

PARTNERSHIP ON MEASURING ICT FOR DEVELOPMENT

# FINAL WSIS TARGETS REVIEW

ACHIEVEMENTS, CHALLENGES AND  
THE WAY FORWARD





PARTNERSHIP ON MEASURING ICT FOR DEVELOPMENT

# FINAL WSIS TARGETS REVIEW

ACHIEVEMENTS, CHALLENGES AND  
THE WAY FORWARD



© 2014 ITU

International Telecommunication Union  
Place des Nations  
CH-1211 Geneva Switzerland

Original language of publication: English.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of the International Telecommunication Union.

# Forewords

---



*“Over the last decade, ICTs have fundamentally improved the way we live, work and communicate. The achievements made since the World Summit on the Information Society are many. This report highlights the importance of providing universal and affordable access to ICTs to enable and accelerate economic, social and sustainable growth and development for everyone. ITU remains committed to connecting the world and to helping track achievements, monitor challenges and identify forward-looking targets for a better world.”*

Dr Hamadoun I. Touré  
Secretary-General  
International Telecommunication Union



*“Education stands at the heart of the global development agenda – it is also the focus of two of the 10 WSIS targets. At this time of change, when all societies are seeking new sources of dynamism, we must harness the power of new information and communication technologies to reach the unreached and to enhance the quality of learning, inside and outside the classroom and throughout life. Building inclusive knowledge societies requires crafting the right ecosystems for making the most of new technologies, through teacher training, through media literacy, and through a focus on new skills and competencies.”*

Irina Bokova  
Director-General  
United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization



*“The demand for data on the information economy continues to expand as countries seek to leverage new information and communications technologies for their economic and social development. UNCTAD is proud of being a founding member of the Partnership on Measuring ICT for Development, and is committed to contributing to the further improvement of the availability of internationally comparable data in this area. This publication makes a valuable assessment of the current state of play with regard to the measurement of the progress towards the targets set by world leaders at the World Summit on the Information Society. It is hoped that the recommendations made will provide a sound basis for future advancements in ICT measurement.”*

Mukhisa Kituyi  
Secretary-General  
United Nations Conference on Trade and Development



# Forewords

---



*“Latin America and the Caribbean have made clear commitments to reducing the digital divide and fostering an inclusive information society. Although we have achieved several economic and social improvements in the last decade, sustaining these improvements poses major challenges to reorienting our development agenda. ICTs play a major role within this context and could help us achieve our goals for greater equality, social inclusion, economic development and environmental sustainability.”*

Alicia Bárcena  
Executive Secretary  
Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean



*“Reaching all people with high-quality, affordable health services is our aim, and ICT is critical in this effort. The connected world has already brought profound changes to the health sector, even as a new era of services, such as mobile health, is emerging. And it is clear that although countries have made impressive advances in eHealth, much work remains. WHO is pleased to join forces with ITU, governments and other stakeholders to address the challenges ahead.”*

Dr Margaret Chan  
Director-General  
World Health Organization



*“The deadlines for achieving the MDGs and the WSIS targets are approaching, and it will be important to seek closer integration of ICT and development issues in the post-2015 development agenda. This should focus on utilizing ICT in service of sustainable development, for instance by transforming governance to better serve public policy through policy-driven electronic governance (EGOV). It should also ensure that extensive use of ICT does not hinder progress towards these goals, for instance through promoting the sustainable production and environmentally-sound recycling and management of e-waste. UNU is committed to supporting the UN system on e-waste, EGOV, and other critical ICT issues in the post-2015 era through policy-focused research and capacity development.”*

Dr David M. Malone  
Rector  
United Nations University  
and  
Under-Secretary-General  
United Nations





# Acknowledgements

---

The report *Final WSIS Targets Review – Achievements, challenges and the way forward* was prepared by the *Partnership* and its Task Group on WSIS (TG-WSIS), under the coordination of the International Telecommunication Union.

The members of the *Partnership* are the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), the Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD), the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA), the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) Institute for Statistics (UIS), the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) Secretariat of the Basel Convention (SBC), the United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS), the UN Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA), the UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (UNECLAC), the UN Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP), the UN Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (UNESCWA), Eurostat, and the World Bank.

