

FINISHED COPY

WORLD SUMMIT ON INFORMATION SOCIETY FORUM
MODERATED HIGH-LEVEL POLICY SESSION 4
GENEVA, SWITZERLAND
9 APRIL 2019
1530 CET

Captioning Provided By:
Caption First, Inc.
P.O. Box 3066
Monument, CO 80132
800-825-5234

This text, document, or file is based on live transcription. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART), captioning, and/or live transcription are provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings. This text, document, or file is not to be distributed or used in any way that may violate copyright law.

>> MODERATOR: Welcome everyone. Hello. Please take a seat and we will get started. My name is Mei Lin Fung. Welcome to session entitled Enabling Environment. We are privileged to have the WSIS line of action lead here with us, Kamal bin Ahmed Mohammed, so he will say a few words about the enabling environment.

>> KAMAL BIN AHMED MOHAMMED: Thank you very much, Mei Lin. Regulation should provide favorable environment for the industry, for the operators, for the consumers and for the Government. If we are talking about consumers, it means we have to offer the best possible services to the end consumers giving them a choice between quality and price.

We need the competition, we need the competitive players on the market to provide different kinds of services starting from the basic services for connectivity and then a reliable, resilient infrastructure, and then services, of course, data, video image, and after that applications, different kinds of applications on the next level, having in mind content.

So in this regard, a new regulation should provide this kind of favorable environment, and we will start discussion on this topic and maybe later on I can add some other topics and issues.

Thank you.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you, Mr. Kamal. So the format of this is that we will have five minutes for each speaker. The five minutes begins when I begin asking the question, and they have two questions each, and they have five minutes to respond.

If you have questions, you should submit them. There is a table on the side, and we will, if we have enough time consider them. The first question goes to His Excellency Mr. Kamal bin Ahmed Mohammed, Bahrain. Bahrain has been consistently a leader in enabling robust telecommunications and ICT sector. What would you say are the key drivers for such development? And the second question, assuming the infrastructure needs are met, what are the next wave of enablers and drivers that should be in place?

>> KAMAL BIN AHMED MOHAMMED: Thank you. Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. Indeed, Bahrain has a leading ICT sector, which has been the result of a long reform process that has been started almost 2002 by liberalizing the telecom industries and creating Telecommunication Regulatory Authority. Today we have urban market and guided by a fair robust regulatory framework that ensures level playing field as well as a balance between competition as well as the need to incentivize the operator to invest in the new technology.

Today Bahrain is ranked first by the United Arab Emirates board ITU ICT Development Index as well as fourth globally by the UN telecom infrastructure index and we are constantly upgrading our infrastructure because it is the backbone for the digital economy. As part of our telecom plan, we open by end of 2019, this year, 95% of Bahrain will be covered by ubiquitous high speed fiber broadband.

We just announced two weeks ago that Bahrain will offer the 5G, commission service 5G by this June and will be the first country in the world to have nationwide coverage by 2020. Bahrain is a small island and we can afford to do it. Why we are investing in infrastructure, as I said it's the backbone for the economy.

Today if you want to enable and capture the opportunities from the digital evolution and digital transformation, we will need to have this technology and infrastructure to enable growth. Our aim is to be a leading innovation enabler and to make Bahrain a hub for the development of new future services and technology. With regard to the second question, I think it's important infrastructure is the foundational things, but we need also to have the ecosystem around the infrastructure, and this is what we are doing in Bahrain.

We are investing in our human resources to make sure they have the skill and the knowledge. We have created something called labor fund, and this fund is used to train and build capacity in the private sector for the employees and also to help

companies to improve productivity. So we gave them money to use the new technology or service the new technology. This fund is used for the development of startup and small and medium enterprises mainly in the technology sector.

Also we have created during the last five years a number of accelerator and incubator and they are specific accelerator we have one for the Internet of Things called Brink. We have another one called FinTech and mainly for the financial services, another called C5 and it is mainly for cloud enabling technology. This incubator and accelerators that created startup and attracted intelligent FDI to provide future services and technology.

If I have more time, I can tell you also part of our strategy also to attract foreign investment in Bahrain. So we have managed to attract MSN Web Services to establish their mega scale data centre in Bahrain. That will be operational soon because it is part of the digital and smart infrastructure. It's not only the fiberoptic we have in Bahrain or the 5G, but also these things are important.

