offline.

1. Update of the SG 6/WP 6C activities

Mr Andy Quested apologised due to a scheduling conflict. He will share updates at the next meeting.

1. Updates of ITU-D-Q7/1

Ms Roxana Widmer-Iliescu from BDT apologised due to a scheduling conflict.

1. Discussion by topics
	1. Accessibility of electronic devices – GARI Initiative update

Ms Sabine Lobnig (Mobile and Wireless Forum) presented JCA-AHF [Document 491](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc491.zip).

The Mobile & Wireless Forum (MWF) established the Global Accessibility Reporting Initiative ([GARI](https://www.gari.info/)) in 2008 to provide information on the accessibility features within mobile phones and to help consumers identify devices that supported those features.

GARI is a free online database that is available in currently 20 languages on the accessibility features in over 1,500 devices including mobile phones, tablets, Smart TVs and Wearables.

In reply to the question asked by Mr Debevc, Ms Lobnig explained that relevant accessibility standards are specified, and manufactures provide information on accessibility features of their devices based on these standards with which devices comply.

Mr Kawamori suggested a collaboration with ITU-T on testing devices against relevant standards, such as [ITU-T H.870](https://www.itu.int/itu-t/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=14953) “Guidelines for safe listening devices/systems”. For this standard, there is a technical paper [HSTP.CONF-H870](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-TUT-EHT-2021-CONFH870) “Testing of personal audio systems for compliance with ITU-T H.870”, and this can be utilized for ITU-T conformity assessment to populate ITU-T conformity database. A Call for test lab is being prepared. They agreed to explorer possibilities offline.

* 1. Accessibility issues at ITU AI for Good

Ms Best presented JCA-AHF [Document 489](https://staging.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc489.docx). She together with the JCA-AHF Chair participated in the AI for Good event that took place on 6 -7 July 2023 and identified issues of accessibility, including lack of sign language interpretation and human-generated captioning at the venue and online. ASR captioning was provided through an application on mobile phones, and thus who need captioning were asked to download it, and forced to look at their mobile phones to see the captioning text. She emphasized that ITU-T technical paper [FSTP-AM](https://www.itu.int/pub/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-TUT-FSTP-2015-AM) Guidelines for Accessible Meetings should be employed for ITU meetings. It was also highlighted that JCA-AHF should be consulted on accessibility matters in ITU meetings. As Ms Best is the president of EFHOH, the JCA-AHF Chair and Ms Best agreed to write a letter from EFHOH to address the issues.

Mr Kawamori suggested a constructive way forward, not only criticizing, but more actively promoting accessibility though ITU-T accessibility standards by organizing an event with other organizations. This will be discussed further.

 Mr Kawamori reminded JCA-AHF of related ITU-T documents/work:

- Technical paper [FSTP-ACC-RCS (2019)](https://www.itu.int/pub/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-TUT-FSTP-2019-ACC.RCS) “*Overview of remote captioning services”*

- Ongoing Work Item [FSTP-ACC-AI](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/workprog/wp_item.aspx?isn=17493) “Guidelines on the use of AI for ICT accessibility” that includes word count/error measurement methods for ASR.

* 1. Real-time human captioning verses ASR captioning

Ms Best pointed that not only the accuracy of captioining is an issue, but also the way how the captioning text is displayed should be considered. If text is displayed with chunks and quickly disapeard, it is diffiecut to follow. Then, she also highlighted that increasingly ASR captioning is utilized, but there is a lack of understanding on how and when ASR captioing can be utilized and where should not. Some broadcasters in Europ utilize ASR captioning to fulfill the requirememnts of the EU audiovisual media directive, while the accuracy or ASR is not enough yet. Cases should be noted, for example, sign language interpreters who are themselves deaf rely on accuracy of the captioning for their sign language interpretation to the deaf audience. Broadcasters think it is acceptable to use ASR captioining without consulting with Persons with Disabilities.

* 1. Launch of Accessible EU – EU Commission Flagship Initiative

Mr Matjaž Debevc, National Expert at Accessible EU, presented JCA-AHF [Document 490](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc490.zip). European Accessibility Resource Centre (Accessible EU) was established on 4th July 2023 to enhance accessibility and inclusivity across Europe. The core mission of AccessibleEU is to serve as a comprehensive hub for information, resources, and innovative technologies that promote accessibility. It collaborates with various stakeholders, including governments, organizations, and businesses, to foster a collective effort in making Europe an inclusive and welcoming place for everyone, regardless of their abilities. Collaboration with SDO’s in accessibility standardization is also emphasized. Events in EU countries are planned, and Mr Debevc invited JCA-AHF to join the community of Accessible EU.

Ms Best commented that there has been remote sign language interpretation only at the Accessible EU event, and no onsite interpreters while members of the European Union of the deaf have attended onsite. She also pointed that captioning has not been appropriately displayed (two languages on a screen and no clear contrast with background) thus not easy to follow for persons with disabilities. She highlighted that each country has its own good practice in providing accessibility service but not the same as the other countries ones, it is therefore important to follow international guidelines.

Mr Debevc responded that ensuring accessibility for a hybrid event has been a challenge. The Accessible EU would follow guidelines, including ITU-T technical paper [FSTP-AM](https://www.itu.int/pub/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-TUT-FSTP-2015-AM) Guidelines for Accessible Meetings.

* 1. Telecommunication Relay Sertice in Japan

Mr Kawamori presented JCA-AHF [Document 488](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc488.zip) on behalf of Mr Yasunobu Ishii, ​The Nippon Foundation Telecommunications Relay Service (NFTRS). The official Telecommunications Relay Servcice (TRS) was started in Japan in 2020, and NFTRS was designated as the sole provider of the services by Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communication (MIC). The services are provided for 24 hours 7 days a week, and the funding comes from all telephone subscribers in Japan (1 JPY per month). Emergency call, VRS, and Text RS are in service.

