Compilation of comments from stakeholders on Revised Input to the 7th meeting of the WSIS Group of Friends of the Chair (GFC)

Note: New text in **bold**. Deleted text in ~~strikethrough~~. *[Comments in italics.]*

Input Document	Source	Comments
10. We acknowledge that multi-stakeholder participation in the building of the inclusive and development-oriented information society is essential. We underline that the continuous and substantial involvement of all stakeholders in implementing WSIS decisions on national, regional and international levels with the overarching goal of helping countries to achieve internationally agreed development goals is a key of success.	Youth Caucus	10. *[second sentence]* We ~~underline~~ **strongly emphasize** that ….
11. In order to assure the sustainability of the WSIS process after the completion of its Tunis phase, we agree to establish a process of follow-up to the outcomes of the [Geneva and Tunis phases of] WSIS, at national, regional and international levels. It may include, at each level, the following elements: a) implementation of the outcomes of the Geneva and Tunis phases of WSIS; b) evaluation of information society developments (including through a digital opportunity index); c) policy debate and review.	Youth Caucus	11…. ,we agree to establish a process of **action-oriented and time-bound implementation of and** follow-up to the outcomes of………: a) implementation of the outcomes of the Geneva and Tunis phases of WSIS **with the appropriate institutional and financial support from all stakeholders** ;
	UNCTAD on behalf of "Partnership on Measuring ICT for Development" (members include Eurostat, ITU, OECD, UNCTAD, UNESCO Institute for Statistics, UN Regional Commissions, UN ICT Task Force and World Bank)	11………. b) evaluation of information society developments (including through ~~a digital opportunity index~~ **the development of internationally comparable statistical indicators**);
	CCBI	11. In order to assure the sustainability of ~~the WSIS process~~ **progress towards the outcomes of WSIS** after …. ~~c) policy debate and review.~~
12. At the <u>national level,</u> based on the WSIS outcomes, we encourage governments to set up a national *implementation* framework with full and effective participation of civil society and business entities; a) National e-strategies, where appropriate, should be made an integral part of national development plans, including Poverty	Youth Caucus	12. b)ICTs should be fully mainstreamed **not only** into strategies … programmes **but, equivalently important, in the provision of public services and programmes by governments through collaboration with civil society and the private sector;**

Reduction Strategies, aiming to contribute to the achievement of the goals contained in the UN Millennium Declaration; b) ICTs should be fully mainstreamed into strategies for Official Development Assistance (ODA) through more effective donor information-sharing and co-ordination, and through analysis and sharing of best practices and lessons learned from experience with ICT for development programmes; c) Existing bilateral and multilateral technical assistance programmes, including those under the UN Development Assistance Framework, should be used whenever appropriate to assist governments in their implementation efforts at the national level; d) Common Country Assessment reports should contain a component on ICT for development.	Africa Civil Society Caucus/WSIS	12. *[after a), add new a2]* **a2) Governments in developing countries should take every necessary step in order to improve their national regulatory framework with a view to fostering economic models of access to, and use of, bandwidth, which would reduce connection costs for the end user;**
	CCBI	*12 d) is unclear who undertakes this and what happens to the report. CCBI suggests that assessments of this kind are best done by multiple agencies with multi-stakeholder involvement.*
13. At the <u>regional level</u>: a) Upon request from governments, regional inter-governmental organizations could carry out WSIS implementation activities, exchanging information and best practices at the regional level, as well as organizing policy debate on the use of ICT for development, with a focus on attaining internationally agreed development goals, including those contained in the UN Millennium Declaration; b) UN regional economic commissions, based on request of Member States and within approved budgetary resources, may organize regional WSIS follow-up conferences with appropriate frequency;	Youth Caucus	13…… a) Upon request from governments, regional inter-governmental organizations ~~could~~ **should** carry out WSIS implementation activities, exchanging information and best practices at the **intra and inter-**regional level**s**, as well as ………; b) UN regional economic commissions, ……., ~~may~~ **must** organize regional WSIS follow-up conferences with appropriate frequency **and establish ICT-for-development funding windows;**

