



RAW FILE
WSIS FORUM 2017
JUNE 13, 2017
1515 P.M. CET
HIGH-LEVEL POLICY SESSION 4

Services Provided By:

Caption First, Inc.
P.O Box 3066
Monument, CO 80132
1-877-825-5234
+001-719-481-9835
Www.Captionfirst.com

This is being provided in a rough-draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Hello everyone. We are going to get started and thank you for joining us today. My name is Justin Caso with IEEE. This is section 4. This is the second year of this new format. Very inknownatetive where the high level poisy statements will be delivered. Each speaker will have total of five minutes. And there is going to be time for audience interaction. Write your questions and bring them back to the back of the room to the remote Moderator and we will do everything we can to take at least a couple of questions. So I would like to begin with representative from UNESCO and the question is what are UNESCO's keyish e initiatives to promote universal access to knowledge and promote inclusiveness?

>> INDRAJIT BANERJEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Although I have five minutes I noticed that my neighbor to my right is in to the 25th century already. So we are getting really concerned about issues of access and that's the central topic of discussion here. UNESCO's agenda is very clear. We believe in building inclusive participatory knowledge in all

societies and therefore access to information and knowledge becomes obviously an essential pillar of creating knowledge societies. So it is from that angle that we approach the whole issue of access. However, I think where UNESCO is unique is a fact that we believe that access for far too long has been restricted to an understanding of access is connectivity. And I think that's a completely (inaudible) position. Connectivity is perhaps the basis of access. It is perhaps the Foundation of access. But we realized today that in spite of connectivity many people are not connected because there is a lack of capacity. There is a lack of local language content. Most of websites and content on the Internet are not accessible for Persons with Disabilities. So this is basically in a nutshell our focus, how do you enhance access in the real sense, not just giving figures of 3.5 billion people are connected to the Internet. Big deal. 5 billion people are connected to the Internet. What are they doing with the internet that's the question. To what extent are the Internet being used for Sustainable Development Goals, access to education for empowerment of women and what that's my message in very brief because the Chairman said we have one question for five minutes. I think I'm in to three and a half minutes. So I will enjoy my one and a half minutes left. Really I think we now need to drill deep and start dealing with real issues in terms of access. Once you have connectivity what do you do with the connectivity. How skilled are people, I can give you a hundred examples of how, when there is connectivity and there is local language content and there is locally relevant content. And when there is and I think it is a chain, when there is a clear difference that can be made out of access to people's livelihoods then the Internet will flourish. Dot net, it is speech, it is cyber bullying (hate speech) we must pay attention to that, too. Beneficial to all. And we while we drill deep, we must discuss the more difficult questions we are faced with when we have access to the wrong content. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you very much. Next I'm going to turn to the representative from Cuba. And the first question is in various to Forums Cuba has expressed concerns about the inadequate use of cyberspace. What the fundamental concerns of the Cuban Government on the use of cyberspace at the present.

>> WILFREDO GONZALEZ VIDAL: Good afternoon to everyone. I would like to speak in Spanish. Good afternoon and thank you very much Mr. Caso for giving me the floor. As you said our Government looks for neutrality and meets the interests of

who uses the Internet. Therefore the IT has contributed to the increase of the social digital divide and cultural divide between the rich and the poor. Those who have and have notes. In this vain we think that it is absolutely critical to eliminate the obstacles to access new technologies for those Developing Countries. Therefore, we are going to pay special attention to infrastructure, and the benefits of neutral matters, especially ICTs in a safe and reliable manner. Cyberspace and Internet access should be considered as strategic pillars. Though multiplication of cybercrimes across the world is real threat by ITU must focus on. Therefore as you said Mr. Chair we are concerned by the militaryization of cyberspace and the illegal use of ICTs to subvert the national order in each country. The main inequalities, sovereign integrity within the charter of the United Nations should be respected in the virtual space. Therefore and with this I would like to close. This is a very important imperative to work on legal instruments that will compliment law to elaborate activities in cyberspace. Thank you.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you very much. The second question is what actions have the Cuban Government taken for development of ICT in your country?