So going forward, we will continue doing what we are doing. We will need to address the challenges we are facing, challenges like data protection, cybersecurity that's applicable to all, but as I said, we are preparing ourself to maximize the benefits from the opportunity that will be created by the fourth industrial revolution, the AI, the Internet of Things, machine to machine communication by making the infrastructure, the enabling environment and regulatory framework and the human capital.

>> MODERATOR: Excellent. That's so impressive that the minister can speak articulately about so many aspects of the enabling environment. It gives me great pleasure to introduce the next speaker because she is the only other woman on this panel. From the UAE, Her Excellency Ms. Ohoud Ali Shelhail, the Director General of the Ajman Digital Government. To what extent do data policy and regulation affect challenges of digital age? What is the role of the Governments to empower the society to collaborate in shaping these policies?

>> KAZEMBE KAZEMBE: While there is growth of new and emerging technologies, the society's app is growing more and more in terms of utilizing the data created by all of these technologies. As we heard earlier this morning, one third of the individuals are using Smart Phones, so which means there is a huge shift towards the online economic and social activities, which all leads towards the context of Information Society, and economy and country's worth.

However, there is no one system for data protection. As it is highly fragmented currently with the different global regional and national regulatory approaches. Moreover, data protection as

an insufficient reflection can create negative impact on consumer confidence. Gartner mentions in one of his recent studies that by 2020 the backup and archiving of personal data will represent the largest area of privacy risk for 70% of organisations, up to 10% in 2018.

So on the other hand, overprotecting data can restrict businesses and create adverse economic effects as a result. Another study by Gartner mentioned by 2021 more than 30% of enterprises will implement the detailed security governance framework which is an increase from fewer than 5% to date. Having said that, we should also consider that trust and privacy is a cultural norm in most of the societies in the world, however, the jurisdictions towards privacy principles differ drastically.

Therefore, a common platform should be created to solve such challenges. Another research said that by 2021, 40% of organisations worldwide will adopt across platform application and use case agnostic semantic data access strategy.

So to answer your second question about the role of the Government in empowering the society, there is no doubt that Governments have a very strong role when it comes to empowering their society and shaping the policies. Now, public policy framework must ensure proper engagement of all stakeholders when it comes to policy design and implementation.

Governments should always strive to understand the needs, wants, and challenges met by their customers. The typical Government centric approach shifted from Government centric to customer centric, and it became a must, not an option anymore. Talking about this, the emirate of Azwan, it is one of the seven Emirates in the UAE, it is the smallest emirate in the emirate of Ajman we do fully believe and understand this role. We have created Ajman Ambassador network. Is it is a network of Government customers that are always invited to Government sessions related to policy discussions and service developments.

We have also inaugurated in February 2018, it's considered one of a kind that cocreates and co-designs governmental services by engaging the customers and all related stakeholders in their service design and delivery along with enabling policies and procedures required. Thank you.

>> MODERATOR: What a wonderful story, and congratulations on all that you are doing.

>> OHOUD ALI SHEHAIL: I would like to take the opportunity to invite whoever wants to know more about Ajman, we have a session Thursday in the UAE session. You are all invited. Thank you.

>> MODERATOR: Fascinating. So His Excellency from Zimbabwe, the Minister of Information Communication Technology

and Courier Services, so we have two questions. I am going to go through both and you will have five minutes. What is the role of Governments in building an enabling environment for Internet connectivity? And the second question, what has Zimbabwean Government done to enable an enabling environment and keeping ICT and telecom affordable for the ordinary citizen given especially with landlocked Zimbabwe, the high cross-border transit fees?

>> KAZEMBE KAZEMBE: Thank you very much. Your Excellencies, Ladies and Gentlemen, good afternoon. Government in our view plays a pivotal role in facilitating or enabling development of contract connectivity, and this happens at a policy level. Government can assist in formulating policies, some policies that enable the construction of, you know, the backbone transport infrastructure, and the ICT infrastructure in general.

Government can also assist in formulating sound educational policies. As you would appreciate the use of ICTs requires literate populous. The Government can play an important role in coming up with investor friendly policies to encourage investors to invest in infrastructure development, and Government can also come up with policies that are, you know, that assist in the development of literacy rates in countries.

A good example is in our country, in Zimbabwe we boast literacy rate of 90%. As I alluded to earlier for people to be able to use ICTs, there is a need for people to be literate. And Government can also assist in coming up with policies. That kind of bridge the digital divide, whether it is gender, whether it is the region of the poor, whether it's between rural and urban areas, and whether it's between the less educated and those educated.