c) We consider a multi-stakeholder approach and the full and effective participation in regional activities by civil society and business entities to be essential.	Africa Civil Society Caucus/WSIS	13. a) ………..from government, **civil society organizations and/or other organized stakeholders** regional inter-governmental organizations could………… a2) **Governments and regional intergovernmental organizations should convene regular consultations with the relevant ICT technical communities and practitioners to discuss best practices and implement relevant solutions with regard to building up and rationalizing the Internet traffic exchange infrastructures, by supporting collaboration and peering among the various operators, including the incumbent national telecom operator;** b) ……………, may organize **or support** regional WSIS follow-up conferences………. c) …………….. and effective participation in regional **WSIS implementation** activities by civil society
	CCBI	13. … regional inter-governmental organizations ~~could carry out WSIS implementation activities~~ **could evaluate information society development**, exchanging information and best practices at the regional level, as well as ~~organizing policy debate~~ **facilitate policy debate** on the use of ICT for development,………..;
14. At the <u>international level</u>: a) *Implementation* of the outcomes of the Geneva and Tunis phases of the Summit in the UN system should take account of the main themes and action lines in the Summit documents; b) Each UN agency, according to its mandate and competencies, and based on decisions of their respective governing bodies, could facilitate activities among different stakeholders, including civil society and the private sector, to help national governments in their implementation efforts. The facilitation could include information	Youth Caucus	14. …… b) Each UN agency, ………, ~~could~~ **should** facilitate activities among different stakeholders,……. The facilitation ~~could~~ **should** include **knowledge creation through research**, information exchange, sharing of best practices,………; d) The establishment of **sustainable** multi-stakeholder partnerships[, such as the ITU-led initiative "Connect the World"],……..;

exchange, sharing of best practices, and assistance in developing public/private and multi-stakeholder partnerships. Facilitation should be carried out within the approved budgets of the respective agencies; c) Coordination of multi-stakeholder implementation activities would allow information exchange and avoidance of duplication of activities; d) The establishment of multi-stakeholder partnerships[, such as the ITU-led initiative "Connect the World"], which are aimed at bridging the digital divide, should be supported and encouraged; e) The modalities of coordination of implementation activities among the UN agencies should be defined by the UN Secretary General on the basis of existing practices within the UN system [and within the WSIS]. The experience of, and the activities undertaken by, UN agencies in the WSIS process—notably ITU, UNESCO and UNDP—should continue to be used to their fullest extent.	Africa Civil Society Caucus/WSIS	14. b) …………and based on decisions of their respective governing bodies, **should** facilitate activities …. The facilitation **will include, but not limited to,** information exchange, sharing of best practices,………… e) The modalities of coordination of implementation activities among the UN agencies should be defined by the UN Secretary General **taking into account the innovative practices brought out by the WSIS process, as well as the need of a "Forum" by WGIG. These modalities should include a specific mainstream and multi-stakeholder coordination instance to which effective secretariat support should be provided. Such a coordination instance will periodically hold public consultations and/or open its processes to public comments, and submit reports to be made publicly available**. The experience of, and the activities undertaken by,……..

	CCBI	14……..
		b) ~~Each UN agency~~, **Stakeholder groups,** according to its mandate and competencies, …….;
		c) ~~Coordination of multi-stakeholder implementation activities~~ **Awareness of multistakeholder activities** would allow information exchange and avoidance of duplication of activities;
		d) The establishment of multi-stakeholder partnerships~~[, such as the ITU-led initiative "Connect the World"]~~, which are aimed at bridging the digital divide, should be supported and encouraged;
		e) *[replace with]* **The modalities of coordination of implementation activities among the UN agencies should be defined by the UN Secretary General on the basis of existing practices within the UN system [and within the WSIS], using the experience of, and the activities undertaken by, UN agencies in the WSIS process – notably ITU, UNESCO and UNDP.**
Chapter Four: The way ahead		
29. *Evaluation and policy formulation,* at the national level, would remain the prerogative of governments. We consider the full and effective participation in the *policy debate* by the national civil society and business entities to be essential.	Youth Caucus	29. *Evaluation and policy formulation,* at the national level, **should be conducted by governments** ~~would remain the prerogative of governments~~. We consider the full and effective participation in the *policy debate **and action implementation*** by the ~~national~~ civil society and business entities to be essential.
	CCBI	*This paragraph is vague. Policies are sometimes appropriately determined by other stakeholders. This paragraph is especially redundant with paragraph 34 in the same chapter.*

30. A realistic international performance *evaluation* and benchmarking (both qualitative and quantitative), through comparable statistical indicators and research results, including by using a methodology for a composite ICT development index (digital opportunity index), should be developed to follow up the implementation of the Geneva and Tunis outcomes, taking into account different national circumstances.	Youth Caucus	30. A realistic international **and regional** performance *evaluation* and benchmarking (both qualitative and quantitative), ……….
	Africa Civil Society Caucus/WSIS	30. **A global ICT policy analysis as well as** a realistic international performance *evaluation* and benchmarking (both qualitative and quantitative),………
	UNCTAD, on behalf of "Partnership on Measuring ICT for Development"	30. A realistic ~~international~~ performance *evaluation* and benchmarking (both qualitative and quantitative), ~~through comparable statistical indicators and research results, including by using a methodology for a composite ICT development index (digital opportunity index)~~, **based on an internationally comparable and agreed upon framework of statistical indicators** should be developed to follow up the implementation of the Geneva and Tunis outcomes, taking into account different national circumstances. *[new 30 bis]* **30 bis. The work of the *global Partnership on Measuring ICT for Development* (whose members are Eurostat, the ITU, OECD, UNCTAD, the UN Regional Commissions (ECA, ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA), UNESCO Institute for Statistics, the UN ICT Task Force and the World Bank), which aims to increase the availability of internationally comparable ICT statistics, in particular in developing countries, will provide valuable inputs by setting international standards, defining indicators and promoting capacity building in countries to introduce systematic timely national monitoring of the Information Society.**
31. The *stocktaking* of activities related to the implementation of the Geneva and Tunis outcomes could be a valuable source of information in the evaluation process.		