The members of the *Partnership* TG-WSIS are the DEN Foundation, ITU, MAAYA, OECD, UIS, UNCTAD, UNDESA, UNECA, UNECLAC, UNESCAP, UNESCWA, United Nations University (UNU), UPU and the World Health Organization (WHO).

The lead contributing agencies of the report are:

- UNECLAC – Introduction
- ITU – Chapters on targets 1, 3, 4, 8, 9 and 10
- UIS – Chapters on targets 2 and 7
- WHO – Chapter on Target 5
- UNDESA – Chapter on Target 6
- UNCTAD – Chapter on ICTs in businesses (proposed Target 11)
- Center for Electronic Governance, UNU-IIST – Conclusions and way forward.

The *Partnership* is grateful to a large number of contributors from within and outside the TG-WSIS who have collaborated in the preparation of this report:

The introduction was prepared by Jorge Patino from UNECLAC. The chapters on targets 1, 3, 8 and 10 were prepared by Han Ei Chew, consultant to ITU, with input from Tiziana Bonapace and Remi Lang (UNESCAP) on targets 1 and 3. The chapters on targets 2 and 7 were authored by Peter Wallet (UIS) with the statistical support of Beatriz Valdez Melgar (UIS). Substantive inputs and comments were also provided by Martin Schaaper (UIS). The chapter on Target 4 was prepared by Lisa Kreuzenbeck (ITU), Jose Anson and Paul Donohoe (Universal Postal Union, UPU), Stuart Hamilton (the International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions, IFLA), Marco de Niet and Gerhard Jan Nauta (DEN Foundation), with input from Makane Faye (UNECA). The chapter on Target 5 was prepared by WHO, in particular Misha Kay, with input from Joan Dzenowagis (WHO) and Elettra Ronchi (OECD). The chapter on Target 6 was prepared by Seema Hafeez from UNDESA. The chapter on Target 9 was prepared by David Souter, consultant to ITU, with input from Matthew Zook of ZookNIC. The chapter on ICTs in businesses was prepared by Scarlett Fondeur-Gil (UNCTAD) and the last chapter, Conclusions and way

forward, was prepared by Elsa Estevez and Tomasz Janowski (Center for Electronic Governance, UNU-IIST), with input from Vanessa Gray (ITU). In addition, Vanessa Gray, Susan Teltscher, Lisa Kreuzenbeck, Ivan Vallejo and Esperanza Magpantay from ITU provided substantive input and comments on the entire report.

The preparation of the report was coordinated by Vanessa Gray, ITU ICT Data and Statistics Division, under the supervision of Susan Teltscher, Head, ICT Data and Statistics Division. ITU's contribution was carried out under the overall direction of Cosmas Zavazava, Chief, Project Support and Knowledge Management Department, Telecommunication Development Bureau.

The report was substantively edited by Sheridan Roberts, consultant to ITU.

The cover was designed by Aram Melikyan from ITU.

The report features data collected by the *Partnership* TG-WSIS in 2013 through its 2013 WSIS targets questionnaire. The following agencies participated in the data collection: Eurostat, OECD, UNCTAD, UNECA, UNECLAC, UNESCAP and UNESCWA. The *Partnership* also appreciates the cooperation of those countries that responded to the questionnaire: Australia, Azerbaijan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, Brazil, Bulgaria, Burundi, Cambodia, Canada, Chile, Colombia, Congo, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Estonia, Fiji, Finland, Gambia, Georgia, Iran (I.R.), Israel, Japan, Jordan, Kazakhstan, Lao P.D.R., Latvia, Lebanon, Lesotho, Lithuania, Maldives, Mexico, Moldova, Nauru, Nepal, Niger, Nigeria, Norway, Oman, Peru, Philippines, Portugal, Romania, Senegal, Serbia, Singapore, Slovenia, Spain, Switzerland, Thailand, Turkey, United Arab Emirates, Uruguay, Venezuela, Viet Nam and Yemen.

