|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION  **TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**  STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | | TSAG-TD601R1 |
| TSAG |
| Original: English |
| **Question(s):** | | RG-WM | Geneva, 29 July – 2 August 2024 |
| **TD** | | | |
| **Source:** | | Rapporteur, TSAG Rapporteur group on working methods | |
| **Title:** | | RG-WM living list | |
| **Contact:** | | Olivier Dubuisson Orange France | E-mail: [olivier.dubuisson@orange.com](mailto:olivier.dubuisson@orange.com) |
| **Contact:** | | Stefano Polidori TSB; Secretary RG-WM | E-mail: [stefano.polidori@itu.int](mailto:stefano.polidori@itu.int) |

**Abstract:** This TD is a collection of excerpts of output documents of past TSAG meetings, WTSA-20 and PP-22 which are potentially relevant to the work on working methods.

**Action**: TSAG is asked to note this document. TSAG participants are invited to use this TD for possible contributions to future TSAG meetings.

**Table of contents:**

1. [WTSA-20 results related to the A-series of Recommendations](#WTSA20_results_related_to_Aseries)

2. [WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to electronic working methods](#WTSA20_results_related_to_WM)

3. [WTSA-20 and TSAG results related to "guidelines" as mentioned in Resolution 44](#WTSA20_results_related_to_Res44)

4. [Excerpts of WTSA-20 Resolution 70 related to "end-user needs"](#WTSA20_results_related_to_Res70)

5. [TSAG results related to Resolution 80](#TSAG_results_related_to_Res80)

6. [TSAG results related to A.SupplRA](#TSAG_results_related_to_ASupplRA)

7. [TSAG results related to SG17 incubation mechanism](#TSAG_results_related_to_incubation)

8. [TSAG results related to A Supplement 5](#TSAG_results_related_to_ASuppl5)

*CONVENTION – In this document, some of the text is underlined by the RG-WM rapporteur for information. Items which are currently in progress within RG-WM are ~~highlighted in blue (and struck through for accessibility to colour-blind delegates)~~. Items for which no further action is necessary in this study period are highlighted in green (and double struck through).*

1. **WTSA-20 results related to the A-series of Recommendations**

[WTSA-20 Proceedings](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-REG-LIV.1-2022/en) (V-2.2 – Committee 3):

### Recommendation ITU-T A.1 - Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector

Recommendation ITU-T A.1 received three proposals ([AFCP/35A30/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0035!A30-L1!MSW-E), [EUR/38A17/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0038!A17-L1!MSW-E), [RCC/40A19/1](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0040!A19)) to modify and another proposal ([ARB/36A10/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0036!A10-L1!MSW-E)) not to change this Recommendation, as well as TSAG agreed draft revision of ITU-T A.1 in Doc [25](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-WTSA.20-C-0025) Appendix I.

Working Group 3A noted [that the] proposals received contain many changes and some of them had been already discussed over past TSAG meetings with no consensus. Due to time constraints and [because] no consensus could be reached during the discussion in this Assembly, bearing in mind that TSAG has a mandate to update A-series ITU-T Recommendations, the meeting agreed to no[t] change the Recommendation ITU-T A.1 and to request TSAG to continue reviewing these Recommendations accordingly.

[WTSA-20 Proceedings](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-REG-LIV.1-2022/en) (V-2.2 – Committee 3):

### Recommendation ITU-T A.2 - Presentation of contributions to the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector

Recommendation ITU-T A.2 received one proposal ([EUR/38A15/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0038!A15-L1!MSW-E)) to modify and another proposal ([ARB/36A11-R1/1](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0036!A11-R1!MSW-E.docx)) not to change this Recommendation.

Working Group 3A noted [that the] proposals received contain many changes and some of them had been already discussed over past TSAG meetings with no consensus. Due to time constraints and [since] no consensus could be reached during the discussion in this Assembly, bearing in mind that TSAG has a mandate to update A-series ITU-T Recommendations, the meeting agreed […] to request TSAG to continue reviewing these Recommendations accordingly.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| 22-16 | WTSA-20 invites TSAG to continue studying ITU-T A.7 related issues | For RG-WM |

[WTSA-20 Proceedings](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-REG-LIV.1-2022/en) (3rd plenary meeting + V-2.2 – Committee 3):

### Recommendation ITU-T A.7 - Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures

Recommendation ITU-T A.7 received two proposal ([EUR/38A19/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0038!A19-L1!MSW-E), [IAP/39A20/1](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0039!A20-L1!MSW-E)) to modify and another two proposals ([ARB/36A12-1/1](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0036!A12-R1!MSW-E.docx), [RCC/40A27/7](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0040!A27!MSW-E.docx)) not to change this Recommendation.