32. We request the Secretary General of the United Nations to submit an annual report to the ECOSOC and/or UNGA on implementation activities of the WSIS decisions within the UN family.		
33. *Review and policy debate* should be organized in the framework of the follow-up to the outcomes of the major UN conferences and summits in the Economic and Social fields, as provided for in UNGA Resolution 57/270. It should be an integral part of the review process of the implementation of the UN Millennium Declaration.		
	Youth Caucus	*[new 33 a]* **33.a. We request the Secretary-General of the United Nations, in partnership with pertinent United Nations agencies, international development institutions, civil society and the business community, to re-convene WSIS stakeholders in 2010 and 2015 and review the status of the Geneva Plan of Action and Tunis Plan of Implementation and, where efforts are lacking, to call for increased commitment and support.** *[new 33 b]* **33 b. We encourage all stakeholders, importantly governments, to sustainably support the Digital Solidarity Fund and commit to realizing multi-stakeholder partnerships in closing the digital divide.**
34. Continuous involvement of all stakeholders in the policy discussion after Tunis Summit is essential and the modalities of such participation should be established.		

General Comments:

IT for Change (on behalf of CPSR, Univ. of Aarhus, GLOCOM, APC, Bread for All, CSDPTT, Education, Academia and Research Taskforce, World Radio and Television Council, Cape Peninsula Univ. of tech., NNM and ITeM) *[We] strongly oppose the move to make the proposed changes in paragraphs 10, 11 and 29 of the operational part of the Tunis document, as per the new input document circulated by the President of the PrepCom. The input documents do not represent the contributions of the various stakeholders to the existing text, and their acceptance will defeat the stated purpose of the Tunis summit, described as the 'summit of solutions', to make some real headway in implementing the promises of the Geneva summit.*

We suggest that implementation and follow-up mechanisms for WSIS are based on multi-stakeholder teams around action lines with a well-defined overall co-ordination body, as contained in the existing paragraphs 10, 11 and 29. The text of these paragraphs should be further improved and elaborated through a multi-stakeholder consultative process in order to ensure that an adequate post-WSIS structure is in place. The purpose of such a structure will not only be to implement the outcomes of WSIS but also to take up information society issues as they emerge.

Informal Coalition on Financing ICTD *We strongly object to the replacement of the original text of paragraphs 10, 11 and 29 regarding a well defined implementation and follow-up structure with vague and weaker proposals. We propose:*

- *The creation of multi-stakeholder teams around each action line in the Geneva and Tunis plan of Action, with a well defined overall co-ordination body;*
- *That the WSIS implementation and follow-up mechanisms include a body such as the Global Alliance/Network of key actors from a wide variety of stakeholders, e.g. along the lines proposed by the UN ICT Task Force;*
- *That the proposal for a multi-stakeholder 'forum' for internet governance should be included as an integral element of the broader WSIS implementation;*
- *That provision should be made for 5 and 10 year reviews of progress towards implementing the WSIS Plan of Action*

Africa Civil Society Caucus/WSIS *We strongly regret the fact that in comparison to the earlier text, this new one does not foresee the establishment of a implementation mechanism of the Geneva and Tunis Action Plans on one hand, and the establishment of an ad hoc coordination structure for the follow-up of the Geneva and Tunis Action Plans on the other in a strong and compelling manner. For developing countries, <u>it is indispensable to guarantee the existence of a follow-up mechanism along with a coordinated, efficient and productive multistakeholder implementation, especially at the international level.</u>*

CCBI *Paragraphs in Chapter 4 are fairly redundant with Chapter 1 and we suggest that they could be integrated in Chapter 1.*

The WSIS Youth Caucus *strongly supports the proposal of the Government of Spain to "establish a World Internet Day" (new para 30 at DT-6(rev.2)). However, building an inclusive Information Society, bridging the digital divide and raising awareness on the issues of WSIS are beyond the scope of the Internet alone thus must include traditional and modern ICTs such as television, radio and mobile phones. Our proposal then, respecting the language of Para 30 (DT-6 (rev.2)) put forward by the Government of Spain, is to:*

> **New Para 30 (DT-6 (rev2)).** *We propose to establish a World ICT (or ICT4D) Day. This Day could help to raise awareness, on an annual basis, of the importance of ICTs as enabling tools for sustainable development and poverty reduction, and more broadly on the issues dealt with in the Summit as well as of ways to bridge the digital divide.]*