# Table of contents

---

- Foreword ..... iii
- Acknowledgements ..... vii
- Table of contents ..... ix
- List of boxes ..... xiii
- List of charts ..... xv
- List of figures ..... xviii
- List of tables ..... xix
- Introduction ..... 1
  - Background on the WSIS and the WSIS targets ..... 1
  - WSIS monitoring and evaluation ..... 2
  - About the final quantitative assessment report on the WSIS targets ..... 4
  - List of references ..... 7
  - Endnotes ..... 7
- Target 1: Connect all villages with ICTs and establish community access points ..... 9
  - Executive summary ..... 9
  - Introduction ..... 11
  - Data availability and scope ..... 13
  - Re-thinking the 'build-it-and-they-will-come' assumption ..... 16
  - Indicators to track WSIS Target 1 ..... 17
  - Achievements against Target 1 ..... 18
  - Conclusions and recommendations ..... 42
  - List of references ..... 46
  - Endnotes ..... 48
- Target 2: Connect all secondary schools and primary schools with ICTs ..... 51
  - Executive summary ..... 51
  - Introduction ..... 53
  - Data availability and scope ..... 54
  - Indicators to track WSIS Target 2 ..... 56
  - Achievements against Target 2 ..... 58
  - Conclusions and recommendations ..... 74
  - List of references ..... 78
  - Endnotes ..... 81
- Target 3: Connect all scientific and research centres with ICTs ..... 83
  - Executive summary ..... 83

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Introduction .....   | 85  |
| Data availability and scope .....  | 90  |
| Achievements against Target 3.....   | 91  |
| Conclusions and recommendations.....   | 106 |
| Annex 3.1: List of known NRENs by end 2013 .....   | 109 |
| Annex 3.2: Regional or NREN consortia and their members by end 2013 .....  | 111 |
| List of references.....  | 112 |
| Target 4: Connect all public libraries, museums, post offices and national archives with ICTs.....   | 117 |
| Executive summary .....  | 117 |
| Introduction .....   | 118 |
| Achievements against Target 4.....   | 120 |
| Conclusions and recommendations.....   | 143 |
| List of references.....  | 146 |
| Endnotes .....   | 148 |
| Target 5: Connect all health centres and hospitals with ICTs .....   | 151 |
| Executive summary .....  | 151 |
| Introduction .....   | 153 |
| Availability of data and scope .....   | 155 |
| Achievements against Target 5.....   | 156 |
| Alternative approaches to measurement of Target 5 .....  | 159 |
| Extending our understanding of eHealth.....  | 164 |
| Conclusions and recommendations.....   | 167 |
| List of references.....  | 170 |
| Endnotes .....   | 171 |
| Target 6: Connect all central government departments and establish websites .....  | 173 |
| Executive summary .....  | 173 |
| Introduction .....   | 175 |
| WSIS Target 6: framework and scope of review.....  | 176 |
| Data availability and scope .....  | 180 |
| Achievements against Target 6.....   | 181 |
| Conclusions and recommendations.....   | 196 |
| List of references.....  | 198 |
| Endnotes .....   | 199 |
| Target 7: Adapt all primary and secondary school curricula to meet the challenges of the information society, taking into account national circumstances ..... | 201 |
| Executive summary .....  | 201 |
| Introduction .....   | 204 |
| Relating WSIS action lines to other international frameworks.....  | 205 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Data availability and scope .....   | 207 |
| Indicators to track WSIS Target 7 .....   | 211 |
| Achievements against Target 7 .....   | 212 |
| Conclusions and recommendations .....   | 229 |
| List of references .....  | 233 |
| Endnotes .....  | 235 |
| Target 8: Ensure that all of the world’s population has access to television and radio services.....  | 237 |
| Executive summary .....   | 237 |
| Introduction .....  | 239 |
| Availability of data and scope .....  | 241 |
| Evolving definitions for Target 8 .....   | 242 |
| Achievements against Target 8 .....   | 244 |
| Conclusions and recommendations .....   | 263 |
| List of references .....  | 266 |
| Endnotes .....  | 268 |
| Target 9: Encourage the development of content and put in place technical conditions in order to facilitate the presence and use of all world languages on the Internet ..... | 271 |
| Executive summary .....   | 271 |
| Introduction .....  | 273 |
| Definitions and challenges of measurement .....   | 276 |
| Developments since WSIS .....   | 279 |
| Data availability and scope .....   | 282 |
| Achievements against Target 9 .....   | 285 |
| Conclusions and recommendations .....   | 314 |
| List of references .....  | 319 |
| Endnotes .....  | 321 |
| Target 10: Ensure that more than half the world’s inhabitants have access to ICTs within their reach and make use of them.....  | 327 |
| Executive summary .....   | 327 |
| Introduction .....  | 329 |
| Data availability and scope .....   | 332 |
| Achievements against Target 10 .....  | 333 |
| Conclusions and recommendations .....   | 355 |
| List of references .....  | 358 |
| Endnotes .....  | 360 |
| Proposed Target 11: Connect all businesses with ICTs .....  | 363 |
| Executive summary .....   | 363 |
| Introduction .....  | 365 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Data availability and scope .....             | 368 |
| Achievements against proposed Target 11 ..... | 369 |
| Conclusions and recommendations.....          | 373 |
| List of references.....                       | 375 |
| Endnotes .....                                | 376 |
| Conclusions and way forward .....             | 377 |
| Executive summary .....                       | 377 |
| Introduction .....                            | 381 |
| ICT4D – policy, research and impact.....      | 381 |
| Measuring WSIS targets.....                   | 388 |
| ICT4D, WSIS and post-2015 development .....   | 396 |
| List of references.....                       | 405 |
| Endnotes .....                                | 409 |