The same document contained the request to TSB to make the Recommendation ITU-T A.7 (2012) and its Appendix I (2015) available as a single publication. [*Done in* [*edition 6 of Rec. ITU-T A.7*](https://www.itu.int/itu-t/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=A.7)]

After heard concerns raised and diverged opinions expressed, noting that TSAG has the authority to review A-series Recommendations in between WTSAs, the meeting agreed to NOC to A.7 at this WTSA, but invite TSAG to continue study A.7 related issues.

[Report of TSAG RG-WM meeting, 12 & 13 Jan 2022](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-220110-TD-GEN-1182/en):

The meeting noted that Orange spotted an editorial comment on CITEL proposal, new 7.2 of A.7, ‘contribution’ should be ‘TD’, for attention of COM3 of WTSA to correct.

1. **WTSA-20 and PP-22 results related to electronic working methods**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| 32-05 | TSAG to act as the point of contact between the ITU‑T membership and TSB on EWM matters, in particular providing feedback and advice on the contents, prioritization and implementation of the Action Plan (resolves 2) | For RG-WM |
| ~~32-09~~ | ~~TSAG to identify user needs and plan the introduction of suitable measures through appropriate subgroups and pilot programmes (resolves 2)~~ | ~~For RG-WM~~ |
| 32-10 | TSAG to request study group chairmen to identify EWM liaisons (resolves 2) | For RG-WM |

|  |
| --- |
| [Resolution 32 (Rev. Hammamet, 2016) - Strengthening electronic working methods for the work of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-RES/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.32-2022)  ~~instructs~~  ~~2 TSAG to continue to:~~  • act as the point of contact between the ITU‑T membership and TSB on EWM matters, in particular providing feedback and advice on the contents, prioritization and implementation of the Action Plan;  ~~• identify user needs and plan the introduction of suitable measures through appropriate subgroups and pilot programmes;~~  ~~• request study group chairmen to identify EWM liaisons;~~  • encourage participation by all participants in the work of ITU‑T, especially EWM experts from TSAG, the study groups, TSB and appropriate ITU Bureaux and departments; • continue its work electronically outside TSAG meetings as necessary to carry out its objectives. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| 73-07 | TSAG to consider revision of working methods to reduce climate change impact (instructs TSAG 3) | For RG-WM |

|  |
| --- |
| [Resolution 73 (Rev. Geneva, 2022) - Information and communication technologies, environment, climate change and circular economy](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-RES/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.73-2022)  instructs the Telecommunication Standardization Advisory Group  3 to consider further possible changes to working procedures in order to meet the objective of this resolution, including extending the use of electronic working methods to reduce the impact on climate change, such as paperless meetings, virtual conferencing, teleworking, etc., |

[WTSA-20 Proceedings](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-REG-LIV.1-2022/en) (V-2.2 – Committee 3, clause 2.2.2):

|  |
| --- |
| ~~2.2.2 Draft new Resolution [ECP-3] – Development of standards that are machine applicable, readable and transferable (SMART) in ITU-T~~ ~~CEPT proposal in~~ [~~EUR/38A35/1~~](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0038!A35-L1!MSW-E) ~~proposed a new Resolution on 'Development of standards that are machine applicable, readable and transferable (SMART) in ITU-T' to ask ITU-T to support the development of technical standards that are machine applicable, readable and transferable (SMART) including working with other international SDOs to develop common architectures and protocols for SMART standards.~~  ~~Participants raised interests and questions on this new subject of machine applicable, readable and transferable (SMART) standards and this proposal for clarification, and it was felt such innovative work should be trial out by Study Group first before WTSA to take any resolution. The meeting noted that lack of WTSA Resolution does not mean lack of permission for ITU-T to consider defining new methodologies or developing machine readable standards and concluded that no need to adopt this proposed new Resolution.~~ |