>> WILFREDO GONZALEZ VIDAL: With regards to your second point, I'd like to say that despite the financial limitations of our country and the economic and financial block aid and technological blockaid put in place by the United States we continue to make progress on creation and strengthening of capacity building in the technology area. Furthermore, we have developed important applications in the main sectors of the country. Some of these include which were shown yesterday in a workshop which took place yesterday and today on action line No. 10 we have obtained, we won a prize of informational center for e-Health in Cuba. The Cuban Government has made important efforts to develop ICTs by giving priority to youth, education science and cultural areas in -- in order to increase productivity and economic growth. Recently we have also approved a -- a policy on information of the society which gives priority to -- for different sectors to give access to our citizens. And also to give services to the people by giving -- by setting up thousands of public centers from which people can access this important resource. I would like to convey to you that there is a will from the Cuban Government to continue making efforts in order to strengthen and to develop access to ICTs within a framework with the vision from our leaders, and to participate and to not exclude

people in order to preserve our social and cultural identity. Thank you.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you. The next representative to speak is the representative from Sri Lanka. And the first question is as the regulator what steps have you taken to promote access to information and knowledge for all in Sri Lanka?

>> KINGSLY FERNANDO: Excellencies, distinguished Ladies and Gentlemen, greetings. At the outset let me say sincere gratitude of Secretary-General of ITU Mr. Houlin Zhao and other officials of ITU as well as the UNESCO UNDP and entire effort to organize this event automatic successfully. The basic Foundation of information society availability, information and communication infrastructure. Sri Lanka has implemented the specific WISA outcome to extend to connectivity and affordable throughout the country. The telecommunication regulation of Sri Lanka has created a regulatory framework that will foster investment in local, stimulating growth and provide connectivity at affordable rates. Operators have developed technologies for provision of technology. And the first time to develop 4G LTE networks, 3G and 4G technologies cover in access of 85% of population and this is expected to grow further with the promotion of healthy competition. Availability of mobile broadband services has increased. Internet penetration, providing equal access to information and e-service resulting in inclusive development. The recent introduction of low cost small devices will increase the affordability of services. Connected to excess data, public services, competitive market environments and greater learning opportunity the. The Government has initiated a project for the use of ICT by SME and especially self-employment personals and school levels. High quality Internet is a prerequisite to enable freedom to express enhancing the skill of our people and ensure socioeconomic growth. Access to free WiFi program of all licensed operators in setting up support in public places across the country is still -- active in this call. Concurrently we are promoting and accelerating high speed broadband development reaching out to all part of the country, including rural areas for digital education and digital commerce. Finally the vision of the countries to make proud band affordable so that all citizens can access Internet. At least to information society. Thank you.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Okay. And how much time does he have? Two minutes for the next question. So question is can you elaborate on the steps taken by the regulator to provide information and knowledge for Persons with Disabilities and

marginalized groups?

>> KINGSLY FERNANDO: Sri Lanka started this. The ITU extended their unsustainable support with the provision of not only IT facilities but also provide a specialized equipment designed for the specific disabilities. Project was based on that 4 Ps model where ITU and teleoperators and community provide assistance. And operation and maintenance also created sustainable of project. The initiative for includes development, locally in local language and other international software. Might need training to provide for both details students of these centers for the disabled through the international program through the ITU. This projects have helped us to create an inclusive society where information and knowledge will be accessed by irrespective of the physical and mental limitations.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you. The next speaker is the representative from the European Commission, DG CONNECT. And he is going to be taking two questions at once. So the first question is what is the situation in the European Union about digital inclusion? And the second question is what actions are the European Commission pursuing in support of digital inclusion?

>> Marco: Thank you, Mr. Chairman for the opportunity to present the EU actions for the inclusive societies. We realize that digital technologies and services are actually proven enabled for sustainable development. Building human centered next generation Internet, access to eGovernment, e-learning, e-Health services they are all key determinants to enable a truly digital societies and Europe is becoming a more digital by the month, by the year. Connectivities in terms of connectivities we have 76% of European homes that can have access to high speed broadband. We have now 84% of the populations covered. And the Internet traffic per se is also increasing. Right now 20% annually. However when it comes to the second dimension which I would call the human capital dimension, we realize that all the EU has more digital specialists than before, skills do remain. The European Union more graduates than in the past, in science technology and engineering and math and more workforce. Almost half of the European, so 44% of the Europeans they still lack basic digital skills such as using a mailbox or adding a tool or installing new devices. If we take the third dimension such as the public set of dimensions we see there is an increase in using in public services. 34% of Internet users now submit forms to the public administrations online instead of handling paper copies in. So when it comes to the overall analysis the