# List of boxes

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Box 0.1: Amended WSIS targets.....   | 2   |
| Box 0.2: Call for follow-up process in WSIS documents.....   | 3   |
| Box 1.1: Users of rural public access centres – a case from Bangladesh .....                             | 14  |
| Box 1.2: Infolady – a women-centred programme to deliver information services in rural Bangladesh .....  | 15  |
| Box 1.3: The Mexican village that got itself talking.....  | 16  |
| Box 1.4: An Information-communication revolution in the Pacific.....                                     | 20  |
| Box 1.5: Emerging technologies provide mobile coverage in rural Congo .....                              | 24  |
| Box 1.6: Internet-based applications for rural populations in Africa .....                               | 34  |
| Box 2.1: Setting targets for integrating ICT in education – regional and national level examples .....   | 58  |
| Box 2.2: Connecting schools through interactive TV-assisted instruction in a remote state in Brazil..... | 60  |
| Box 2.3. Implementing 1:1 computing through low cost laptops and tablets – costs versus benefits.....    | 65  |
| Box 2.4: Progress towards increasing access to ICT in Colombia.....                                      | 68  |
| Box 2.5: Georgia improves access to digital technology – the Deer Leap programme.....                    | 69  |
| Box 2.6: Partnering to connect schools in Chile: The Enlaces initiative .....                            | 74  |
| Box 3.1: World's first intercontinental 100 Gbit/s link for R&E demonstrated .....                       | 89  |
| Box 3.2: Research and education networks in Asia and the Pacific .....                                   | 97  |
| Box 3.3: AfricaConnect – a regional Internet network for research and education in Africa .....          | 100 |
| Box 3.4: CamREN – Connecting Cambodian researchers to the rest of the world .....                        | 101 |
| Box 3.5: Caribbean NRENs and tertiary education.....   | 105 |
| Box 4.1: The Economic Commission for Africa’s digital institutional repository .....                     | 121 |
| Box 4.2: Global Libraries program .....  | 126 |
| Box 4.3: Red de Bibliotecas project in Medellín, Colombia .....  | 127 |
| Box 4.4: Connecting cultural heritage across countries and continents.....                               | 133 |
| Box 4.5: Kitsong centres offering access to ICTs in Botswana .....                                       | 140 |
| Box 5.1: Use of ICT for women’s and children’s health – CoIA recommendations and key findings.....       | 165 |
| Box 6.1: The Task Group on e-Government (TGEG).....  | 177 |
| Box 6.2: Developing indicators for the WSIS target on e-government .....                                 | 178 |
| Box 6.3: Electronic governance for sustainable development research .....                                | 179 |
| Box 6.4: Stages of e-government in the UN E-Government Readiness Survey.....                             | 191 |
| Box 7.1: The six <i>Education for All</i> (EFA) goals.....   | 206 |
| Box 7.2: Singapore’s Third Masterplan for ICT in Education (MP3) .....                                   | 207 |
| Box 7.3: The disconnection between ICT policy, infrastructure and use – evidence from PISA, 2009.....    | 209 |
| Box 7.4: Monitoring targets for adapting school curricula to the information society – Asia .....        | 212 |
| Box 7.5: Increasing ICT skills among teachers in Oman to match evolving curricula.....                   | 216 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Box 7.6: Training teachers to be effective change agents – the VLE in Malaysian schools .....              | 218 |
| Box 7.7: Enhancing teaching and learning using computer-assisted instruction in Bangladesh .....           | 224 |
| Box 7.8: Uruguay’s El Ceibal Project – Internet-assisted instruction using mobile XO laptop computers .... | 227 |
| Box 7.9: The Jordan Education Initiative (JEI) – Preparing learners for the information society.....       | 229 |
| Box 8.1: Community radio and development .....   | 241 |
| Box 8.2: Community radio and the preservation of culture .....   | 247 |
| Box 8.3: How television is improving literacy through same-language-subtitling.....                        | 249 |
| Box 8.4: Means of receiving TV in the European Union, 2006–2013.....                                       | 254 |
| Box 10.1: Use is just as important as access – a case study from the OLPC program.....                     | 330 |
| Box 10.2: Limitations of data on mobile-cellular telephone subscriptions.....                              | 335 |
| Box 10.3: Mobile phones in the Pacific Islands developing countries .....                                  | 339 |
| Box 10.4: Access to mobile phones can improve governance .....   | 340 |
| Box 10.5: Decline in fixed-telephone subscriptions .....   | 344 |
| Box 10.6: Growth of mobile Internet in Zimbabwe .....  | 353 |
| Box 11.1: The C7 action line business components .....   | 365 |
| Box 11.2: ICT and business statistics in UNCTAD .....  | 367 |
| Box 11.3. The case for data on business mobile phone use – mobile money in the EAC.....                    | 373 |
| Box 12.1: Joint Statement – UNGIS on Post-2015 Development Agenda.....                                     | 383 |
| Box 12.2: Analysis of ICT4D research .....   | 385 |
| Box 12.3: Examples of ICT contributions to MDGs.....   | 387 |
| Box 12.4: Learning from the MDGs and the Sustainable Development Agenda .....                              | 393 |
| Box 12.5: Open Working Group on the Sustainable Development Goals.....                                     | 398 |