[WTSA-20 Proceedings](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-REG-LIV.1-2022/en) (2nd plenary meeting) (see also [TD22](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0022/en), clause 2.4):

|  |
| --- |
| ~~6 Draft new Resolution [IAP-3], Use of in-person and virtual options on an equal footing in the activities of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector~~ ~~A representative from Uruguay, on behalf of CITEL, presented Document~~ [~~C39 Add.23~~](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/wtsa.20/c/T17-WTSA.20-C-0039!A32!MSW-E.docx) ~~(ref.~~ [~~IAP/39A32/1~~](https://www.itu.int/md/dologin_md.asp?lang=en&id=T17-WTSA.20-C-0039!A32-L1!MSW-E)~~), which proposes a draft new Resolution [IAP-3] on use of in-person and virtual options on an equal footing in the activities of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector.~~  ~~The Plenary was conscious that the technical aspects concerning (electronic) working methods are addressed in Committee 3 and in Working Group 3A pertaining to WTSA Resolution 32.~~  ~~Furthermore, the Plenary was also conscious of ongoing and related work in the TSAG Ad hoc Group on the governance and management of e-meetings (TSAG AHG-GME), and also of possible implications on other matters of financial, operational and legal nature pertaining to the scope of Council and the Plenipotentiary Conference with regard to changes to the General Rules that would potentially be necessary if this particular proposal is to be implemented.~~  ~~The Plenary asked the Director of TSB to bring this proposal to the attention of the TSAG Ad hoc Group on the governance and management of e-meetings, to the Council, and to the Plenipotentiary Conference.~~ |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| ~~22-26~~ | ~~TSAG to further evaluate of the use of fully virtual meetings and physical meetings with remote participation, including the legal aspects. (PP Res.167 instructs the Secretary-General)~~ | ~~For RG-WM~~ |
| ~~22-27~~ | ~~In acknowledging the limitations imposed by the current requirements in recognizing e) of Resolution 167, the 2022 Plenipotentiary Conference recognizes the importance of ITU Members as well chairmen of Study Group meetings which have remote participation, by considering the positions and proposals of remote participants in regard to the issues being discussed in the meeting and the importance of stable technical facilities. (PP-22 COM5 recommendation 2)~~ | ~~For RG-WM~~ |

|  |
| --- |
| [~~PP Res.167 (Rev. Bucharest, 2022) - Strengthening and developing ITU capabilities for fully virtual meetings and physical meetings with remote participation, and the electronic means to advance the work of the Union~~](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=S22-PP-C-0198)  ~~recognizing~~  *~~e)~~* ~~that the current status of interactive remote participation allows "remote intervention" rather than "remote participation", insofar as a remote participant cannot take part in decision-making;~~  ~~instructs the Secretary-General, in consultation and collaboration with the Directors of the three Bureaux~~  ~~2 to involve the advisory groups in the further evaluation of the use of fully virtual meetings and physical meetings with remote participation, including the legal aspects;~~  ~~instructs the ITU Council~~  ~~1 to study and develop high-level guidance for the management and governance of fully virtual meetings and physical meetings with remote participation, taking into account Annex 1 to this resolution;~~  ~~3 to report and provide recommendations to the plenipotentiary conference in 2026.~~  ~~ANNEX 1 TO RESOLUTION 167 (Rev. bucharest, 2022)~~  ~~Issues to be considered for the management and governance of fully virtual meetings and physical meetings with remote participation~~  ~~[…]~~ |

[~~COM5 Recommendation 2~~](https://www.itu.int/md/S22-PP-C-0189/en) ~~(see also~~ [~~TD68~~](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0068/en)~~):~~

|  |
| --- |
| ~~"In acknowledging the limitations imposed by the current requirements in~~ *~~recognizing e)~~* ~~of Resolution 167, the 2022 Plenipotentiary Conference recognizes the importance of ITU Members as well [as] chairmen of Study Group meetings which have remote participation, by considering the positions and proposals of remote participants in regard to the issues being discussed in the meeting and the importance of stable technical facilities."~~ |

1. **WTSA-20 and TSAG results related to "guidelines" as mentioned in Resolution 44**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| 44-13 | SGs and TSAG to consider including implementation guidelines for ITU‑T Recommendations where these could provide advice to assist developing countries in adopting them, with emphasis on Recommendations having regulatory and policy implications. (instructs TSBDir 9, instructs SGs + TSAG 2) | For RG-WM |

