



INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION

# ITU-T

TELECOMMUNICATION  
STANDARDIZATION SECTOR  
OF ITU

# A.5

(06/2000)

SERIES A: ORGANIZATION OF THE WORK OF THE  
ITU-T

---

## **Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations**

ITU-T Recommendation A.5

(Formerly CCITT Recommendation)

---



## **ITU-T RECOMMENDATION A.5**

### **GENERIC PROCEDURES FOR INCLUDING REFERENCES TO DOCUMENTS OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS IN ITU-T RECOMMENDATIONS**

#### **Summary**

This Recommendation provides generic procedures for referencing the documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations. Annexes A to F provide information specific to some organizations. Also included is the format for documenting a study group decision with respect to making the reference.

#### **Source**

ITU-T Recommendation A.5 was revised by ITU-T TSAG (1997-2000) and was approved under the WTSC Resolution No. 1 procedure on 14 June 2000.

## FOREWORD

ITU (International Telecommunication Union) is the United Nations Specialized Agency in the field of telecommunications. The ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector (ITU-T) is a permanent organ of the ITU. The ITU-T is responsible for studying technical, operating and tariff questions and issuing Recommendations on them with a view to standardizing telecommunications on a worldwide basis.

The World Telecommunication Standardization Conference (WTSC), which meets every four years, establishes the topics for study by the ITU-T Study Groups which, in their turn, produce Recommendations on these topics.

The approval of Recommendations by the Members of the ITU-T is covered by the procedure laid down in WTSC Resolution No. 1.

In some areas of information technology which fall within ITU-T's purview, the necessary standards are prepared on a collaborative basis with ISO and IEC.

## NOTE

In this Recommendation, the expression "Administration" is used for conciseness to indicate both a telecommunication administration and a recognized operating agency.

## INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS

The ITU draws attention to the possibility that the practice or implementation of this Recommendation may involve the use of a claimed Intellectual Property Right. The ITU takes no position concerning the evidence, validity or applicability of claimed Intellectual Property Rights, whether asserted by ITU members or others outside of the Recommendation development process.

As of the date of approval of this Recommendation, the ITU had not received notice of intellectual property, protected by patents, which may be required to implement this Recommendation. However, implementors are cautioned that this may not represent the latest information and are therefore strongly urged to consult the TSB patent database.

© ITU 2000

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and microfilm, without permission in writing from the ITU.

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
1 Scope.....	1
2 Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations .....	1
3 Qualification of referenced organization .....	3
Annex A – Referencing ISOC/IETF documents.....	3
Annex B – Referencing The ATM Forum documents.....	4
Annex C – Referencing Committee T1 documents .....	5
Annex D – Referencing TIA documents.....	6
Annex E – Referencing IEEE documents .....	6
Annex F – Referencing TTC documents .....	7
Appendix I – Format for documenting a Study Group decision.....	8



## Recommendation A.5

### GENERIC PROCEDURES FOR INCLUDING REFERENCES TO DOCUMENTS OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS IN ITU-T RECOMMENDATIONS

(Geneva, 2000)

#### 1 Scope

This Recommendation provides generic procedures for referencing the documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations. Clause 1 outlines the Scope, clauses 2 and 3 describe the procedures in detail. Annexes A through F each provide information specific to an organization. It is intended that future versions of this Recommendation will include further annexes containing information regarding additional organizations. Appendix I provides the format for documenting a study group decision with respect to making the reference.

NOTE – These generic procedures do not apply to references to standards produced by ISO and IEC. The long-standing ability to make such references continues unchanged.

#### 2 Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations

**2.1** A member of an ITU-T study group identifies the need to make a specific reference (either normative or non-normative) to a document from another organization (referred to as the "referenced organization") within a specific draft Recommendation. It is preferred that, rather than making reference to an entire document from an outside organization, reference be made to only the specific section(s) concerned.

Two types of reference are considered in this Recommendation:

- i) **Normative reference** – The whole, or parts of a document to which it is necessary to conform in order to claim compliance to the Recommendation containing the reference.
- ii) **Non-normative reference** – The whole, or parts of a document where the referenced document has been used as supplementary information in the preparation of the Recommendation or to assist the understanding or use of the Recommendation and to which conformance is not necessary.