# List of charts

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Chart 1.1: Rural population covered by a mobile cellular signal, by region, 2003–2012.....             | 19  |
| Chart 1.2: Rural population covered by a 3G mobile cellular signal, 2009–2012 .....                    | 22  |
| Chart 1.3: Households with any telephone access, by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011 .....            | 25  |
| Chart 1.4: Households with fixed phone only, by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011.....                 | 26  |
| Chart 1.5: Households with mobile telephone only, by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011 .....           | 28  |
| Chart 1.6: Rural households by fixed phone only and mobile phone only, 2012/2011.....                  | 29  |
| Chart 1.7: Households with both fixed and mobile telephone by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011.....   | 30  |
| Chart 1.8: Households with any Internet access by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011 .....              | 32  |
| Chart 1.9: Households with narrowband access by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011 .....                | 35  |
| Chart 1.10: Households with fixed broadband access by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011.....           | 36  |
| Chart 1.11: Households with mobile broadband access by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011 .....         | 37  |
| Chart 1.12: Individuals using the Internet by rural/urban difference, 2012/2011 .....                  | 39  |
| Chart 2.1: Schools with radio/television used for educational purposes, 2012 or LYA .....              | 62  |
| Chart 2.2: Learner-to-computer ratios, national aggregate/schools with CAI, 2012 or LYA.....           | 66  |
| Chart 2.3: Schools with total and fixed broadband Internet, 2012 or LYA .....                          | 72  |
| Chart 3.1: Status of national broadband plans and NRENS, 2013 .....                                    | 106 |
| Chart 4.1: Public libraries with broadband Internet access/a web presence, 2013 or LYA .....           | 124 |
| Chart 4.2: Museums with broadband Internet access/a web presence, 2013 or LYA.....                     | 129 |
| Chart 4.3: Accessibility of digital objects in museums, selected access channels, Europe, 2013 .....   | 131 |
| Chart 4.4: Post offices providing Internet/with broadband Internet, by level of development, 2012..... | 134 |
| Chart 4.5: Post offices with broadband Internet access, by country, 2012 .....                         | 135 |
| Chart 4.6: Post offices providing public Internet access, by country, 2012 .....                       | 136 |
| Chart 4.7: Post offices providing public Internet access, by region, 2005–07 and 2010–12 .....         | 138 |
| Chart 4.8: Post offices providing Internet access, top performing countries, 2005–07 and 2010–12 ..... | 139 |
| Chart 5.1: Hospitals with Internet access, by quartile, 2013 .....                                     | 156 |
| Chart 5.2: Public health centres with Internet access, by quartile, 2013 .....                         | 158 |
| Chart 5.3: Health-related institutions, access to HINARI, low income countries.....                    | 161 |
| Chart 5.4: Health-related institutions, access to HINARI, low–middle income countries.....             | 162 |
| Chart 5.5: Growth in number of HINARI institutions, 2003–2013 .....                                    | 163 |
| Chart 6.1: Countries without a central government web presence, 2003–2014.....                         | 186 |
| Chart 6.2: National website links to regional/local governments, by region, 2014.....                  | 187 |
| Chart 6.3: Official website scores, largest city, top 100 most wired countries, 2003–2011.....         | 188 |
| Chart 6.4: Nigeria, e-government at the state level, 2013.....   | 189 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Chart 6.5: Trends in progress in e-government development, 2003–2014 .....                             | 190 |