*Note: The following excerpts have NOT been modified by WTSA-20 as they were not addressed by any regional proposal. Consequently, they were already present in* [*Hammamet 2016*](https://www.itu.int/pub/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.44-2022) *(but the text on "guidelines" was different in* [*Dubai 2012*](https://www.itu.int/en/publications/ITU-T/pages/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.44-2012)*).*

|  |
| --- |
| [Resolution 44 (Rev. Geneva, 2022) - Bridging the standardization gap between developing and developed countries](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-RES/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.44-2022)  *instructs the Director of the Telecommunication Standardization Bureau, in collaboration with the Directors of the Radiocommunication Bureau and the Telecommunication Development Bureau*  within available resources,  9 to provide support and assistance to developing countries, if requested, in drafting/developing a set of guidelines on the application of ITU‑T Recommendations at the national level in order to enhance their participation in ITU‑T study groups, with the assistance of the ITU regional offices, for bridging the standardization gap;  13 to conduct workshops and seminars, as appropriate, for disseminating information and increasing understanding of new ITU-T Recommendations and implementation guidelines for Recommendations, in particular for developing countries;  *instructs study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector and the Telecommunication Standardization Advisory Group*  2 to consider including implementation guidelines for ITU‑T Recommendations where these could provide advice to assist developing countries in adopting them, with emphasis on Recommendations having regulatory and policy implications; |

***Comments by the RG-WM rapporteur****:*

1. *"instructs 9" seems to have been handle via the guideline document "*[*Towards the Establishment of a National Standardization Secretariat for ITU-T: Options and Guidelines*](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/gap/Documents/nss-rep-may.pdf)*".*
2. *"instructs 13" is addressing implementation guidelines. It is not clear how the TSB can develop such guidelines (but this is not an issue for RG-WM).*
3. *"instructs 2" is an* instruct *to study groups and TSAG, but the equivalent item in clause II.2 of the Annex (see below) is an "action to be performed by TSB with BDT cooperation". It is assumed that the only expectation from TSAG would be to include a clause in Rec. ITU‑T A.1 to recommend to study groups to "consider including implementation guidelines for ITU-T Recommendations".*

|  |
| --- |
| Annex (to Resolution 44 (Rev. Geneva, 2022))  **Action plan for the implementation of Resolution 123 (Rev. Dubai, 2018)  of the Plenipotentiary Conference**  **I Programme 1: Strengthening standards-making capabilities**  1) Objective  • To improve the standards-making capabilities of developing countries.  2) Activities  • Developing guidelines to assist developing countries in their involvement in ITU‑T activities, covering, but not limited to, ITU‑T working methods, formulating draft Questions and making proposals. […]  **II Programme 2: Assisting developing countries with respect to the application of standards**  1) Objective  • To assist developing countries in:  • Having a clear understanding of ITU‑T Recommendations;  • Enhancing the application of ITU‑T Recommendations in developing countries.  2) Activities  […]  • Actions to be performed by TSB with BDT cooperation:  • Developing guidelines on the application of ITU‑T Recommendations, in particular on manufactured products and interconnection, with emphasis on Recommendations having regulatory and policy implications. […] |

***Comment by the RG-WM rapporteur****: Item I.2 is more relevant to working methods because the guidelines intend to assist developing countries in their involvement in the work of study groups (but note that TSB developed the "*[*Online course on Rec. ITU-T A.1*](https://bsg-a1.itu.int/)*"). It is different from the technical guidelines mentioned in item II.2.*

*The following excerpts of TSAG reports are related to "Bridging the standardization gap":*

**Report of the first TSAG meeting held in Geneva, 1-4 May 2017:**

The meeting discussed three documents regarding the process for development of guidelines for Recommendations in the context of WTSA-16 Resolution 44: [TD27](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-170501-TD-GEN-0027) (SG11), [C.15](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0015/en) (United States), and [C.20](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0020/en) (Russian Federation).

The meeting concluded that there are two mechanisms for the development of Guidelines under WTSA Res. 44:

1. Study groups can develop implementation guidelines, where these could provide advice to assist developing countries in adopting ITU-T Recommendations, under WTSA-16 Resolution 44 *instructs 2 for Study Groups.* This would be on the basis of contributions to the study group concerned. The study group Chairman would convey the findings of the study group to the TSB Director;

b. Developing countries can send their requests directly to the TSB Director as per WTSA‑16 Resolution 44, *instructs 9 for the TSB Director*.