So Government can actually come up with policies to mitigate around the digital gap. So basically that's what Government can do. Now, we come back to Zimbabwe. Zimbabwe has done quite a lot in that regard. And in fact our main focus in Zimbabwe is on infrastructure development. We have come up with policies that promote infrastructure sharing which for lack of a better term kind of compels operators to share infrastructure.

And by so doing, we hope to achieve two objectives. The first one is to ensure that we have enough coverage in a very short space of time because now people are sharing infrastructure. And the second one, we also hope that because the operating costs are reduced for the operators, we hope that that will be extended to the end user, to the consumers. And also what we have done in assisting in infrastructure development, we know that some operators that don't find economically viable to build infrastructure in rural areas, so Government through the USF, we have taken a deliberate, you know,

position to try and cover that gap and provide infrastructure in those areas.

And also in addition to that, because I mentioned earlier on that having infrastructure is one thing, but you also need people to be literate, and Government is also assisting in providing computers in most rural schools. In fact, we started by coming up with a curriculum which compels ICTs to be learned in LEH. And having done that through the portal, the regulator, the USF, we are providing those underserved schools with computers, and not only that, we also have another program where we are now connecting those schools.

We are have a program where we are connecting about 1300 schools to the Internet. And also over and above that we also have a program where we are deploying some community information centers in those areas where people do not have connectivity. One, we are trying to ensure that connectivity is brought to the people, and also we are using those same centers to train people on basic Internet knowledge, and we have, so far we have trained almost 10,000 people.

Over and above that, we are also promoting equitable and efficient access through the launch of the Zimbabwe Plan done in February 2018. And like I mentioned earlier, and we also are encouraging our operators to participate in undersea cables. We do have Tier 1 which is a shareholder that assists in ensuring that costs are managed. We also, through our regulator, we have regular cost buildup analysis which provides, which guides us on the price programmes, pricing schedules. Thank you very much.

>> MODERATOR: I'm inspired. I love what you are doing. It's fantastic. So we will shift now, thank you, minister, we will shift now to Afghanistan. With the Chairman of the Afghanistan telecom regulatory authority, Mr. Mohammad Najeeb Azizi. The two questions for you, what kind of activities can national regulatory agencies perform to implement enabling environment? Second question, why do you feel that the action items, C6 enabling environment emphasize so much the rational, efficient and equitable access to radio frequency spectrum?

>> MOHAMMAD NAJEEB AZIZI: Thank you very much. Good afternoon, everybody. I hope you are not very tired. In regards to the enabling environment, I think that there is a range of activities that the national regulatory bodies can undertake within their own capacities. And let's remember that it is confidence and security is the major pillars of the Information Society. So a majority of the regulators around the world have already shifted towards detailed in the fourth generation of the regulation of the ICT.

And it means that now the regulators are mainly focused on enabling investment, bringing innovation and access, and it means

that there is a dual focus on stimulating competition in services and content delivery. And, of course, consumer protection is one of the top agendas for the regulators now.

Today the focus of the regulators is on integrated regulations which means that it is led both by economic and social goals. To be very specific, I would say that there are a couple of things that the regulators must focus on. To start with, the coordination and location of the spectrum is important, and in particular the spectrum should be available ubiquitous and also affordable. The second thing is that the regulators must facilitate the e-Commerce and they have to promote the usage of international interoperability standards for the global e-Commerce.

The development of integrated regulatory framework is a must, and likewise the framework for the online privacy and the means of protecting it. Deregulators also need to facilitate the establishment of the exchange, Internet exchange centers both nationally and regionally. And lastly, based on my experience for the last four years, I believe that the regulatory frameworks should be developed based on consensus, based on consultation. All of the stakeholders must be given the space and the chance and the opportunity to speak about the challenges they are facing and also the solutions that they think are important to be considered during the regulatory framework development.

In regards to the spectrum, let me say that it's visible to all of us that spectrum is the vehicle for the development of Internet. In the developing countries a lot, and then maybe in the Developed Countries, to a lesser extent. The Internet availability has been possible the way it is possible today, and I think we all need to be thankful to the wireless technology that we are enjoying it today.

Now, in order to make sure that we do get the advantage of the technologies that are available today, including 5G and then God knows what will happen in the next two to three years what other technologies are coming, if we want to make sure that it's affordable and all of the people get the benefit from it, then, again, availability of the spectrum is a must and it has to be made available to everybody who are entrusted without any discrimination. So with this, I will close it here. Thank you, ma'am.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you very much. We are onto Mexico.