| Chart 6.6: Countries providing information by e-mail or RSS, and SMS, 2014 .....                       | 192 |
| Chart 6.7: Integrated approaches in e-government, 2003–2012 .....                                      | 193 |
| Chart 6.8: Countries providing transactional e-services, 2014 .....                                    | 195 |
| Chart 6.9: Connected e-services, 2014.....   | 196 |
| Chart 7.1: ICT-qualified teachers versus those trained to teach using ICT, 2012 or LYA .....           | 215 |
| Chart 7.2: Teachers trained to teach using ICT versus those teaching using ICT, 2012 or LYA.....       | 217 |
| Chart 7.3: Schools with computer-assisted instruction (CAI) and computer labs, 2012 or LYA .....       | 222 |
| Chart 7.4: Schools with Internet-assisted instruction (IAI) versus Internet access, 2012 or LYA.....   | 226 |
| Chart 8.1: Households with radio, 2012 or 2011 .....   | 245 |
| Chart 8.2: Households with a TV, by region, 2008–2012 .....  | 248 |
| Chart 8.3: Households with a TV, by level of development, 2008–2012 .....                              | 249 |
| Chart 8.4: Households with multichannel television, by region, 2008–2012 .....                         | 252 |
| Chart 8.5: Households with multichannel TV, by technology, 2008–2012 .....                             | 253 |
| Chart 8.6: Households with digital CATV, by region, 2008–2012 .....                                    | 256 |
| Chart 8.7: Households with analogue CATV, by region, 2008–2012.....                                    | 257 |
| Chart 8.8: Households with DTH satellite TV, by region, 2008–2012 .....                                | 258 |
| Chart 8.9: Households with IPTV, by region, 2008–2012.....   | 260 |
| Chart 8.10: Households with only DTT, by region, 2008–2012 .....                                       | 262 |
| Chart 9.1: Netcraft estimates, total websites, millions of hostnames and active sites, 1995–2013 ..... | 280 |
| Chart 9.2: Individuals using the Internet, 2000–2012, percentage.....                                  | 286 |
| Chart 9.3: Estimated online language populations, percentage of global online population.....          | 288 |
| Chart 9.4: Growth in daily Google searches, 2007–2013, millions of searches .....                      | 290 |
| Chart 9.5: The balance between gTLD and ccTLD registrations in world regions, 2013 .....               | 292 |
| Chart 9.6: Total domain registrations (thousands), 2003–2013, leading Internet countries .....         | 295 |
| Chart 9.7: Total domain registrations (thousands), 2003–2013, developing countries .....               | 295 |
| Chart 9.8: Types of IDN, 2010–2013, registrations, thousands.....                                      | 299 |
| Chart 9.9: Number and type of IDN, leading countries, 2013, thousands .....                            | 299 |
| Chart 9.10: Wikipedia articles – total and English language, 2003–2013, thousand articles .....        | 301 |
| Chart 9.11: Distribution of Wikipedia articles by language, 2003–2013.....                             | 302 |
| Chart 9.12: Linguistic density of Wikipedia contributors, December 2013 .....                          | 303 |
| Chart 9.13: Wikipedia unique visitors by country/region, 2008–2013, million pageviews .....            | 304 |
| Chart 9.14: Wikipedia monthly pageviews (millions), leading languages, December 2013 .....             | 304 |
| Chart 9.15: Wikipedia contributors, articles and pageviews, leading languages, December 2013 .....     | 305 |
| Chart 9.16: Wikipedia monthly pageviews per person/per Internet user, by region, Jan–Mar 2014 .....    | 306 |
| Chart 9.17: Wikipedia monthly pageviews per person/per Internet user, countries, Jan–Mar 2014 .....    | 306 |
| Chart 9.18: Growth in Facebook monthly active users, 2004–2013, millions of users.....                 | 311 |