EU has progressed and does improve in terms of digital performance. 3% compares to the previous year but progress can actually -- could actually be faster. And important message is that the picture varies a lot between Member States. The difference of 37 percentage points compare the with the most and least digital companies in the Europe. Promoting broadband connectivities. We heard today that is the backbone of the digital society. However we also need to ensure that there are equally trained men and women that can have access and can create content and services that are beneficial to themselves and to their societies. So the first piece of instruments is legislations. Second one is policy coordinations and financial support. One of the major policy pillar is the digital single market for Europe of which we actually address the barriers for which citizens miss on goods and services. And the objectives are to provide better access to consumers and business to online goods update individual media services rule, building also on the data economy. But there are other specific actions from a financial support of view that are directly inputting digital inclusion. First is accessibility. And therefore we have financial instruments in support of developing ICT tools that are more can access ible to people with disabilities and it goes the legislative packages of web accessibility directive by which has been published on the 22nd of December 2016 and it will oblige each and every public sector body in the European Union in each and every country to have their websites and their mobile apps accessible to people with disabilities.

And the third element that I would like to stress is the financial support that we provide to research and innovations on assistive technologies. So technology that help people with disabilities to reconnect with their environment. The other strains of actions is certainly on skills and digital skills. The [comigs](#) is promoting digital skills and job alliance and is working with Member States and industry and social partners to develop a large pool that ensure that individuals and labor force in Europe are kept with the adequate digital skills. Not to get multilingualism. We believe that digital learning technologies are also key to overcoming language barriers and therefore our focus is on speech technologies machine translaigss and to conclude I would like to mention the European Commission work on digital for development which is a strategy to mainstream digital technologies in o European Union development policies which are contributing to achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you. I love the name, the next speaker is from the 25th century technology limited. What levels of impact are ICTs having at local and traditional governance levels?

>> KWAKU OFOSU-ADARKWA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Distinguished panelists, Ladies and Gentlemen, ever since the WSIS Action Lines, many countries including Ghana specified development of infrastructure to give access to the underserved areas, in Ghana, for instance, the Committee information centers have been developed. Also have interventions which ensure that the ICT infrastructure will enhance the governance at the grassroots. I think the cost under this theme is that in spite of all of this, there is level of position because it is not inclusiveness in the development process when the -- Committee is concerned. So innovation also comes -- becomes questionable when the people are not involved in innovation it becomes very questionable for them to accept innovation because we feel it is an intense innovation. One other area is also the low level digital literacy. I mean people who are not ready to be digital interest. So they end compounding the problem of access to information and knowledge. The major issue here looking at the private sector lens, I worked for 30 years in the public sector and now in the private sector, integration to aid innovation. The NGOs, and also the Civil Society. The Government sector should open up this time and see the private sector and indeed NGOs, partners who will implement policies that will enable access in to the rural areas. This is a major issue and I think that is one area that we have to look at.

>> JUSTIN CASO: And the in next question is what is the extent of the gap in the diffusion of ICTs in governance at the local level?

>> KWAKU OFOSU-ADARKWA: In spite of the development is quite on the -- about 126% with Ghana's population of about 27 million. It connects how you found to be the major field for communication and yet only 14% penetration is available. Why is this so? It is so that there is very high cost of Internet, sort of majority of the people. And the -- in address certain issues there needs to be a study and the most important aspect we talk about accessing that, countries must now begin to put inclusiveness in their agreement policy. We have this ICT policy in 2003. Digital policy is reshaped so that it has agenda focus but also (inaudible). To handle the issues of access to these areas. What is that? It is a key issue. There is a study which has been carried by

professional NGO in Ghana. Showing that if operators and will operate to share assets and it will bring their APEX down and bring prices down. In fact, if ROI is competing for -- Internet 2% of what -- so that it can be affordable. This has been given to the government. How can this be implemented? The Government cannot -- to have production with the private sector, with the NGOs, with the Civil Society that they are transforming the benefits of this research can also be done. Should be the need for gender aggregated service because when you talk about penetration, there is about 1/26th how many girls, are online, how many women are online. These are the areas that you want to increase and private sector should partner to have an integrated approach to achieve. Thank you very much.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you and the next speaker is the representative from the European language technology company, Tilde and the first question is why is the language diversity so important for an inclusive information society?