The Commissioner for the federal telecommunications institute, Mr. Adolfo Cuevas Teja, what is the role of a telecommunications regulator to overcome the digital divide and foster an enabling environment considering the SDGs for 2030 and what do you see at present are the key factors for the creation of an Information Society.

>> ADOLFO CUEVAS TEJA: Thank you very much. I will speak in Spanish, if I may. I will wait for a moment for all to have the interpretation in place and for the headsets to be on. Thank you so much.

The development objectives is a redefinition for humanity of the 21st century. We have the right and duty for each generation to really have in mind of what human kind means, an image which we will all agree on, for men and women who have more and more rights the rights to have access to ICTs and I think in this process of civilization, which is the role of the regulator.

Regulators must have the technical ability in order to decide upon what is necessary to achieve Sustainable Development Agenda goals. Regulators who have to use the information which is clear and reliable enough which will allow them to have a clear decision evidence-based decision making. I think what is relevant for the regulator is to find and to ensure that the ambitions of humanity, which is united through communication and through ICTs, this has to be a reality.

And this leads us to really address small and large problems, issues and technical areas which we must be able to resolve with clarity and always to have a humanistic vision towards this. Today all of the countries we are facing different digital divides because we have to ensure connectivity where it still does not exist. Also we have to overcome the divides which means that this world is unequal. Unfortunately in this third millennium women are still left far behind.

Also the divides which separate our ethnic minorities in each country as well. This humanistic development is one which must be the guiding light to guide our efforts as regulators. I think that we all have to do this in order to address the challenges, with which we are faced and to ensure security to ICTs and to guarantee privacy and protection for minors and other basic aspects of Human Rights which we must be responsible for as regulators with other authorities as well.

There are issues which I think it really important to high lit which may not be the function of all regulators, but areas of competitiveness. What is the development of our telecommunications sector? What ICTs can be used in order to have growing competitiveness between the sector? As a regulator, we have absolute responsibility to ensure that regulation is the correct one. It can mean nothing less than what is needed. We have to be cautious as well. Because a badly managed regulation can lead to difficulties with development and curbing ICT development as well.

My vision for this, colleagues, is to work as a regulator through a humanistic prism in order to find this development for our people to act responsibly and with a technical expertise with

which it is required. Thank you very much.

>> MODERATOR: Your humanity shines through, Commissioner. So we turn to Romania. And it's a pleasure to hear from the President of the National Authority for Management and Regulation in communication, Mr. Sorin Grindeanu.

>> SORIN MIHAI GRINDEANU: Thank you very much. First off, allow me to say that I am honored to be an active part in this panel discussion on how ICTs can contribute to creating and enabling environment for implementation.

>> MODERATOR: Can I jump back in to give the audience the questions is? I forgot. What is Romania's experience in creating an enabling environment for the implementation of the SDGs? And second question, there is much talk of IG and how it will change our world. What is your view about how this emerging technology will contribute to the creation of an enabling environment?

>> SORIN MIHAI GRINDEANU: As you know, Romania holds rotating presidency of the Council of the European Union. One of our priorities is to first digitalization and connectivity in order to increase competitiveness of the European economy and industry. Our firm belief is that access to information and communication technologies is the solution for the development of disadvantaged communities.

Romania has its own very special experience in this area. We ranked fifth in the world by broadband Internet speed in 2018 and we have been in the top ten rankings in this field for many years now. But at the same time, we do have a problem with digital literacy and with the digital integration of the economy. Given the current situation in Romania, in terms of service availability and usage of the digital means, whenever we develop projects for taking decisions, we always consider the advantages we can bring to the rural disadvantaged areas where people do not have the same opportunities as in urban environments.

Giving people the chance to easily get informed to quality education or decent work alternatives empowers the population as a whole. From my point of view, that means to sustain an enabling environment where citizens have free access to means of information and communication without constraints. That is what we are trying to promote in Romania. The creation of a favorable premises that will encourage the industry innovations and will give equal chances to men and women wherever they live.

About 5G now, it is crucial for decision makers to ensure that the benefits of this new technology are made available to all. We must strive to make sure 5G is fit to use for the final goal of bridging social and economic gaps all over the world. Developing a global enabling environment in this hyperconnected world represents a challenge. For the authorities from every

country for achieving a sustainable and coherent development all stakeholders WSIS Action Lines in accordance with the United Nations 2030 Agenda.