Chart 9.19: Geocoded origin of a sample of 2 billion tweets, 2013, million tweets ..... 313

Chart 10.1: Global ICT development, 2003–2013 ..... 334

Chart 10.2: Global mobile-cellular subscriptions, 2003–2013 ..... 336

Chart 10.3: Mobile-cellular subscriptions, by level of development, 2003–2013 ..... 337

Chart 10.4: Number of mobile-cellular subscriptions, by region, 2003–2013 ..... 338

Chart 10.5: Mobile-cellular penetration, by region, 2003–2013 ..... 340

Chart 10.6: Households with any telephone access, 2012 or 2011 ..... 342

Chart 10.7: Households by type of phone access, 2012 or 2011 ..... 343

Chart 10.8: Mobile telephone users versus mobile-cellular subscriptions, 2012 or 2011 ..... 345

Chart 10.9: Global Internet users, 2003–2013 ..... 347

Chart 10.10: Internet users, by level of development, 2003–2013 ..... 347

Chart 10.11: Internet users, by region, 2003–2013 ..... 348

Chart 10.12: Households with Internet access, by region, 2003–2013 ..... 349

Chart 10.13: Households with Internet access, by level of development, 2003–2013 ..... 350

Chart 10.14: Households with access to the Internet, by type of access, 2012 or 2011 ..... 351

Chart 10.15: Fixed (wired)-broadband subscriptions, 2003–2013 ..... 352

Chart 10.16: Wireless-broadband subscriptions, 2007–2013 ..... 352

Chart 10.17: Fixed (wired)-broadband subscriptions, by level of development, 2003–2013 ..... 354

Chart 10.18: Wireless broadband penetration, by level of development, 2007–2013 ..... 354

Chart 11.1: Micro and large businesses using computers, LYA, percentage ..... 370

Chart 11.2: Growth in fixed broadband access by businesses using the Internet, percentage ..... 371

# List of figures

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Figure 0.1: WSIS monitoring process .....  | 4   |
| Figure 1.1: Relevance of Target 1 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 12  |
| Figure 2.1: Relevance of Target 2 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 54  |
| Figure 2.2: Information needs at different levels of ICT penetration in educational systems..... | 56  |
| Figure 3.1: Relevance of Target 3 to other WSIS action lines and targets .....                   | 86  |
| Figure 3.2: Countries with a national research and education network, 2005 and 2013.....         | 93  |
| Figure 3.3: Timeline of starting year for regional NRENs and NREN consortia.....                 | 98  |
| Figure 3.4: Coverage of regional or NREN consortia, 2013.....                                    | 99  |
| Figure 4.1: Relevance of Target 4 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 118 |
| Figure 5.1: Relevance of Target 5 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 153 |
| Figure 5.2: Types of health facilities by country administrative levels .....                    | 154 |
| Figure 6.1: Relevance of Target 6 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 176 |
| Figure 7.1: Relevance of Target 7 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 205 |
| Figure 8.1: Relevance of Target 8 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 239 |
| Figure 8.2: Electrification and television ownership in rural areas.....                         | 250 |
| Figure 8.3: Main TV-distribution technologies.....   | 251 |
| Figure 9.1: Relevance of Target 9 to WSIS action lines .....                                     | 276 |
| Figure 10.1: Relevance of Target 10 to WSIS action lines .....                                   | 331 |
| Figure 11.1: Relevance of proposed Target 11 to WSIS action lines.....                           | 366 |