NOTE – The term "document" refers to output (such as Standards, Recommendations, Specifications, Implementation Agreements, etc.) of other organizations (such as forums/consortia, standards development organizations, etc.).

The requirements of 2.2 and 2.3 do not apply for non-normative references since such referenced documents are not considered to be an integral part of an ITU-T Recommendation. They are documents that add to the reader's understanding but are not essential to the implementation of or compliance with the Recommendation.

**2.2** For normative references, the member submits a contribution to the study group providing information as outlined in 2.2.1 to 2.2.10.

The study group evaluates this information and decides whether to make the reference. The preferred format for documenting the study group decision is given in Appendix I.

Specific details for referencing ISOC/IETF documents are provided in Annex A, those for referencing The ATM Forum documents are contained in Annex B, those for referencing Committee T1 documents are in Annex C, those for referencing Telecommunications Industry Association (TIA) documents are in Annex D, those for referencing Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (IEEE) documents are in Annex E, and those referencing Telecommunication Technology Committee (TTC) documents are in Annex F. It is intended that future versions of this

Recommendation will include further annexes containing information regarding additional organizations.

**2.2.1** A clear description of the document considered for reference (type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).

**2.2.2** Status of approval. Referencing a document that has not yet been approved by the referenced organization can lead to confusion; thus normative referencing is usually limited to approved documents. If absolutely necessary, such a reference can be made where cooperative work requiring cross-references is being approved by the ITU-T and another organization in approximately the same time frame.

**2.2.3** Justification for the specific reference, including why it is inappropriate to incorporate the full text in the Recommendation.

**2.2.4** Current information, if any, about IPR issues (patents, copyrights, trademarks).

**2.2.5** Other information that might be useful in describing the "Quality" of the document (e.g. length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).

**2.2.6** The degree of stability or maturity of the document.

**2.2.7** Relationship with other existing or emerging documents.

**2.2.8** When a document is to be referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within the referenced document should also be listed.

**2.2.9** Qualification of referenced organization (per clause 3). This need only be done the first time a document from the referenced organization is being considered for referencing and only if such qualification information has not been documented already.

**2.2.10** A full copy of the existing document. No reformatting is necessary. The objective is to have referenced documents available via the Web at no cost so that the study group members may proceed with their evaluation. Accordingly, if a document to be referenced is available in this manner, it is sufficient for the contributing member to provide its exact location on the Web. On the other hand, if the document is not available in this manner, a full copy must be provided (in electronic format if permissible by the referenced organization, otherwise in paper format).

**2.3** For normative references only, the study group evaluates the above information and comes to its conclusions based on the usual consensus process. The decision of the study group shall be documented using the format in Appendix I. This requirement must be completed, at the latest, at the time the Recommendation is approved.

The study group report may simply note that the procedures of Recommendation A.5 have been satisfied and provide a pointer to the document where the full details reside.

**2.4** If the study group decides to make the reference, it should be introduced with the standard text provided in 2.9 of Appendix I/A.3 (1996). Additionally, a note shall be added stating: "NOTE – The reference to a document within this Recommendation does not give it, as a stand-alone document, the status of a Recommendation."

NOTE – In the case of texts produced jointly by ITU-T and ISO/IEC JTC 1, it is recognized that Recommendation A.23 applies [see 6.6 of Appendix II of Annex A/A.23 (1996)].

**2.5** If instead of referencing the study group decides to incorporate the text of another organization into the text of a Recommendation, then permission of that organization must be obtained. At the earliest possible moment, upon the request of the study group, TSB should request from the organization a written statement that it agrees to the incorporation of the specific text in ITU-T Recommendations. An applicable prior written statement may be used instead. Should the organization decline to provide such a statement, the incorporation shall not be made.