We together with a dedicated group of professionals from Ministry of Communications and as important authorities in Romania have worked on issuing national strategy of the implementation of 5G technology. Because we value our users' opinions, we initiate market research at the end of the previous year targeting people of various ages asking what is their fear regarding the new technologies on the Internet of Things. As may be anticipated by some, their biggest fear was losing of personal data.

It is generally accepted for the implementation of the 5G technologies and the upcoming Internet of Things, the consolidation of the existing infrastructure is imperative along with the much higher volume of data and Internet speed there will be also greater risk that require more efficient measure to secure the networks. In the end, contributing to the well-being of the citizens overall is to assure them that they are protected and their personal information will be safe.

For this reason in our perception, enhancing security represents a pre-condition not only for adoption of 5G per se, but for the immanent increase of interoperability between states and security systems. Thank you very much.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you. Your stewardship of your countrymen and women is very appreciated. Now, onto Switzerland, and the Director General of the Federal Office of Communication OFCOM Mr. Philipp Metzger. Two questions for you. What kind of regulation is needed to create the best possible enabling environment for further digital development? And what specific cooperation methods and mechanisms must be developed to deal with the digital challenges?

>> Philipp Metzger: It's not the easiest question you are asking me. Probably only the future will tell us what the best environment was, regulatory environment for digital development, but maybe just to share a few experiences as how we are trying to approach it in Switzerland land, of course, also in an international context. The first point for us is to, you know, find orientation. That means to understand the substance at each time. I mean, the substance is many fold. It involves many new developments that are not necessarily always under the purview of a telecoms regulator, and so I think it's absolutely key that we understand what's behind the actual development in technical terms.

Another aspect which is key in the orientation phase, if you will, is to identify who the relevant stakeholders are, often they will approach you. Sometimes you will have to explore that

a bit yourself, but I think it's key that you can reach out and interact with the relevant stakeholders for any given subject matter.

And, of course, what matters as much is not only to know them, but also to know how they think, what their claims are, what their goals are, so that you can put this into a wider context. Obviously speaking here at the WSIS Forum we have to orientate ourselves internationally. It's not enough to do this at a national level because whatever we will do will have repercussions or interdependencies which isn't to say that we don't have ultimately some range of action also at the national level, but I think we have to orientate ourselves in the international context.

The second point which I believe is important is to understand the digital development as an opportunity to start with. I think we will have huge opportunities across the board for our citizens. That's also how many disempowered citizens see it themselves. So I think if you approach it with an open mind in terms of opportunity first, you will also be more open to innovation and allow innovation to go ahead. So if you put those things together that I just mentioned, I think you come, of course, to an approach where you don't want to regulate too early, and you don't want to regulate too much to start with.

Because you want to give leeway to developments which is not to say that we are not going to address the challenges, because I think an absolutely crucial aspect in the whole context is inclusivity. We can only succeed with digitization and with the digital development if we manage to convince all of the relevant stakeholders to go along, and that, of course, requires that we address their challenges because they won't be happy just to acknowledge opportunities, but not seeing the authorities dealing with their challenges that they have, and so, of course, in some cases, you will have to act and sometimes you will have to act in a rigorous way, in a mandatory way.

If I just take the example of drones in Switzerland, I think Switzerland is one of the leading countries in terms of drone enabling environment, but that involves also regulation to provide legal security and stability and so I think that's something that we have to bear in mind. And, of course, ultimately, and that brings me to the second question, we have to pay more attention going forward to cross-cutting issues.

I mean, the data issue is something we have in all different areas but often we are only addressing it in a silo so to say. I think that is a real challenge, so in reply to your second question, again, we need orientation when it comes to cooperation mechanisms to start with cross-cutting issues. We also need a multidisciplinary cooperation, more than we have today. We have

many fantastic organisation processes, stakeholder-driven initiatives, but they often operate in silos and I think we have to connect those.

We should also build on the existing mechanisms and institutions that we have and processes, but I think we need to find that more clearly. We have too often unclear responsibilities, unclear processes, and I think that's what stakeholders, even globally, are looking for to whom can they talk to? Where can they find solutions or help if there is an issue? And I think that, bringing that together will be a huge challenge. I'm hopeful that the high level panel on digital cooperation that the UN Secretary-General has launched last summer will hopefully pave the way forward in that regard so not only to say what should be done. I think we have many recommendations already of what should be done. But much more on how it should be done in the future, because I think that's where we have the biggest gap currently. Thank you very much.