The JCA-AHF Chairman and Mr Jones appreciated the achivement done in Japan. Mr Yong J Lee informed that Rep. of Korea started TRS with text relay in 2005, and that Asia Pacific Telecommunity Standardization Program (ASTAP) is collecting data on TRS in the Asia-Pacific region. Mr Yamamoto, liaison officer to SG16 from ASTAP, reported the current status on that activity in ASTAP, and that if the report would become mature enough, it would be submitted to SG16 in April 2023. The JCA-AHF Chair suggested to share infromation on the sutiation of TRS in countries where the JCA-AHF members are based (to send to the JCA-AHF secretariat tsbjcaahf@itu.int).

1. Incoming Liaison Statements

## LS on collaboration on content distribution platforms [from ITU-D Q2/1] ([Doc 482](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc482.docx))

**Abstract:** ITU-D Study Group 1 Question 2/1 kindly invites to provide updates on Recommendations, Reports and Work Items related to content distribution platforms for further collaboration.

This LS requests SG16 for information on content distribution platforms and it is not specifically related to accessibility, thus it is for information for JCA-AHF.

The LS was noted by JCA-AHF.

* 1. LS on accessibility matters [from ITU-T SG20] ([Doc 483](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc483.zip))

The LS was presented by Mr Daniel Hark Sohn (see item 7 above).

* 1. LS to update progress of work related to accessible smart cities [from ITU-T SG20] ([Doc 484](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc484.zip))

The LS was presented by Mr Daniel Hark Sohn (see item 7 above).

* 1. LS/r on continued cooperation between ITU-T Study Group 2 (SG2) and ITU-T Study Group 20 (SG20) (reply to SG20-LS18, SG20-LS19, and SG20-LS22) [from ITU-T SG2] ([Doc 485](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc485.docx))

**Abstract:** In comprehensively responding to several incoming liaisons from ITU-T Study Group 20 (SG20), ITU-T Study Group 2 (SG2) emphasizes the importance of continued cooperation and collaboration between the two Study Groups.

It addresses the identification management for IoT devices that would impact global numbering resources, and Q1/2 plans to arrange a dedicated coordination session at its next meeting, in order to invite experts from study groups to come review and discuss their relevant work items with Q1/2 directly. The LS is for information, and it was noted by JCA-AHF.

* 1. LS on progress of TR.MMWF, “Methodologies to mitigate Wangiri Fraud” [from ITU-T SG2] ([Doc 486](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc486.zip) )

**Abstract:** ITU-T SG2 Q1/2 in its discussion on mitigating Wangiri fraud (SG2-TD229R1/PLEN, attached) has identified the potential impact of user vulnerability in becoming a victim of Wangiri numbering fraud, and that persons with disabilities would be especially vulnerable.

The LS requests inputs from Q26/16, JCA-AHF and IRG-AVA to mitigate Wangiri Fraud. This fraud encourages consumers to call numbers with high termination rates by ringing once and ceasing, creating a missed call, to which many consumers ring back, without knowledge of the termination rate, and incur charges when the returned call is answered. Persons with disabilities, especially those who have vision impairments or cognitive impairments, could easily become victims.

Mr Kawamori informed that Q26/16 has decided to review the draft technical paper carefully in order to report back to SG2, and that he would share updates on this topic with JCA-AHF.

* 1. LS on the progress of ITU-T FG-MV WG8 [from ITU-T FG-MV] ([Doc 487](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/jca/ahf/Documents/docs-2023/JCA-AHF-Doc487.docx) )

**Abstract:** This Liaison Statement provides information on the progress of ITU-T FG-MV WG8 Sustainability, Accessibility & Inclusion [to JCA-AHF, ITU-T SG5, ITU-T SG9, ITU-T SG16, ITU-T SG20, ITU-R SG6 Working Party 6C].

Mr Yong Jick Lee presented the LS as he is a co-chair of a Task Group on accessibility and inclusion, Focus Group on metaverse ([FG-MV](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/focusgroups/mv/Pages/default.aspx)), Working Group 8 ([WG8](https://extranet.itu.int/sites/itu-t/focusgroups/mv/wg/SitePages/Working-Group-8.aspx)). FG-MV was established under TSAG in December 2022 for one year lifetime. The FG has 9 WGs, among them WG8 concerns sustainability, accessibility, and inclusion. WG8 is working on seven Work Items, including accessibility of metaverse applications and services, accessible metaverse for education, and translation issues including sign language interpretation and other accessibility issues and concerns while designing metaverse. Mr Lee invited JCA-AHF members to join the discussion and provide inputs to the group, there is no persons with disabilities participating in the group.

1. Any Other Business

Mr Kawamori suggested to consider planning of a workshop on accessibility for emerging technologies such metaverse. The details will be discussed further.

1. Future events

Future events

- ITU-T [FG-MV](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/focusgroups/mv/Pages/default.aspx), Geneva, 3-5 October 2023

- Next [ITU-D Study Group 1](https://www.itu.int/net4/ITU-D/CDS/sg/blkmeetings.asp?lg=1&sp=2022&blk=28245) meeting, Geneva, 23 -27 October 2023

- ITU-T [TSAG](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/tsag/2022-2024/Pages/default.aspx), Geneva, 22-26 January 2024

1. Next JCA-AHF meeting

To be decided and announced accordingly.

## Closing

The JCA-AHF Chair thanked all speakers of the meeting, participants, SL interpreters, captioner and TSB. She closed the meeting at 17:30 (CEST).

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_