### 3 Qualification of referenced organization

To ensure the continued quality of the ITU-T Recommendations, not only is it necessary to evaluate the document being proposed for reference, it is also necessary to consider the referenced organization according to the criteria set out in 3.1, 3.2 and 3.3:

**3.1** The criteria used for qualifying organizations, as documented in items 1 to 6 of Annex A/A.4 or items 1 to 6 of Annex A/A.6, should be used. If the referenced organization has already been qualified according to Recommendations A.4 or A.6, the evaluation need not be repeated, and only a note of the result is required.

**3.2** In addition, the referenced organization should have a process by which its output documents are published and regularly maintained (i.e. reaffirmed, revised, withdrawn, etc.).

**3.3** The referenced organization should also have a document change control process, including a clear, unambiguous document numbering scheme. In particular, a feature to look for is that updated versions of a given document be distinguishable from the earlier versions.

## ANNEX A

### Referencing ISOC/IETF documents

The documents of the Internet Society (ISOC)/Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF) are referred to as RFCs (Requests For Comment). The information that should be included in the ITU-T member contribution, following the format in Appendix I, includes items 1-10 below:

- 1** A clear description of the RFC (standards document or not, title, number, version, date, etc.).
- 2** Status of approval.
- 3** Justification for the specific reference to the RFC.
- 4** Current information, if any, about IPR issues (some information may be available in the IETF IPR archives at <http://www.ietf.org/ipr.html>).
- 5/6** The degree of maturity and "Quality" of the RFC, i.e.:
  - i) For a standards document, whether it is:
    - **Best Current Practice**  
(defines procedures and operational issues; considered the recommended way to perform a certain function; not required to describe actual current practice).
    - **Proposed Standard**  
(generally stable and well-understood; real implementation desirable but not necessary; no known technical flaws; considered immature; may be changed if problems are found or better solutions are identified; deploying implementation of such standards into a disruption-sensitive environment is not recommended).
    - **Draft Standard**  
(at least two independent, interoperable implementations and sufficient successful operational experience exist; if IPR issues are known, then independent implementations must be based on at least two separate exercises of the licensing process; considered mature and final form of specification).
    - **Internet Standard**  
(significant implementation and successful operational experience has been obtained).

ii) For a non-standards document, whether it is:

- **Informational**; or
- **Experimental**.

7 Relationship of the RFC with other existing or emerging documents.

8 When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within the referenced document should also be listed.

9 Qualification of ISOC/IETF:

9.1-9.6 Decisions of ITU Council to admit ISOC to participate in the work of the Sector (June 1995 and June 1996).

9.7 The Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG) is responsible for ongoing maintenance of the RFCs when the need arises. Comments on RFCs and corresponding changes are accommodated through the existing standardization process.

9.8 Each revision of a given RFC has a different RFC number, so no confusion is possible. All RFCs always remain available on-line. An index of RFCs and their status may be found in the IETF archives at <http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc.html>.

10 Other: If the study group decides to make the reference to the RFC, the reference should always be made by RFC number (and not by other designations such as STD, BCP, etc.). References should not be made to documents referred to as "Internet Drafts" or RFCs categorized as "Historic". Normative references should not be made to RFCs that are not standards, for example, "Informational" and "Experimental" RFCs.

## ANNEX B

### Referencing The ATM Forum documents

The output documents of The ATM Forum are referred to as Implementation Agreements or, in some cases, as Specifications. The information that should be included in the ITU-T member contribution, following the format in Appendix I, includes items 1-9 below:

1 A clear description of The ATM Forum Specification or Implementation Agreement (identification number, date of approval, title).

2 Status of approval.

3 Justification for the specific reference, including a statement that "The ATM Forum prefers that its approved documents be referenced rather than reproduced within ITU-T Recommendations".

4 Current information, if any, about Intellectual Property Rights issues, including a statement that "An on-line identification of patent declarations is available at the following URL: [http://www.atmforum.com/specs/patent\\_decl.html](http://www.atmforum.com/specs/patent_decl.html)".

5/6 Only approved Implementation Agreements or Specifications of The ATM Forum should be referenced in published ITU-T Recommendations.

7 Relationship of The ATM Forum Implementation Agreement or Specification with other existing or emerging documents.

8 When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within the referenced document should also be listed.

9 Qualification of The ATM Forum:

9.1-9.6 Qualification decision was made by ITU-T in 1995 and is reflected in the Director's Action List.