>> MODERATOR: Wonderful! Now, I think what I'm hearing Switzerland and we talk about clock work. So I think you are talking about measurement and understanding how to be precise and measuring things in such a way that we can feedback, and all of us learn from all of our different examples. Thank you very much. We go to Bangladesh, the policy advisor Mr. Anir Chowdhury. Thank you. I will give you your two questions.

How is Bangladesh being prepared to embrace the fourth industrial revolution across the whole of your Government? The second question, how is innovation, culture and digital service being institutionalized in Government and what policy, program and service delivery approaches need to be taken?

>> ANIR CHOWDHURY: Thank you Madame moderator. Let me come with the perspective of Bangladesh, a poor country. Our biggest issue is actually poverty alleviation, high illiteracy, so improved education, access to healthcare and doesn't jobs. So these are the things we are trying to address to our regulatory environment to our enabling environment.

Beyond regulation I would like to talk about three things very quickly. One is incentives. Why should civil servants do something? Development of capacity, right capacity at the right level so that innovation flourishes, and unique partnerships across public and private sectors.

So with that in mind, I will mention very quickly five things. So we introduced the concept of empathy training in our civil service about five years ago, and trained about 5,000 civil servants and they have unleashed about 1500 innovation pilots across the board to improve service delivery across health, education, social services, law and order and many other things.

Second thing I will talk about Innovation Fund. The whole

of Government and whole of society fund that, again, incentivizes new thinking, break-through ideas to improve service delivery to mostly the rural areas. And since inception, we have received about 4,000 plus applications for the last six years and funded 240 projects. The kinds of innovation we have seen have come from addressing disability, addressing gender inequality, addressing digital divide in rural areas, creation of new types of devices using IoT and many other areas. The third is creation of technology platforms across the board.

So this is a whole of Government approach. Data interoperabilities have actually created standards, regulatory framework for data interoperability, platforms for that. We have created payment platforms so aggregation of payments because we used to have fragmentation of payments upon bank and service providers so that has been integrated and we are channeling social safety net programmes to digital platforms today.

We are also trying to create a single ID for all citizens we have fragmented digital IDs is cross the board. So that's a long term effort. We are in the middle of that now. Fourth is creation of one stop service centers across the board which are Internet enabled primarily in rural areas. This is enabling the bottom of the pyramid citizens to access digital services because they don't have the literacy or the digital literacy to access them directly. So we have created public-private partnerships where the services are sold by private sector entrepreneurs. This has created savings in terms of times, lost is and the number of visits.

The last eight years we have saved citizens about 1.2 person day is \$5 billion and 627 million visits eliminated because we introduced these Internet enabled centers in the rural areas.

And the last but not least, number five, is creation of formation incentives to digital service delivery within civil service framework. We are experimenting with this, how to create the right incentives. We are seeing early positive signs. Let me come to the first question. That's what I actually did with the first. So I wanted to give you the context of the creation of innovation culture within the Government.

What are we doing with the fourth industrial revolution how are we dealing with it? The case of Bangladesh is not unique but it's different from Developed Countries. So the fourth industrial revolution presents unprecedented opportunities but at the same time huge threats. So we are toying with Artificial Intelligence in many of our technology platforms that I talked about in payments, e-Commerce, in telemedicine, so on, so forth to address absenteeism of doctors and teachers so on, so forth, which has helped significantly.

On the flip side of it, automation and 14th industrial

revolution technologies introduces huge threats for our manufacturing sector. We have about 4 million women working in our garment sector which earns the biggest revenue in exports. 80% of our exports actually come. I will finish in 30 seconds. So when auto nation actually replaces these jobs, we are trying to figure out exactly how to reskill and upskill these women.

They are not literate or they are nearly literate so if they have to operate machines their education has to be taken up by several notches. So that's a challenge we are grappling with now. Maybe some actions will come from the panelists and maybe from the floor. Thank you.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you so much. It's impressive what's going on in Bangladesh. Really break through stuff. So we turn now to Mr. Pablo Bello, the Executive Director of ASIET.

The questions for you, convergence requires a continuous innovation both in equipment and services and technology market and regulatory integration. So in your opinion, what are the guiding principles for regulatory policy and institutional innovation that can enable a balanced development in the telecommunication sector?

And the second question, what are the challenges that have to be tackled in the region Latin America in terms of infrastructure development to overcome the gaps in both infrastructure and the associated investment.

>> PABLO BELLO: Thank you very much, Chair. I will speak in Spanish so if you want to use the translator, use it, please.