The meeting did not see any necessity to send a liaison statement to the study groups. TSAG encouraged developing countries to make full use of the options above. The TSB Director agreed also to conduct further consultation during the TDAG meeting in May 2017.

**Report of the third TSAG meeting (Geneva, 10-14 December 2018):**

* 1. Mr Charles Chike Asadu, University of Nigeria, Nigeria, remotely presented [C047](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0047) on the implementation of WTSA-16 Resolution 44. He raised the problem faced by some developed countries that find it difficult to understand Resolution 44 (Rev. Hammamet, 2016) and he raised the need for a top-down approach to better understand ITU-T Recommendations.
  2. TSAG agreed that this contribution be further discussed with the TSB Director, taking into account Resolution 123 (rev. Dubai, 2018) and the activities of ITU-D, and that the TSB Director provide information to the next TSAG meeting on this activity.

*The only proposal relevant to RG-WM in* [*C047*](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0047) *seems to be:*

1. that a new work item be introduced in the TSAG Work plan on production of guidelines on which ICT issues can be best championed by the High Level delegates;

*As noted in* [*TD610*](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-190923-TD-GEN-0610)*, the proposals presented in* [*C047*](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0047) *were discussed between TSB and the proponent in July 2019.*

**Report of the fourth TSAG meeting (Geneva, 23-27 September 2019):**

* 1. Mr Charles Chike Asadu, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, remotely presented [C047](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0047) "Implementation of WTSA-16 Resolution 44 and RESOLUTION 123 (Rev. DUBAI, 2018)".  He raised the problem faced by some developing countries that find it difficult to understand Resolution 44 (Rev. Hammamet, 2016) and he raised the need for a top-down approach to better understand ITU-T Recommendations, and that the lack of capacity to understand these Recommendations contributes to low implementations of the Recommendations.
  2. Mr Bilel Jamoussi, TSB, presented [TD610](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-190923-TD-GEN-0610) "Update on the Implementation of WTSA-16 Resolution 44", which provides an overview of the activities carried out under the purview of WTSA-16 Resolution 44.
  3. TSAG, observing the decreasing audio quality during Mr Asadu's presentation, took note of C047 and of TD610.

*The following guideline document is mentioned in* [*TD610*](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-190923-TD-GEN-0610)*:*

[Towards the Establishment of a National Standardization Secretariat for ITU-T: Options and Guidelines](https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/gap/Documents/nss-rep-may.pdf)

*It is also worth mentioning that Study Group 13:*

* has developed [ITU-T Technical Report TR-BSG](https://www.itu.int/pub/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-TUT-BSG-2020) "*Use of ITU-T Recommendations by developing countries*";
* holds Question 5 "Applying Future Networks and innovation in developing countries"

*and that Study Group 15:*

* is developing draft Supplement [L.Suppl.Administrations](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/workprog/wp_item.aspx?isn=18394) to guide administrations and governments on how to apply Rec. ITU T L.Enablement.

1. **Excerpts of WTSA-20 Resolution 70 related to "end-user needs"**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| 70-12 | TSAG to revise the guide for ITU study groups – 'considering end-user needs in developing Recommendations', and consider how SGs implement this guide (instructs TSAG 1, 2) | For RG-WM |

|  |
| --- |
| [Resolution 70 (Rev. Geneva, 2022) - Telecommunication/information and communication technology accessibility for persons with disabilities](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-RES/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.70-2022)  instructs the Telecommunication Standardization Advisory Group  1 to revise the guide for ITU study groups: Considering end-user needs in developing Recommendations;  2 to consider how study groups facilitate, in their respective work, the implementation of new software, services and proposals enabling all persons with disabilities and persons with specific needs to effectively use telecommunication/ICT services, and relevant guidelines for end‑user needs, in order specifically to include the needs of persons with disabilities and persons with specific needs, and to update the guide on a regular basis, based on contributions from Member States and Sector Members as well as the ITU‑T study groups, as appropriate, |

***Excerpt from the*** [*Report of the TSAG meeting held in Geneva (14-18 March 2005)*](https://www.itu.int/md/T05-TSAG-R-0001/en)***:***