- 9.7 The ATM Forum is responsible for ongoing maintenance of its Specifications and Implementation Agreements when the need arises. Comments on those documents, reflecting implementation experience, may be captured in Implementation Tip Sheets or in clearly identified new versions of the Specifications that are posted on the public web site of The ATM Forum. The procedures for withdrawal of Specifications are documented in the Membership Guidelines of The ATM Forum.
- 9.8 Each revision of a given Specification or Implementation Agreement has a different identification number, so no confusion is possible. All approved documents always remain available on-line. An index of the approved documents may be found on the public web site of The ATM Forum <http://www.atmforum.com/atmforum/specs/approved.html>.
- A "Spec Watch", providing the current work plan including status of draft documents, is maintained on-line also <http://www.atmforum.com/atmforum/specs/specwatch.html>.

## ANNEX C

### Referencing Committee T1 documents

The output documents of Committee T1 are referred to as American National Standards (ANSs), Technical Requirements (TRQs), or Technical Reports (TRs). The information that should be included in the ITU-T member contribution, following the format in Appendix I, includes items 1-10 below. A template is available at <http://www.t1.org/html/a5.htm>

- 1 A clear description of Committee T1 document (identification number, date of approval, title).
- 2 Status of approval.
- 3 Justification for the specific reference (including why incorporation of the full text in the Recommendation is inappropriate).
- 4 Current information, if any, about Intellectual Property Rights.
- 5 Other useful information describing the "quality" of the document (For example, the length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).
- 6 The degree of stability or maturity of the document; i.e. "Approved", since only approved documents are acceptable references.
- 7 Relationship of the Committee T1 document with other existing or emerging documents.
- 8 Nested references: When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within that referenced document should also be listed. Normally, copying the list of references from an electronic copy of the text is sufficient.
- 9 Qualification of Committee T1: Committee T1 and, on its behalf, its sponsoring organization, the Alliance for Telecommunications Industry Solutions (ATIS), were recognized under the provisions of ITU-T Recommendation A.5 on 1 November 1999. Qualifying information is on file in TSB.
- 10 Other (for any supplementary information).

## ANNEX D

### Referencing TIA documents

The output documents of the Telecommunications Industry Association (TIA) are referred to as American National Standards, Interim Standards (IS) or Telecommunications Systems Bulletins (TSBs). The information that should be included in the ITU-T member contribution, following the format in Appendix I, includes items 1-10 below:

- 1 A clear description of the TIA document (including identification number, date of approval, title).
- 2 Status of approval.
- 3 Justification for the specific reference (including why incorporation of the full text in the Recommendation is inappropriate).
- 4 Current information, if any, about Intellectual Property Rights. (TIA IPR information is available at: <http://www.tiaonline.org/standards/sfg/advisories/adv11c.cfm>).
- 5 Other useful information describing the "quality" of the document (e.g. the length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).
- 6 The degree of stability or maturity of the document; i.e. "Approved", since only approved documents are acceptable references.
- 7 Relationship of the TIA document(s) to other existing or emerging documents.
- 8 Nested references: When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all nested references within that referenced document should also be listed. Normally, copying the list of references from an electronic copy of the text is sufficient.
- 9 Qualification of the TIA: The TIA was recognized under the provisions of ITU-T Recommendation A.5 on 1 November 1999. Qualifying information is on file in TSB.
- 10 Other (for any supplementary information).

## ANNEX E

### Referencing IEEE documents

The output documents of the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (IEEE) are referred to as standards. Some of these standards are approved by ISO/IEC JTC 1 in which case they are joint IEEE and ISO/IEC JTC 1 Standards. Some of these standards are recognized by the American National Standards Institute in the United States as well as by appropriate processes in other countries. The information that should be included in the ITU-T member contribution, following the format in Appendix I, includes items 1-10 below:

- 1 A clear description of the IEEE document (identification number, date of approval, title).
- 2 Status of approval.
- 3 Justification for the specific reference (including why incorporation of the full text in the Recommendation is inappropriate).
- 4 Current information, if any, about Intellectual Property Rights.
- 5 Other useful information describing the "quality" of the document (e.g. length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).
- 6 The degree of stability or maturity of the documents; i.e. "Approved", since only approved documents are acceptable references.