>> ANDREJS VASILJEVS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. And this is because language is a key element of our social and business fabrics and essential part of our identity, it enables us to think, to communicate, to preserve and share knowledge and culture and to pass it to the next generations and we do so many languages on this planet. And this is a richness of our culture and of diversity of human kind. And the ability to use Internet and ICTs in the language you comprehend is determinant for inclusion or exclusion from the knowledge society. So limitations in the multilingual skills of computers and mobile devices in a way if you can and cannot use these devices in your language widen the gap which excludes hundreds of millions of people from accessing the full benefits of internet and digital technologies. And some people say why not English or a few other languages. Everyone should learn these languaging. But surveys show that half the world population mother tongue is one of 15 languages and the other half talks in a wide variety of languages and it is important to provide content and technology but in many other languages to include those millions of people in to Internet area. And, you know, this was vividly shows by example from the Distinguished Delegated from Zimbabwe and showing that languages is among the key challenges to provide access to all languages. This is true for many other regions of the world and nobody should be discriminated against the digital world and technologies because his or her mother tongue and I think this is why WSIS plan of action and action line C8 urged the development of content and technical ambitions to facilitate

that languages all world languages and we were happy to organize a session which was discussed in great details at this Forum yesterday. Thank you.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you and the next question is can you provide some examples of successful advancement of a language for the needs of the Digital Age?

>> ANDREJS VASILJEVS: Yes. And like in previous talk we believe that efficiently tackle this challenge, cooperation between all stakeholder government and private sector and at local and international levels should be combined to tackle this challenge. And this technological development of languages cannot be just left solely to market forces and let me share example of Latvia. And it is not a big country and we have 2 million people talking in *lat ve yan* language. And it is very rich language and actively use it in social and economic developments and one of 24 official languages in European Union and the basic support for Latin language was provided soon after computers came in to to your country. And this was very basic for enabling typing and written in Latvian and we need much more advanced support. And when the comparative study was done in Europe to analyze how prepared the European languages for the Digital Age, those languages were among those 21 European languages but support to use it in a digital age and have a longer term risk of digital extinction that was allowing situation and launch targeted activities. Private sector and Government and research sector joined forces and start the program to provide advanced language technologies for this language and the company was happy to be part of this exciting development. Some examples, neural network technologies were able to create much better machine translation systems by parts or past offerings by global players by Google or Microsoft and it is integrated in eGovernments. Spoken language technologies make it possible to dictate text and in *lat ve* via and can chat bots and Artificial Intelligence tools and these examples can be applied and extended to other regions on this planet. Thank you.

>> JUSTIN CASO: I just want to tell everyone that all the statements are going to be online. So a bunch of people have had *ra* little bit more to say and respected the time limits which I appreciate. So you can read those statements online later. So next I would like to we have the representative from the Centre for Communication Governance at national law universal in Dehli. If you please turn your phone to silent please and the first question is how can access to information and knowledge for all be achieved

accounting for the global south?

>> CHINMAYI ARUN: Thank you. I want to begin by thanking all the speakers for their interventions. I feel like a lot of the things that I wanted to say I have already heard and that's very heart rning the focus on gender, language differences, enabling of diversity. As a brief background the Centre for Communication Governance at National Law University Dehli is a research center. And Jen generally in the information sphere. We engage locally and globally and we do through teach. Ing and research and policy engage ment. I am going to focus on a little bit on your global work. Whenever we are discussing access to information globally we find that a lot of the time the policies seem to be framed and initial at thiseses taken by companies located in the global nolt. There are a few notable and excellent perspectives who understands India and occupying this position in UNESCO. A lot of times that we are dealing with people shaped by their residents and growing up in the global north and there are large obstacles that completely miss thi. I realize that at lo of my colleagues in the global north were shocked when I pointed out to them that free basics is not going to reach the marginalized people in India because it is text-based program that is being piloted in a country that literacy is a sear yours problem. It is very, very evident to anybody who grooe up in India. Our interventions in the global context consist of pointing these things out because sometimes you can come in to the global south intending to enable access and end up doing a lot of harm because what you bring to the global south is actually more inequality inn stead of mitigated inequality because of mode intervention. We were engaged in the WSIS+10 process that were happy to note that all countries decided to make brijing digital divide priority and use language like knowledge society rather than information societies. I would like to save more of my time for the next question. The other thing I want to point out when we are talking about access there are two kinds of Human Rights that we bhed to be careful of. One is political rights. We, ex-is as center baiting inequalities by creating a greater imbalance between the power that Governments hold over their citizens. And the other kind of access, of course, is the socioeconomic divides by the people that already have not failed to benefit from access.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Okay. So I mean I guess along the same lines then what are some of the challenges, the challenges that you faced while at the academic institution in New Delhi?