When I was a young boy in the 80s in Latin America we had what was called a lost decade. There were years of economic stagnation, poverty, inequality and violence. Then there was an economic growth which allowed us to reduce poverty and improve quality of lives and thereby to progress little by little towards development and the following 20 years Latin America grew significantly.

However, and this is a big however, what is fundamental to economic growth in Latin America such as another emerging economies in the last 20 years this was the geographic dividend and the high price of natural resources. This was the super cycle of the commodities. Now, this time has not come to an end. The price for export prices are not going to return to their previous levels and the population is growing older. What has happened in the last 20 years is that productivity in Latin America has not increased. It is practically the same today as what was seen in the 90s.

And if we are not able to resolve the structural problem in terms of productivity, we will not be able to grow, and if we don't grow, therefore, we will not improve the quality of lives of the people. There will still be poverty and we will run the

risk of having a new lost decade. Studies indicate that it is possible that in the next 15 years economic growth in Latin America will be 40 to 50% lower than economic growth in the last 15 years unless we can now address the infrastructural challenges faced with productivity. That is why digitization is important.

There can be no public policy more important than Latin America than that of digitization and transformation of productivity. And, therefore, it is absolutely critical to bridge the digital divide which is 45% of Latin America, almost half of Latin America is still not connected. We need a connectivity for the infrastructure which is first class. We have to, of course, make the structural and economic changes to our production across our economies.

So the challenge is really large. If we address these challenges with mobile income, about seven dollars a month we have to make significant investments in connectivity with about seven dollars a month which is return to the companies which is still higher, as Mr. Pepper mentioned earlier, there is a deceleration in terms of digital divide. This reflects the investment in digital infrastructure are not increasing, but in fact they are actually stagnating and indeed getting lower.

It is absolutely critical to really focus on and to reflect upon and to still talk about the challenges of digitization in order to try and address this challenge of the growth of networks in order to bridge the digital divide and to ensure we have first class infrastructures. The answers cannot be found in textbooks.

The phenomenon of convergence is something we should find in a new era. It's absolutely critical to have dialogue between all multistakeholders, which can be found upon four pillars in my view. These are critical in order to address the challenges that we have in front of us. The first of this is having confidence.

We have to be able to have a claim eight of trust to ensure that all stakeholders work hand in hand with a shared vision in order to achieve this ambitious agenda. The second pillar is flexibility. We have to ensure that we have structures which are flexible and agile which can move with the times and move with technology.

And the third is to innovate. Innovation and innovation and public policies and the regulatory sphere, innovation in how we do business, innovation in how we find answers to the shared challenges ahead, and the fourth but not least important is a sense of urgency in terms of leadership, political leadership and business leadership and social leadership to ensure that we can address the structural challenges ahead and if we don't do it, then we will lead it to a new lost decade. Thank you very much.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you. So passionate on behalf of the Latin American telecom operators. Thank you. So now we turn to

the business, we have now heard from business, most of our panelists were from the Government side. Our final speaker on the Spaniel is Crispin Conroy the representative Director and permanent observer to the UN. Your two questions what does enabling environment mean for business and what are the policy building blocks of an enabling environment?

>> Thank you very much. Short answer to the first question is an environment that allows and promotes private sector investment and innovation across the digital ecosystem with just a bit more detail. Connecting the unconnected is not just about access to mobile, Internet and new technologies. Meaningful connectivity requires access to services and relevant content available in local languages and the skills and capability to transform information into equitable knowledge.

The Broadband Commission estimates that connecting a further 1.5 billion people would require at least 450 billion U.S. dollars in high level infrastructure investment. On top of that further significant investment is needed in capacity building programmes that increase digital literacy and skills throughout the world. Governments alone cannot meet the investment needs and implementation challenges of expanding meaningful connectivity and with it e-Commerce capability.

The private sector has been and will be a pioneer and partner in bridging this gap. In order to continue and upscale business investment, it is important that policy makers understand the means by which the private sector makes investment decisions as well as how political and regulatory decisions impact the technical functioning of the infrastructure or specific service.

Enabling environment does not mean to us a euphemism of deregulation or relaxing of tax systems or consumer safeguard rules. The corporal missive in some parts of the world, the business return for building and operating networks or expanding services does not attract sufficient investment. Businesses might choose to invest elsewhere.