- 7 Relationship of IEEE standards with other existing or emerging documents.
- 8 When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within the reference document should also be listed.
- 9 Qualification of the IEEE: The IEEE was recognized under the provisions of ITU-T Recommendation A.5 on 1 November 1999. Qualifying information is on file with TSB.
- 10 Other (for any supplementary information).

## ANNEX F

### Referencing TTC documents

The output documents of the Telecommunication Technology Committee (TTC) are referred to as TTC standards. The information that should be included in the ITU-T member contribution, following the format in Appendix I, includes 1-10 below:

- 1 A clear description of the TTC document (including identification number, date of approval, title).
- 2 Status of approval.
- 3 Justification for the specific reference (including why incorporation of the full text in the Recommendation is inappropriate).
- 4 Current information, if any, about Intellectual Property Rights (TTC IPR information is available at <http://www.ttc.or.jp/e/intro/rules/ru6/index.html>).
- 5 Other useful information describing the "quality" of the document (e.g. the length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).
- 6 The degree of stability or maturity of the document; i.e. "Approved", since only approved documents are acceptable references.
- 7 Relationship of the TTC document(s) to other existing or emerging documents.
- 8 Nested references: When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all nested references within that referenced document should also be listed. Normally, copying the list of references from an electronic copy of the text is sufficient.
- 9 Qualification of the TTC: TTC was recognized under the provisions of ITU-T Recommendations A.5 and A.6 on 29 November 1999. Qualifying information is on file in TSB.
- 10 Others (for any supplementary information).

## APPENDIX I

### Format for documenting a study group decision

The decision of the Study Group with respect to making the normative reference must be documented in the meeting record using the following format:

- 1 Clear description of the document.  
(type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).
- 2 Status of approval.
- 3 Justification for the specific reference:  
(including why incorporation of the full text in the Recommendation is inappropriate).
- 4 Current information, if any, about IPR issues:  
(including patents, copyrights, trademarks).
- 5 Other useful information describing the "Quality" of the document:  
(e.g. length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).
- 6 The degree of stability or maturity of the document.
- 7 Relationship with other existing or emerging documents.
- 8 When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within that referenced document should also be listed.
- 9 Qualification of referenced organization:  
(This need only be done the first time that a document from the referenced organization is being considered for referencing and only if such qualification information has not been documented already).
  - 9.1 Objectives.
  - 9.2 Organization: legal status and secretariat.
  - 9.3 Membership.
  - 9.4 Technical subject area.
  - 9.5 IPR Policy.
  - 9.6 Working methods/processes.
  - 9.7 Document publication and maintenance process.
  - 9.8 Document change control process.
- 10 Other (for any supplementary information).

## ITU-T RECOMMENDATIONS SERIES

<b>Series A</b>	<b>Organization of the work of the ITU-T</b>
Series B	Means of expression: definitions, symbols, classification
Series C	General telecommunication statistics
Series D	General tariff principles
Series E	Overall network operation, telephone service, service operation and human factors
Series F	Non-telephone telecommunication services
Series G	Transmission systems and media, digital systems and networks
Series H	Audiovisual and multimedia systems
Series I	Integrated services digital network
Series J	Transmission of television, sound programme and other multimedia signals
Series K	Protection against interference
Series L	Construction, installation and protection of cables and other elements of outside plant
Series M	TMN and network maintenance: international transmission systems, telephone circuits, telegraphy, facsimile and leased circuits
Series N	Maintenance: international sound programme and television transmission circuits
Series O	Specifications of measuring equipment
Series P	Telephone transmission quality, telephone installations, local line networks
Series Q	Switching and signalling
Series R	Telegraph transmission
Series S	Telegraph services terminal equipment
Series T	Terminals for telematic services
Series U	Telegraph switching
Series V	Data communication over the telephone network
Series X	Data networks and open system communications
Series Y	Global information infrastructure and Internet protocol aspects
Series Z	Languages and general software aspects for telecommunication systems