>> CHINMAYI ARUN: I am going to tell you a little bit more about the local access. All actors seem to be devoted to

digital access. Companies are committed to it, even the global platforms are committed to it. The problem arises in how you account for marginalized communities. Example, some of the ways in which access is being ruled out let's get devices to everyone all over rural India. Sometimes local Governments and villages they ban women from carrying mobile phones. It is pointless to get mobile phones to women in India they are not allowed to carry them. Studies that have been conducted in India say that women say they don't go online because they don't feel like they can view the content without someone looking over their shoulders. I am sure that different countries in global south can tell you different stories about the obstacles that they face. Note that the obstacles exist and then engage with low end policy to see if it is possible to design our way around obstacles. Women can't access the Internet freely and you check to see what women only spaces are and see if you can enable access through them. You don't ignore the fact that problems exist in India. You make sure you are able to access content. Video content is something that is very rarely shared in India. Would be nice to see more investment from Government and private companies and investing in organizations like ballot camera that especially cater to marginalized groups and enable them to be a part of knowledge society. That's what CCG is dedicated to and we would be happy to work with anyone on that.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Thank you very much. So now we are moving to our last speaker on the panel and it is the representative from Article 19, and the first question is are international Human Rights frameworks relevant not WSIS communities discussion of inclusiveness and access to information and knowledge?

>> MEHWISH ABID ANSARI: Thank you very much Chair. And it has been wonderful to hear the rest of the perspectives on the -- I hope that I can add a little bit of Article 19's perspective in to the mix. And this question in answer to this question dovetail the from high intervention just before with you to answer the question, yes, the Human Rights framework is relevant to discussions of access to information and inclusiveness and in fact, it is relevant to the overall WSIS process. And in fact, we have already seen the relevance in previous documents. Tunis Agenda, explicitly recognize the freedom of expression and right to privacy and other rights afforded you had under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The WSIS+10 review which was mentioned earlier we affirmed this commitment. So clearly Human Rights have been

part of the discussion within these types of forums encompassing the information society. The problem is that we as a community have yet to grapple with how to meaningfully implement the Human Rights framework as part of this ongoing ICTs for SDGs conversation and this problem is essential because Human Rights are essential in themselves to economic and social development. The consideration of the entire Human Rights framework not just economic social and cultural rights which may be more obviously relevant to economic and social development to some, but also civil and political rights, like freedom of expression and right to privacy and freedom of Association ensure the sustainability of economic and social development. And that's really because these rights privacy free expression, free Association form a bedrock of a free and open civic space. Economic and social development, whether you are talking about innovation entrepreneurship, they -- it is all necessitated by users trusts in the Internet as a free and open civic space. The fundamental loss of this trust through any segment of the information societies attempts to restrict people's access to information online will render any connectivity measures moot. It won't matter how far your infrastructure reaches or how much content you are able to make access online if people stop seeing the Internet as a tool for economic and social empowerment and refuse to access it all together.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Okay. Wonderful. And just this took a little over. The last question, and based on that question, how can one then concretely apply Human Rights considerations to developing inclusiveness and access policies that contribute to the relevant SDGs such as building resilient infrastructure?

>> MEHWISH ABID ANSARI: I realized that yeah, I realize that we are running out of time. Within the WSIS Forum we are finding that access to information policies that are being developed particularly at the infrastructural level overwhelming focus on connectivity and these policies focus on the economic dimensions but don't look at the other considerations that are afforded according to universal access within Human Rights frameworks. Really looking at the divisions of geographies, political and ethnic affiliation as independent considerations and not dependent indicators that are subsumed under our economic assessment. When we apply this to building resilient infrastructure in accordance with the SDGs we realize that we can't simply focus on measures to expand our infrastructure or get more content online. We also need to understand how powerful Actors exert control over the

Internet's infrastructure and recreating and magnifying systems of political economic and social marginal **sigs** and exclusion on line as they occur offline. And so if we are talking about building resilient infrastructure we need to consider the protection of online anonymity and the security of Internet users. We need to strengthen resistance to Internet shutdowns and other disruptions to the free flow of information that dispositive portionnately impact all Internet user access to information online. Thank you.

>> JUSTIN CASO: Okay. Thank you. So just like to -- we are out of time now. I am going to make a couple of announcements. Tomorrow from all of the sessions that are running all of us High-Level Track **fa** sill **tealtors** are going to be giving a two to three minute summary of our sessions and it will be incorporated online. And the statements will online as well. And very much like to thank all of the high level speakers who participated today. Not just for your participation, but for respecting all of the time limits very well and it is very much appreciated. And I also like to thank all the WSIS organizers who have been working tirelessly to get this done. So with that I would like everyone to give a big round of applause to everyone up here.

(Applause)

This is being provided in rough-draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.