***11.1.3*** *TSAG adopted the Guide for ITU-T SGs “Considering end-user needs in developing Recommendations” for use by the study groups on an experimental basis. The Guide is found in delayed D.8, Annex A.*

***11.1.4*** *TSAG approved a liaison to all ITU-T study groups, requesting they implement, on a voluntary basis, the Guide for considering end-user needs and they provide comments and feedback by the June 2006 TSAG meeting. The Guide, as proposed in TSAG D.8, Annex A, will be posted to each SG web site under “Guides, Tools and Templates.” The liaison is shown in report TSAG R-2, Annex 2.*

*NOTE – There is currently no section "Guides, Tools and Templates" on study groups' web pages. This Guide is not linked from the* [*ITU publications*](https://www.itu.int/en/publications/Pages/default.aspx) *web page but from the* [*ITU-T Guides*](https://www.itu.int/itudoc/itu-t/guide/) *web page (although this latter page claims to be under "*[Home Page](https://www.itu.int/home/) : [Publications](https://www.itu.int/publications/)*" at its top). Would it be useful to add a link to this Guide on each study group web page (next to the Author's Guide)?*

*Excerpt from the* [*Report of the meeting of WP1/TSAG (Working methods) (Geneva, 3-7 July 2006)*](https://www.itu.int/md/T05-TSAG-R-0013/en)*:*

***8. Considering End-User Needs in developing Recommendations***

[*TD/288*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T05-TSAG-060703-TD-GEN-0288) *was presented by the Working Party 1 Chairman. While a liaison statement was sent by TSAG at its March 2005 meeting requesting feedback by this meeting, a limited number of replies were received (from SG 16 and SG 19). However, it is recognized that this subject is of importance and has been underlined during the WSIS process.*

*Some Study Group Chairmen present confirmed that the user guide was noted and briefly reported on this issue. SG 12 Chairman made a distinction between implementing the user guide and commenting back. SG 12 has a strong link with the user needs, however the Chairman considers that the guide could benefit from simplification. A reference is made to* [*TD/255*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T05-TSAG-060703-TD-GEN-0255) *with a section on accessibility/usability. Study Group 4 is more concerned with a specific category of users that are the network operators. Study Group 13 received and integrated specific needs for users with disabilities. Study Group 2 considers user needs and, while having no comment at this time, suggests to reconsider this agenda item at the next TSAG meeting.*

*The Working Party 1 Chairman asks all Study Group Chairmen to remind their Study Groups to review the user guide and make use of it. This item will be reconsidered at the next TSAG meeting.*

*Excerpt from the* [*Report of WP1/TSAG (Working methods), Geneva, 26 Feb to 1 March 2007*](https://www.itu.int/md/T05-TSAG-R-0018/en)*:*

***5. Considering end-user needs in developing ITU-T Recommendations***

*Working Party 1/TSAG considered three documents (TD/*[*323*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T05-TSAG-070226-TD-GEN-0323)*,* [*335*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T05-TSAG-070226-TD-GEN-0335) *and* [*364*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T05-TSAG-070226-TD-GEN-0364)*, § 2) from Study Groups 11 and 16. The documents were noted, in particular the TSAG end user needs document would need to be updated according to the information provided in TD/*[*335*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T05-TSAG-070226-TD-GEN-0335) *(from SG 16). The current version of this document was made available on the web page of each ITU-T study group.*

*Working Party 1/TSAG is asking TSAG to replace the last paragraph of the scope by:*

*“It is also important to draw reference to the work initiated and being undertaken by Study Group 16 (Recommendation F.790, Telecommunications accessibility guidelines for older persons and persons with disabilities and the Technical Paper, Telecommunications accessibility checklist). The checklist is a short document aimed at assisting study groups in ensuring that accessibility material is included in Recommendations where appropriate. Although this guide and Recommendation F.790 cater to different audiences (the former aimed at study groups; the latter at standards makers, manufacturers, network operators and regulators), it is recognised that the two address the same broad theme. Every effort should be made to ensure the documents are complementary and consistent.”*

*NOTE – This has been done (although the* [*web page*](https://www.itu.int/itudoc/itu-t/guide/end-user.html) *states that the Guide was posted 30 March 2005, hence two years before!). This Guide was not discussed further at the* [*3-7 Dec 2007 meeting of TSAG*](https://www.itu.int/md/T05-TSAG-R-0023/en) *(the last in the study period).*