Ultimately an enabling environment is one that stimulates necessary investments in a way that results in a sustainable facility or service over a period of time. The digital ecosystem is based on layers that are interconnected and increasingly global. The functioning of the ecosystem relies on voluntary, mandatory and connection agreements between network infrastructure providers, developers and providers of ICT applications and services and also on initiatives for skilling, expanding the user's ability not just to understand and use technology, but in turn to create it.

Private sector investment in each of these different areas helps drive progress and innovation, both on the supply and

demand side. So the interconnect the nature of is that ecosystem means you cannot create enabling environment by considering just one of the layers. Also the global nature of the Internet means you cannot create enabling environment by only considering what is happening locally.

One must also consider the global environment. Finally, since the technology is changing so fast, it can be a daunting prospect for regulators. The private sector wants to be a partner to Governments, enabling, in enabling digital transformation of societies, bringing the power of ICTs to bear on a host of Government, business and citizen needs.

Relation to the second question, ICCS mission is to make business work for everyone, every day, everywhere, so we need a positive enabling environment. We represent 45 million companies, all sizes, all over the world, so we want them to work effectively. For the building blocks, therefore, for us would be first a stable legal and regulatory environment that welcomes new entrants and recognizing, recognizes ongoing development, one that values new forms of competition, access to stable financing sources and rates that will enable a sustainable return, and effective promotion of the common goals of digital transformation to education and skilling.

Secondly, open markets and free flow of data across borders. Digital innovations could be crippled without cross-border data flows. Fragmentation and increased fragmentation increased. Create market barriers for SMEs. There are compelling public policy issues such as privacy and security that be of course possible exemptions these strongly we recommend should be implemented in a manner that is non-discriminatory, not arbitrary and the least trade restrictive and not otherwise used as a disguised restriction on trade.

Thirdly, we would recommend a holistic whole of Government approach to policy making. And lastly, probably most importantly as many others have mentioned already, multistakeholder partnerships with close cooperation between business and other stakeholders to ensure that the policy settings meet the needs of all. Thank you.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you. So we have been speaking about the WSIS line of action of enabling environments, and 30UN agencies come together with all of us from the rest of the world. So I'm going to leave it to Mr. Kamal to give what can we do given what you have just heard? What is your next steps?

>> KAMAL BIN AHMED MOHAMMED: Thank you very much. I think it was really useful and interesting discussions but let me somehow express that the commonality what all speakers actually agreed during their statements in the last 50 minutes so it became really obvious, if it is not obvious before that

regulations should support the digital transformation process, that regulations should support the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals. This regulation should put in the centre citizen consumer.

In that regard definitely we should think about and we should apply the collaborative multistakeholder regulation and the process of adoption of those policies and the regulatory measures should be the result of the multistakeholder approach. So maybe it's also interesting to mention that in this regard it is not enough to have only pre-conditions fulfilled. It means connectivity, availability, affordability, digital literacy and digital skills, accessibility for all including different kinds of accessibility for different groups of population, like persons with disabilities, youth, girls and women, indigenous people, but also it is very important to provide trust and confidence in the use of ICT and new hot topic we have on the horizon it's data protection and privacy.

Everybody was talking about data protection and how we are going to deal with that. That's the question now, digital identity, how should we resolve this really hot topic these days? So I really liked that one of the speakers mentioned, I think it was the last one, yes, Chris, and he said you can provide everything, but if you don't have access to the relevant content, what does it mean.

So the relevant content means that we at the moment have a 60% of available content on the Internet in English. So 40% of content is not in English. Is it accessible to the rest of the world if we are talking about a 3.5 million people are not connected? How many percentage of that population can use content in English or vice versa? Maybe I can stop here since the lady warned me with the ringing bell.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you very much. I give the last five seconds to the lady from the EU.

>> Thank you very much I want to sincerely thank the ITU for the assistance they give to Zimbabwe. As you know, we were hit by the cyclone where a lot of people passed on, a lot of infrastructure was destroyed and as we speak now some people are still missing. I want to sincerely thank the ITU for the timely division if telecommunications infrastructure was destroyed and we got a lot of supported help from the ITU. May I also take this opportunity to sincerely thank all of those who rendered assistance to our country and Mozambique and Malawi as well. Thank you so much.

>> MODERATOR: Thank you. We want to say thank you to the interpreters who have done a wonderful job. Thank you.

(Applause).

And, of course, to the panelists who have done a wonderful

job. Thank you.
(Adjourned at 1637.)

This text, document, or file is based on live transcription. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART), captioning, and/or live transcription are provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings. This text, document, or file is not to be distributed or used in any way that may violate copyright law.