# List of tables

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Table 1.1: Data sources for indicators for measuring Target 1 .....                                      | 18  |
| Table 1.2: Rural population covered by a mobile cellular signal, 2012.....                               | 19  |
| Table 1.3: Households with any phone access, by rural/urban difference, 2009–2012, percentage.....       | 25  |
| Table 1.4: Households with fixed phone only, by rural/urban difference, 2009–2012, percentage .....      | 27  |
| Table 1.5: Households with mobile phone only, by rural/urban difference, 2009–2012, percentage.....      | 29  |
| Table 1.6: Households with any Internet access, by rural/urban difference, 2009–2012, percentage.....    | 33  |
| Table 1.7: Individuals using the Internet, by rural/urban difference, 2009–2012, percentage.....         | 40  |
| Table 1.8: Internet use by rural/urban and location of use, 2012/2011, percentage of Internet users..... | 41  |
| Table 3.1: Data sources for indicators for measuring Target 3 .....                                      | 91  |
| Table 3.2: Proportion of public scientific and research centres with broadband Internet access.....      | 92  |
| Table 3.3: Bandwidth of selected NRENs, 2013/2012.....   | 95  |
| Table 3.4: Regional or NREN consortia and regions served .....   | 96  |
| Table 3.5: Public scientific and research centres with Internet access to a NREN.....                    | 102 |
| Table 3.6: NRENs and connectivity to institutions .....  | 103 |
| Table 4.1: Public libraries offering public Internet access, by region, 2007 and 2009.....               | 125 |
| Table 4.2: Museums with a web presence, Europe, 2012 .....   | 130 |
| Table 4.3: Museum visits onsite, online (2011), Facebook 'likes' and Twitter followers (2014) .....      | 132 |
| Table 4.4: National archives organizations with broadband Internet/a web presence, 2013 or LYA.....      | 142 |
| Table 4.5: Digitization and online availability of items in the national archives, 2013 or LYA.....      | 143 |
| Table 5.1: Internet connectivity in public hospitals, by country .....                                   | 157 |
| Table 5.2: Internet connectivity in public health centres, by country .....                              | 159 |
| Table 5.3: Sample of international sources of ICT and health data .....                                  | 167 |
| Table 6.1: Data availability on use of ICT in government.....  | 180 |
| Table 6.2: Persons employed in central government routinely using computers, 2013 or LYA .....           | 182 |
| Table 6.3: Persons employed in central government routinely using Internet, 2013 or LYA .....            | 183 |
| Table 6.4: Central government organizations with a LAN, 2013 or LYA .....                                | 183 |
| Table 6.5: Central government organizations with an intranet, 2013 or LYA.....                           | 184 |
| Table 6.6: Central government organizations with Internet access, by type, 2013 or LYA .....             | 185 |
| Table 6.7: Central government web presence 2003–2014 .....   | 186 |
| Table 6.8: National website links to local/regional government agencies .....                            | 187 |
| Table 6.9: Cities offering official websites 2005–2011.....  | 188 |
| Table 6.10: Provision of archived information by region, 2014 .....                                      | 194 |
| Table 8.1: Data sources for indicators for measuring Target 8 .....                                      | 244 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Table 8.2: Households with a radio, 2009–2012.....   | 246 |
| Table 8.3: Analogue switch-off dates, selected countries that have completed the DTT transition..... | 262 |
| Table 9.1: Distribution of world languages by area of origin.....                                    | 274 |
| Table 9.2: Distribution of world languages by number of first language speakers.....                 | 275 |
| Table 9.3: Global Internet users by main global languages, IWS estimates, 2011.....                  | 288 |
| Table 9.4: Total registrations by world region, 2003–2013.....                                       | 294 |
| Table 9.5: Persons per ccTLD and TLD registration, world regions, 2003–2013.....                     | 296 |
| Table 9.6: Internet users per ccTLD and TLD registration, world regions, 2003–2013.....              | 296 |
| Table 9.7: Gross and Internet-user population per domain registration, 2012/2013.....                | 297 |
| Table 9.8: Wikipedia articles by language, 2003–2013, thousand articles.....                         | 301 |
| Table 9.9: Website popularity, global and selected countries, 2014.....                              | 309 |
| Table 9.10: Website popularity, computer and mobile platforms.....                                   | 309 |
| Table 10.1: Data sources for indicators for measuring Target 10.....                                 | 332 |
| Table 11.1: Data sources for e-business indicators, 2008–2012.....                                   | 369 |
| Table 11.2: Businesses using computers, LYA, percentage.....   | 370 |
| Table 11.3: Share of businesses using mobile phones, LYA, percentage.....                            | 372 |