*The guide "*[*Considering end-user needs in developing Recommendations*](https://www.itu.int/itudoc/itu-t/guide/end-user.html)*" has not been updated since 2007. Some of the information and references it contains are outdated.*

*Most of the TSB counsellors are not aware of this Guide, so it is doubtful that study groups are still using it.*

1. **TSAG results related to WTSA Resolution 80**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TSAG action plan** ([TD65R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0065/en), [TD191](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0191/en)) | | |
| 80-02 | TSAG to establish criteria that guide study groups options on how to clearly acknowledge contributors (instructs TSAG) | For RG-WM |

|  |
| --- |
| [Resolution 80 (Dubai, 2012; Rev. Hammamet, 2016) - Acknowledging the active involvement of the membership in the development of ITU Telecommunication](https://www.itu.int/pub/T-RES/publications.aspx?lang=en&parent=T-RES-T.80-2022)  instructs the Telecommunication Standardization Advisory Group  to establish criteria that guide study groups to clearly acknowledge contributors to the development of study group deliverables, |

### Report of the first TSAG meeting held in Geneva, 4-7 June 2013:

### 8.1.13 WTSA Resolution 80 (Acknowledging the active involvement of the membership in the development of ITU-T deliverables)

TSAG agreed to task ITU-T SG9, in consultation with the other study groups, to explore various mechanisms to implement WTSA Resolution 80 (Dubai, 2012), using contribution C.18 (Brazil) as a basis, and to report back to TSAG.

**Report of the second TSAG meeting held in Geneva, 17-20 June 2014:**

7.7.5TSAG agreed that ITU-T SG9 implement on a trial basis the four proposals put forward by the ITU-T SG9 Chairman to acknowledge the active involvement of the membership in the development of ITU-T deliverables:

* Encourage the use of bibliography references to peer-reviewed publications which support technical decision made in ITU-T Recommendations.
* List ITU-T Recommendations within e.g. IEEE Xplore, Web of Science (cost for both), Google Scholar (free).
* On the study group’s webpage, create a page for each Study Period that acknowledges all participants (i.e., chairs, rapporteurs, editors, contributors, attendees).
* On the publication page of a given ITU-T Recommendation, create a page which lists the authors who did submit at least one Contribution that was accepted to progress the Recommendation.

TSAG encouraged ITU-T SG9 to continue studying additional methods through the e-mail reflector and report back to TSAG 2015.

**Report of the third TSAG meeting held in Geneva, 2-5 June 2015:**

# 26 Publications

The chairman of ITU-T Study Group 9, Mr Arthur Webster (USA), presented [TD276(Rev.3)](http://www.itu.int/md/T13-TSAG-150602-TD-GEN-0276/en) with a progress report in the pilot implementation of WTSA Resolution 80 in ITU-T SG9. TSAG agreed that ITU-T SG9 continue with the trial; other study groups are welcome to join the trial, in particular with respect to item 1 (encourage the use of bibliography references to peer-reviewed publications which support technical decisions made in ITU-T Recommendations) and item 3 (on the Study Group’s webpage, create a page for each study period that acknowledges, per meeting, all participants (i.e., chairmen, rapporteurs, editors, contributors, attendees)). Items 2 and 4 are still under discussion.

**Report of the fourth TSAG meeting held in Geneva, 1-5 February 2016:**

13.4 TSAG Rapporteur Group on Working Methods

13.4.7 TSAG agreed that the trial in ITU-T SG9 of acknowledging the development of study group deliverables be rolled out to other ITU-T study groups who would then have the following options:

* to encourage the use of bibliography references to peer-reviewed publications that support technical decisions made in ITU-T Recommendations;
* to create a study group's web page for each study period that acknowledges, per meeting, all participants, see for example the pilot page developed by SG9   
  <http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/studygroups/2013-2016/09/Pages/acknowledgements.aspx>;
* on the publication page of a given ITU-T Recommendation, to add a link to a page that lists the contributors who submitted at least one contribution that helped progress the Recommendation.

**Report of the fifth TSAG meeting held in Geneva, 18-22 July 2016:**

20.2.4 TSAG did not agree to the additional proposals developed in [TD 618](http://www.itu.int/md/T13-TSAG-160718-TD-GEN-0618/en) by ITU-T SG9 related to WTSA Resolution 80 “Acknowledging the active involvement of the membership in the development of ITU-T deliverables”. The agreement reached by TSAG at its 1-5 February 2016 meeting (documented in [TD 460Rev1](http://www.itu.int/md/T13-TSAG-160201-TD-GEN-0460/en)) continues to be valid. The changes proposed to WTSA Resolution 80 documented in [TD 592](http://www.itu.int/md/T13-TSAG-160718-TD-GEN-0592/en) also need further reflection.

*Resolution 80 has not been discussed by TSAG in the 2017-2020 study period.*

1. **~~TSAG results related to A.SupplRA~~**

[~~Report of TSAG RG-WM meeting, 12 & 13 Jan 2022~~](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-220110-TD-GEN-1182/en)~~:~~

~~Abstract: TSAG agreed to establish a new work item A.SupplRA with A.13 justification in~~ [~~TD1318R1~~](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-220110-TD-GEN-1318) ~~and draft base text in~~ [~~TD1317R1~~](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-220110-TD-GEN-1317)~~.~~

~~Agenda item 9:~~ [~~TD393~~](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T09-TSAG-120702-TD-GEN-0393) ~~of~~~~the final TSAG meeting of the 2009-2012 study period was identified during the RG-SC meeting on Tuesday 11 January 2022 to be picked up and continued to advance in the work.~~

~~RGWM meeting on Wednesday 12 January 2022 agreed to establish a new work item to develop a new supplement~~ *~~A.supplxx - Guidelines on the appointment and operations of registration authorities~~* ~~to the A-series Recommendation, with Mr. Olivier Dubuisson, Orange, designated as its editor and aimed approval in next TSAG meeting after WTSA in 2022.~~

1. **~~TSAG results related to SG17 incubation mechanism~~**

[~~Report of the TSAG RG-WM interim e-meetings on 20-21 October and 8-9 December 2020~~](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-210111-TD-GEN-0952/en)~~:~~

* [~~TD903~~](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-200921-TD-GEN-0903) ~~LS on Incubation mechanism in SG17 [from ITU-T SG17]~~

~~SG17 Chairman presented this SG17 liaison statement to TSAG, with a brief introduction of the SG17 Technical Paper TP.inno~~ *~~‘Description of the incubation mechanism and ways to improve it’~~* ~~and proposes TSAG to consider it as a normative procedure to A series Recommendation.~~

***~~Discussion:~~***

~~It was questioned, although TP.inno had been approved by SG17 by agreement in its Sept 2020 meeting, whether ‘Technical Paper’ is the right type of document to publish such an ITU internal working method.~~

~~It was recommended for 1~~~~st~~ ~~TSAG meeting after WTSA-20 to consider this innovation of ITU-T working method and possibly to establish a new work item for A-series Recommendation.~~

~~Report of the meeting of RG-WM "Working methods" (Geneva, 30 May, 31 May and 1 June 2023) (~~[~~TD184~~](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0184/en)~~):~~

~~The discussion on the incubation mechanism occurs in RG-IEM. It would come back to RG-WM if there is a need to develop a working method.~~

1. **TSAG results related to Supplement A Suppl. 5 "Guidelines for collaboration and exchange of information with other organizations"**

Report of the second meeting of the Telecommunication Standardization Advisory Group (Geneva, 30 May - 2 June 2023) ([TSAG-R2](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-R-0002/en)):

TSAG agreed to instruct its representatives to the IEC SMB/ISO TMB/ITU-T TSAG SPCG, taking Rec. ITU-T A.23 and ITU-T A-series Supplement 5 into consideration, to initiate internal consultations towards developing a proposal for a collaboration mechanism or guidelines between ITU-T study groups, and ISO or IEC Technical Committees respectively, and to report back on progress to the next TSAG meeting. (ref. action RG-WM-4)

This action is related to contribution [C23](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0023) from Korea (Rep. of) which invited the ISO Technical Management Board (TMB) and the IEC Standardization Management Board (SMB) to establish a collaboration process including developing a corresponding document in the form of ISO/IEC JTC 1 Standing Document 3 and ITU-T A.Suppl.5 to facilitate standardization collaboration between ITU T and ISO, and between ITU‑T and IEC.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_